

1 **ARIZONA INDEPENDENT REDISTRICTING COMMISSION**

2

3

4

5

6 Saturday, July 30, 2011

7 1:15 p.m.

8

9 Location

10 Hon Dah Resort

11 Mt. Baldy Room, #777 Highway 260

12 Pinetop, Arizona 85935

13

14 Attending

15 Colleen C. Mathis, Chair

16 Scott Day Freeman, Vice Chair

17 Raymond F. Bladine, Executive Director

18 (Via Skype)

19 Kristina Gomez, Deputy Executive Director

20 Buck Forst, Information Technology Specialist

21 Joe Kanefield, Counsel, Ballard Spahr

22 **PREPARED BY:**

23 AZ Litigation Support, LLC

24 Michelle D. Elam, RPR

25 Certified Reporter

 CR No. 50637

Pinetop, Arizona
July 30, 2011
1:15 p.m.

1
2
3
4 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: This hearing of the
5 Arizona Independent Redistricting Commission will
6 now come to order.

7 Today is Saturday, July 30th, and the
8 time is about 1:15 p.m.

9 And if we could all begin by rising to
10 say the Pledge of Allegiance, that would be great.

11 Thank you.

12 (Pledge was recited.)

13 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: It's great to see so
14 many of you here today, and it's wonderful to be in
15 this alpine setting of Pinetop, Arizona, at the
16 Hon-Dah Resort.

17 I apologize for the delay in start. We
18 are trying to link in two remote locations. We've
19 got some folks in Holbrook as well as in Winslow,
20 and the hope is that we can take public input from
21 them as well. We weren't able to do that via video,
22 though, so we're going to try it via audio and
23 hopefully everyone will be able to hear, too.

24 So that's the reason for the delay, and I
25 appreciate everyone's patience.

1 Today the whole purpose of this is to
2 hear from all of you. We are really excited that
3 there's such a great turnout here and in the other
4 two locations.

5 We want to hear from you, what is
6 important to you about your communities of interest,
7 about anything about the redistricting process.

8 And so we encourage you to be sure to
9 fill out a request to speak form, which you probably
10 saw on the way in. I've got a number of them here.
11 And we'll be going through each one of those and
12 your input will be part of the public record.

13 We have a court reporter here today,
14 Michelle, who is taking everything down. And be
15 sure to -- when you come up to the microphone, state
16 your name and spell it so that we have an accurate
17 accounting, as well as state who you are
18 representing, or if it's just yourself, if you could
19 say where your -- you currently reside, either city,
20 town, or county, that would be great.

21 I would like to introduce some of the
22 people that are making this all happen today.

23 First and foremost is Vice Chair Freeman
24 here to my left, one of my fellow commissioners. We
25 have three other commissioners on this Commission

1 who are not here today. We are all taking turns
2 going to different parts of the state. We've got
3 about 15 or so public hearings that we are doing in
4 this first round and we are all taking turns going
5 to different parts of the state.

6 So today it's Scott and myself. I'm
7 Chairman Mathis. We also have with us legal counsel
8 today, Joe Kanefield. We have Mr. Willie Desmond
9 from Strategic Telemetry. Buck Forst is our chief
10 technology officer. You met maybe Kristina Gomez,
11 our Deputy Executive Director on your way in. Our
12 public information officer, Stu Robinson, is here.

13 We also have in Holbrook, I believe, our
14 Executive Director, Ray Bladine. He's manning the
15 fort there and we have a couple outreach
16 coordinators, Lisa and Kristi, and they are at the
17 other location.

18 No, I think -- I'm sorry, Mr. Bladine, I
19 think, is in Winslow and Kristi and Lisa are in
20 Holbrook.

21 So there's a full-court press. Everybody
22 is here to help. And so please talk to any one of
23 us to help you with any questions you have or speak
24 with us afterwards. We are happy to talk to you.

25 We also -- because of federal law, in

1 order to comply with it, we have with us a Spanish
2 translator today. Gursdan Diaz is here. Gursdan,
3 could you raise your hand?

4 Great. Wonderful.

5 And if you had any remarks in Spanish you
6 wanted to make at the podium, you're welcome to do
7 so to introduce yourself.

8 And then we also have a Navajo translator
9 today, Colin Tessler (sic). Is he here?

10 COLIN TESSIER: White Mountain Apache.

11 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Oh, White Mountain
12 Apache, I'm sorry, not Navajo.

13 Great. Thank you for confirming that
14 with us. Yes. And there is Colin.

15 And so if any translation services are
16 needed, we are happy to have either of these
17 gentlemen do that for us.

18 Let me see if I am covering everything I
19 need.

20 I believe that concludes all of the
21 introductory comments that I had, so we can go into
22 the next agenda item, which is a presentation by
23 Mr. Desmond on the redistricting process.

24 Oh, excuse me.

25 Okay. Before we do that, Willie, if we

1 could have the translators come up actually to the
2 podium and just speak in your native languages that
3 you are here to provide translational services
4 should they be required.

5 GURSDAN DIAZ: (Speaking in Spanish.)

6 COLIN TESSIER: (Speaking in Apache.)

7 In essence what I told all of you is we
8 are here to listen to these people here of
9 importance in our redistricting -- that's a
10 difficult one -- by the voter boundaries here in
11 state. And if anybody sees fit for me to translate
12 into Apache what was said here, I am here for that.
13 That is what I am here for.

14 Have a good day, and I'll be here.

15 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you very much
16 Mr. Tessier and Mr. Diaz.

17 With that --

18 COLIN TESSIER: My last name is Tessier.
19 I don't know how it came up with a French name, but
20 that's --

21 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Oh, it's Tessier.

22 Thank you very much.

23 So we'll move on to that next agenda
24 item, which is Mr. Desmond, who will give us a
25 presentation on the redistricting process.

1 WILLIE DESMOND: All right. Thank you
2 all for being here today on your Saturday afternoon
3 and allowing us the opportunity to hear your
4 thoughts and concerns as we begin this redistricting
5 process.

6 Again, my name is Willie Desmond. I work
7 with Strategic Telemetry. We are the firm hired to
8 provide technical assistance to the Commission as it
9 does the redistricting.

10 Today I'll be giving you a short
11 presentation on the -- what exactly redistricting
12 is, the Commission, and the process here in Arizona.

13 So with that, I'll begin.

14 There are seven things we will be talking
15 about today. The first is why do we have a
16 Redistricting Commission? The next is what is
17 redistricting? The differences between
18 reapportionment and redistricting. Why do we have
19 to redistrict? What guidelines need to be followed
20 when drawing new district lines? What are the steps
21 in the redistricting process? And how can public
22 input be submitted to the AIRC?

23 All right. To start, why do we have a
24 Redistricting Commission?

25 Well, this is the second time that

1 Arizona's Congressional and Legislative district
2 lines are going to be drawn by the Arizona
3 Independent Redistricting Commission.

4 The Commission was created in 2000 when
5 the voters of Arizona passed Proposition 106 which
6 created the Commission and established a set of
7 guidelines and criteria to be used when drawing new
8 district lines.

9 The Commission is made up of two
10 Democrats, two Republicans, and an Independent chair
11 who is elected by the other commissioners. That
12 chair, the fifth member, shall not be registered
13 with any party already represented on the
14 Commission.

15 In 2011, the AIRC members are Vice
16 Chairman Scott Freeman, who is here today; Vice
17 Chairman Jose Herrera, who I'm sure is watching at
18 home; Chairwoman Colleen Mathis, who is also here
19 today; and Commissioners Linda McNulty and Richard
20 Stertz, who are probably also watching along with
21 Vice Chairman Herrera.

22 All right. What is redistricting?
23 Simply put, redistricting is the process of
24 redrawing Congressional and Legislative district
25 lines.

1 What is the difference between
2 redistricting and reapportionment?

3 The two terms, often used together, have
4 slightly different meanings. Technically,
5 reapportionment is the process of allocating
6 Congressional districts among the states based off
7 of changes in population.

8 Because of Arizona's population growth
9 over the last decade, it was allocated an additional
10 Congressional district following the 2010 census.

11 In 2012, the voters of Arizona will elect
12 nine Congressmen to represent the State in
13 Washington, D.C. This past decade they had elected
14 eight.

15 And, again, redistricting is the process
16 of drawing the new lines that need to be established
17 to add that ninth district in.

18 Why do we have to redistrict? Well,
19 because Arizona gained this ninth Congressional
20 district, new lines would have to be draw to add it
21 in. However, even if Arizona had not gained a
22 district, Congressional and Legislative district
23 lines would have to be redrawn to account for
24 changes in population.

25 The concept of one person, one vote

1 dictates that there should be as close to the same
2 number of people per district as possible.

3 And again, because population growth is
4 different in different areas of the state, the
5 districts, as they are currently comprised, no
6 longer have equal population. Some have much higher
7 and some have lower.

8 All right. What guidelines need to be
9 followed when the -- by the Arizona Independent
10 Redistricting Commission when drawing these new
11 lines?

12 First, they must comply with the U.S.
13 Constitution and the Voting Rights Act.

14 Next, they must have equal population.
15 These first two criteria are federally mandated and
16 all plans must satisfy these two criteria.

17 The districts must be compact and
18 contiguous. They must respect communities of
19 interest. They must use visible geographic features
20 such as cities, towns, and county boundaries, and
21 undecided census tracts.

22 And lastly they must create competitive
23 districts so there is no detriment to the other
24 goals.

25 All right. The Arizona redistricting

1 process.

2 The first step in this process is these
3 public meetings, to gain the input -- or to learn
4 the public's opinion about what they want in the
5 redistricting process.

6 I believe this is the 8th of 17
7 first-round meetings. I should say that there will
8 be another round of meetings once the draft -- the
9 first draft map has been completed and a 30-day
10 public review period has been -- has gone by.

11 If you are watching this at home, I
12 encourage you to try to come to one of the future
13 meetings or submit your input some way to the
14 Commission.

15 After the public input is gathered, we
16 will start with the grid map. In some states, the
17 previous plans are not -- are used as the
18 starting-off point. However, in Arizona, the
19 previous plans have to be disregarded and we must
20 start with a grid map, per Proposition 106.

21 The commencement of the mapping process
22 for both the Congressional and Legislative districts
23 shall be the creation of an equal population in a
24 grid-like pattern across the state.

25 The best way to think of a grid map is if

1 it was a perfectly even population distribution, it
2 would look like a tic-tac-toe board over Arizona
3 with nine districts. However, they will be adjusted
4 to have equal population in all of the districts,
5 but it's the most kind of grid-like map that can be
6 drawn. It's likely that this grid map will only
7 meet the first two criteria -- or two of the
8 criteria, which are equal population and compact and
9 contiguous districts.

10 Following the completion of the grid map,
11 it is adjusted to meet the other criteria, the first
12 of which is the Voting Rights Act.

13 Arizona's Congressional and Legislative
14 districts must receive preclearance or approval from
15 the Department of Justice or a federal court under
16 Section 5 of the Voting Rights Act before they can
17 take effect. To get preclearance, Arizona must
18 demonstrate that the new districts do not
19 discriminate against minority voters in purpose or
20 effect, which means there can be no intentional or
21 accidental discrimination.

22 Also, under Section 5, Arizona's
23 redistricting plans cannot be retrogressive. The
24 plans cannot weaken or reduce minority voters'
25 right.

1 Finally, the presence of discrimination
2 can be determined by analyzing population data and
3 election results.

4 Following adjustments to meet the Voting
5 Rights Act, the map is adjusted again to ensure
6 equal population, compact and contiguous districts,
7 and respect for communities of interest.

8 One of the major goals of these first
9 round of public hearings is to solicit the public's
10 opinion on communities of interest they feel should
11 be taken into account.

12 There are forms available here. If you
13 are here today and you feel like speaking, please
14 fill out one of the yellow forms and you will be
15 called on to come up to the mike and share your
16 thoughts with the Commission.

17 If you are here and you don't feel
18 comfortable speaking today but you would still like
19 the Commission to know your thoughts, please fill
20 out a blue form and turn it in. Both of these will
21 be added on to the record and considered by the
22 Commission. It's just whatever preference you have.

23 Finally, the map is, again, adjusted to
24 use visible geographic features, which are city
25 boundary -- or county boundaries, cities and towns,

1 and census tracts. We're lucky that the census
2 geography typically follows these visible geographic
3 features.

4 And, again, the map is finally adjusted
5 to create competitive districts where there is
6 significant detriment to other goals.

7 Okay. How can you submit your input to
8 the Arizona Independent Redistricting Commission?

9 Well, first of all, you can attend a
10 meeting and fill out one of the yellow or blue
11 forms. Possible things that you may want to speak
12 on are the criteria being considered by the
13 Commission, communities of interest that you feel
14 need to be considered or anything else about the
15 redistricting process that you would like to have
16 your voice heard on.

17 You can also go online and submit it via
18 our website or call the office. If you would like
19 to visit us online, the website is
20 www.azredistricting.org or you can call
21 602-542-5221.

22 I should also add that if you are
23 interested in turning in maps you've drawn or if
24 you've written out criteria for different boundaries
25 you would like considered, you can submit any sort

1 of documentation to the Commission. We do ask that
2 if you are comfortable, if you would please put your
3 name and contact information on those materials so
4 that we can reach out to you should we have any
5 questions about exactly what criteria you are trying
6 to lay out.

7 And with that, I think the presentation
8 is over.

9 So, again, thank you very much for having
10 us today and we very much look forward to hearing
11 your input.

12 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you,
13 Mr. Desmond.

14 That takes us to the next item on the
15 agenda, which is the public comment period.

16 I apologize in advance for any technical
17 difficulties we may encounter and ask everyone to
18 bear with us as we try to bring in these remote
19 locations.

20 It's my understanding we have one person
21 who has requested to speak in Holbrook. And we
22 thought we would go ahead and bring that person in
23 and see if that works and then we will take turns
24 going between Pinetop and Winslow, depending on how
25 many speakers are in Winslow. Maybe every four

1 speakers or so we'll switch back between sites.

2 WILLIE DESMOND: Lisa, we're ready.

3 LISA SCHMELLING: Okay. Here you go.

4 This is Phillip Cobb.

5 PHILLIP COBB: Hello. Good afternoon.

6 How are you doing?

7 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: The court reporter

8 can't hear you.

9 WILLIE DESMOND: Can you speak up a
10 little bit, please?

11 PHILLIP COBB: Can you hear me?

12 WILLIE DESMOND: Yes. Much better.

13 PHILLIP COBB: Okay. My name is Phillip
14 Cobb, Phillip, and it's C-o-b-b, is my last name.

15 I am representing myself. I'm from
16 Holbrook, Arizona, Navajo County.

17 And what I would like to comment on is as
18 a former candidate for Arizona State Senate District
19 5, I have needless to say noticed how vast our state
20 is and how vast our districts are encompassing
21 hundreds and hundreds of square miles.

22 I think what we are finding here is that
23 rural Arizona has such vast districts that both the
24 population as well as candidates have extreme
25 difficulty just communicating with one another.

1 I also noticed as I continued my campaign
2 back in the '06 cycle, that cities were encompassed
3 with rural areas that did not seem to balance the
4 population of the rural versus urban area.

5 Example being the Hopi reservation being
6 encompassed with Flagstaff. It makes it seem that
7 it's a more difficult chore for the Hopis to get any
8 representation when a city like Flagstaff with a
9 large population seems to be able to dictate,
10 unfortunately, what rural areas have to deal with.
11 This is also -- Flagstaff is just an example. One
12 could look at Payson, one could look at Show
13 Low/Pinetop, any more of the more developed
14 communities versus those of us who are out on the
15 edges, shall we say. I use Holbrook as an example.
16 There are even smaller communities within the
17 context of this district that have difficulty
18 getting representation.

19 My attitude is simple. I would like to
20 see as we go along with this redistricting that
21 there is a more fair and balanced circumstance with
22 both our Native American population, our Hispanic
23 population, as well as Anglos, white people, have
24 good representation at this stage.

25 These are things that have been a problem

1 for many a year. And we would hope this
2 redistricting might buy up more fair and balanced
3 circumstance.

4 I can see up here, for example, districts
5 as large as District 5 being broken up into one,
6 two, three other districts might encompass different
7 areas.

8 Needless to say, I have seen several maps
9 already and some seem a lot fairer than what I had
10 to go through in the '06 cycle.

11 I would like to end right on that and not
12 take up too much more time here.

13 I hope that you will consider the rural
14 areas and have the redistricting, if it's going to
15 be done, be and in a more equitable -- produced in a
16 more equitable fashion.

17 And I thank you very much.

18 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

19 I don't know how many speakers we have in
20 Holbrook -- I mean, Winslow, so I'll be asking
21 Mr. Bladine to get those folks ready, but I thought
22 I would jump here to Pinetop and let's take the
23 first four. And I'll go ahead and name them so you
24 can all be getting ready to speak.

25 Virginia Dotson, Janice Hernandez,

1 Kenneth Smith, Joel Weeks. So those are our first
2 four here in Pinetop. And if we could start with
3 Virginia Dotson.

4 And if any of you are elected officials
5 or representatives, please introduce yourself. And
6 I apologize for not knowing myself.

7 VIRGINIA DOTSON: My name is Virginia
8 Dotson. I'm from Vernon, Arizona, in Apache County.

9 I would like to see two Congressional
10 districts for rural Arizona. One for the east and
11 one in the west.

12 Rural Arizonans need better
13 representation of our interests than we've had in
14 the past. Our voices are not heard when we share
15 our districts with large parts of urban counties.
16 We have the same issues with Legislative districts.

17 I would like to see eight out of
18 Arizona's 30 districts be predominantly rural.

19 When the Arizona Legislature votes to
20 slash public school budgets, it impacts urban
21 districts differently than rural because we are all
22 spread out and many students have special needs.

23 Competitiveness within the district is
24 important so that we can change leadership from time
25 to time rather than having one group of interest

1 always dominate.

2 And last, I would like to thank the
3 Redistricting Commission for their efforts to carry
4 out their mandate as fairly as possible.

5 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Excuse me, before
6 you depart, do you mind spelling your name for the
7 record?

8 VIRGINIA DOTSON: My last name is
9 D-o-t-s-o-n.

10 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you. I
11 appreciate it.

12 Our next speaker is Janice Hernandez,
13 representing self from Navajo County.

14 JANICE HERNANDEZ: Hello, my name is
15 Janice Hernandez and I live in Show Low.

16 It seems that the rural districts have
17 been well-represented already, but I, too, would
18 like to plead for more representation in the rural
19 districts. I've lived in the city, I've lived in
20 the country, and I know the needs and comforts of
21 both are very different.

22 In our case, for instance, we have longer
23 bus routes for children to get to school. But in my
24 own mind, the most important thing is forest
25 protection. We have all seen evidence recently of

1 how badly we need our forest protected. It gives us
2 a certain kind of tourism that's very different from
3 the cities. And it adds to our lifestyle, for the
4 people who live here. I live in Show Low.

5 Thanks.

6 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you very much.

7 I think if you'll bear with us, we are
8 trying to bring in Winslow. So we'll hold off.

9 RAY BLADINE: Can you hear us?

10 WILLIE DESMOND: Yes, we do.

11 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: So we'll jump to
12 Winslow.

13 Is that Mr. Bladine?

14 LOUIS GILL: My name is Louis Gill.

15 L-o-u-i-s, G-i-l-l.

16 I am a 60-year resident of the state of
17 Arizona. The last 50 years of which have been in
18 Navajo County. And I would like to thank you for
19 your effort in trying to get representation to the
20 residents of the state of Arizona instead of having
21 it all concentrated in Maricopa County.

22 Some people that I have had conversations
23 (inaudible) --

24 (Interruption by the court reporter.)

25 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Excuse me,

1 Mr. Gill --

2 LOUIS GILL: -- we are all enthusiastic
3 that we're finally going to have an opportunity to
4 be represented in the State Legislature
5 (inaudible) --

6 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Mr. Gill --

7 PHILLIP COBB: We would very much like to
8 be included in one of the greater Arizona
9 Legislative districts --

10 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Mr. Bladine?

11 PHILLIP COBB: Once again, thank you for
12 your consideration in these matters.

13 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Mr. Gill, I think we
14 are going to need a repeat of your testimony.

15 LOUIS GILL: My name is Louis Gill,
16 L-o-u-i-s, G-i-l-l. I came to Arizona in 1948. I
17 am a 60-year resident of the state, the last 50
18 years or so in the Winslow area. For the past 30
19 years or so, I feel like our area has not been
20 treated anywhere (inaudible). We are very, very
21 excited at the possibility that we might be able to
22 be included in one of the greater Arizona
23 Congressional districts.

24 And once again, I would like to thank you
25 for your efforts on my behalf. Hopefully this all

1 goes well for everybody.

2 Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you, Mr. Gill.

4 And thanks to our court reporter, who has amazing
5 ears.

6 Is there another speaker?

7 WILLIE DESMOND: Go ahead.

8 RAY BLADINE: We have another speaker
9 coming up. I'll let her introduce herself.

10 SUSAN LAWLER: My name is Susan Lawler,
11 I'm from Winslow. S-u-s-a-n, L-a-w-l-e-r.

12 (Interruption by the court reporter.)

13 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: We are not getting
14 that. I'm sorry. Excuse me.

15 We're going to jump back here to Pinetop,
16 Arizona, and see if we can figure out a better way
17 to get the testimony from Winslow.

18 Our next speaker is Kenneth Smith, from
19 Navajo County.

20 KENNETH SMITH: As you said, my name is
21 Kenneth Smith, and to help you with the spelling of
22 that, it's S-m-i-t-h.

23 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: We can't hear him.

24 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: The public can't
25 hear.

1 COMMISSIONER FREEMAN: Speak right into
2 the microphone.

3 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Yeah, speak right
4 directly into it.

5 KENNETH SMITH: Is that better?

6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes.

7 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Yes.

8 KENNETH SMITH: Okay. I strongly support
9 having two rural districts in Arizona and eight
10 Legislative districts as well.

11 As a region, Arizona -- eastern Arizona
12 has common socio, economic and -- interests such as
13 forestry, ranching, mining, and tourism. You might
14 think that Maricopa County and Pima County both have
15 a great deal of interest in tourism, as they do, but
16 first, it's a very different kind of tourism. And
17 secondly, they are not nearly as dependent upon it.

18 Try to imagine you were here on the White
19 Mountain Apache reservation. Try to imagine this
20 place without any tourism industry going. Try to
21 imagine Pinetop, try to imagine Flagstaff, try to
22 imagine Sedona. And losing tourism there would be
23 totally destructive whereas it would merely hurt in
24 other places.

25 Further, no matter how sympathetic

1 representatives may be who come from urban areas,
2 they really don't know the territory and don't know
3 intimately what the concerns are.

4 They may not -- they may not feel that
5 they need to represent them anyway, but even if they
6 do, they really don't know the concerns about forest
7 fires, which are interesting news on the TV
8 channels, if you're in an urban area, which are
9 matters of total disaster in an area such as this.

10 Further -- and one concern is that split
11 urban and rural districts tend more and more, of
12 course, to become urban districts, with the urban
13 district actually dominating, and, therefore, not
14 representing the rural districts very well.

15 As you are trying to balance
16 competitiveness, communities of interest, and other
17 concerns and need to have sufficient numbers for a
18 district, I hope that you will keep in mind if it
19 becomes necessary, and I hope it won't, but if it
20 becomes necessary in order to form an eastern
21 Arizona district, for instance, to move in to an
22 area of -- that is more urban just because you have
23 to have it in order to get the numbers, then
24 consider that there are obvious ways of doing that
25 which are not necessarily productive, at least for

1 our purposes.

2 As a specific example, and this is only
3 an example. This specific example -- I used to live
4 in Saddlebrooke, if you know that place north of
5 Tucson but in Pinal County.

6 Saddlebrooke's average -- or typical lot
7 size is one-eighth of an acre. That's not counting
8 the condos that they have there. But if they
9 actually have a lot. Why, it typically is an eighth
10 of an acre and it is entirely a retirement community
11 with very large numbers.

12 A simple way of drawing a map, if you
13 needed some more numbers, needed several thousand
14 more people, would be merely to draw -- draw a line
15 across southern Pinal County, the county line.

16 That's an obvious kind of thing to do.
17 But if you know the territory there, then you know
18 that just south of there, but still contiguous, but
19 just south of there you have the community of
20 Catalina, for instance.

21 The community of Catalina is actually
22 quite rural, in large degree, with small ranches and
23 horses and bad roads and other kinds of things that
24 you might think that you would find in a rural area.

25 So that's just an example, and you may

1 not -- that particular example may not come into
2 play at all, I don't know. But I think it makes a
3 good example of something that would be an obvious
4 kind of thing to do. It might not be a good thing
5 to do, at least from our perspective.

6 I don't envy you at all your effort to
7 draw a map that balances all of these interests, and
8 when you get through, I may not like what it is that
9 you have done. But nonetheless, I want to thank you
10 for your willingness and your effort to put up with
11 a thankless, hardworking kind of a job. I know a
12 little of how complex it is, how difficult it is,
13 and something of how thankless it is, having been a
14 former president of a school board.

15 It's -- what you are doing is really
16 important to the State, as I'm sure you know. And
17 despite what goes on, I ask you to hang in there and
18 stay the course.

19 Thank you very much.

20 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

21 KENNETH SMITH: I have -- I have all of
22 that essentially written out and would be pleased to
23 have you make it a matter of record, if you would
24 like.

25 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: That would be great.

1 Please give that to our public information officer,
2 if you would, and he'll ensure that Kristina Gomez
3 receives it.

4 Thank you.

5 Okay. We are going to make one more
6 attempt to pull in Winslow here via Skype. And
7 let's hear who our next speaker is.

8 BILL SHUMWAY: Hi. My name is Bill
9 Shumway, S-h-u-m-w-a-y. Born and raised in Winslow,
10 Arizona. I've spent the last 68 years here.

11 And the first thing I would like to do is
12 take the time to tell the Commission how much I
13 appreciate their work. This whole process, through
14 the voter initiative, is that I think is our first
15 opportunity to keep things more fair and balanced.

16 As far as the way I would like to have
17 things go with the redistricting is that I would
18 like to see it more rural and the old idea of using
19 spokes from the more the populated communities, I
20 think it puts us at a disadvantage. I would like to
21 see it where we can be completely rural.

22 I was a candidate last time and I
23 participated in a Legislative district that was
24 18,000 square miles and it took me close to seven
25 hours to drive from one end to the other. And I

1 know that that's going to give you some unique
2 problems. But if we can shift the population basis
3 around to make it a little more compact is one of
4 the things done, I have concern with, and to keep
5 within the Voting Rights Act and with the population
6 base, that would sure change things around a little
7 bit.

8 And what we are asking for is the
9 opportunity to have balance. Right now it seems to
10 be one-sided.

11 And once again, I would like to thank the
12 Commission and the voters of the state of Arizona
13 for allowing us this chance to be more fair and
14 balanced.

15 Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

17 Was there another Winslow speaker or are
18 we going to --

19 BUCK FORST: Yeah, one more.

20 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Oh, there's one
21 more.

22 MARIANNE RICHARDSON: Hi, my name is
23 Marianne Richardson. It's M-a-r-i-a-n-n-e,
24 Richardson, R-i-c-h-a-r-d-s-o-n, and I am from
25 Winslow, Arizona. I'm a teacher at Northland

1 Pioneer College. I have just finished up a semester
2 on the video system there. Northland Pioneer
3 College serves 21,000 square miles.

4 And as part of my work with Northland
5 Pioneer, I spent three years attending sessions of
6 the Professional Development Leadership Academy
7 sponsored by the Arizona Department of Education.

8 My colleagues are PLA Community College
9 teams from the metro areas as well as teachers in
10 both the rural and public schools. This experience
11 made clear to me the need for more appropriate
12 representation.

13 I support the creation of a regular
14 Arizona district for rural eastern Arizona.

15 Working for Northland Pioneer, I taught
16 classes on the video system. I guess I already said
17 that. And I learned that eastern Arizona shares
18 similarities in economic reliance on farming,
19 ranching, tourism, and the railroad. We are very
20 closely connected to the interest of the tribal
21 communities.

22 The Winslow/Holbrook/Joseph City area
23 that I call home has far different needs and
24 concerns than those of metro areas. The needs
25 include roads, health care and education. The mean

1 incomes of our local residents, the educational
2 needs, and the health needs differ from those in the
3 Valley. Lack of transportation, good roads, and
4 communication by phone and Internet are major
5 problems that have impacted our local community, and
6 perhaps this meeting today.

7 My experience with teachers from the
8 community colleges in the metro areas who
9 participated in PLA has clarified these differences.

10 Urban communities do not understand the
11 effects of distance, climate, and the lack of job
12 opportunities that trouble those of us seeking a
13 rural eastern greater Arizona district.

14 And I do realize how tremendously
15 difficult the task is of creating these balanced
16 districts.

17 And I thank all of you who have dedicated
18 so much of your time.

19 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

20 Now I would like to take it back to
21 Pinetop, if we could.

22 We will come back to Winslow in just a
23 few speakers, but I would like to give some folks in
24 Pinetop the opportunity now.

25 We'll take the next four from Pinetop. I

1 had mentioned Joel Weeks, I believe, is the next
2 speaker. After that, just so you are getting ready,
3 Barbara Smith, Brad Carlyon, Holly Hanson. So you
4 guys are on deck.

5 So right now Joel Weeks, deputy city
6 manager, City of Show Low.

7 JOEL WEEKS: Thank you. Good to be with
8 you. We appreciate your efforts to come up here and
9 do this today.

10 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Can't hear you.

11 JOEL WEEKS: Is it on? I'll try to eat
12 it as I speak.

13 A couple of thoughts. The City of Show
14 Low is aware that there are two basic proposals that
15 have been presented. One of them basically keeps
16 Legislative District number 5 as it is now, and we
17 think that's a good fit. It ought to continue with
18 the addition of the Verde Valley area, and we think
19 that is acceptable.

20 The second proposal is one that we
21 understand is being proposed by the City of
22 Flagstaff.

23 We enjoy our productive relationships
24 with all of Navajo County and many of the
25 communities in Apache County like St. Johns, Eagar,

1 and Springerville and also the White Mountain Apache
2 tribe. This proposal would put us in a different
3 Legislative district.

4 We have similar concerns with these
5 groups that I have mentioned and we don't think we
6 share many of those same concerns with the Flagstaff
7 area and we don't really believe that Flagstaff
8 truly represents rural Arizona.

9 And those are our thoughts. I have a
10 letter from our mayor who had hoped to be here today
11 but has had a camping trip planned previously and
12 wasn't able to make it.

13 I would also like to thank your
14 Commission for your efforts regarding this critical
15 issue.

16 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you very much.

17 If you could submit that. Willie can
18 take it and will give it --

19 Thank you.

20 Our next speaker is Barbara Smith,
21 representing self from Navajo County.

22 BARBARA SMITH: Hi, I'm Barbara Smith,
23 S-m-i-t-h, in case you thought it might have a Y.

24 I would like to speak on behalf of two
25 Congressional rural districts out of the nine. And

1 I would also like to have --

2 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I can't hear her.

3 COMMISSIONER FREEMAN: You've got to go
4 right under the microphone.

5 BARBARA SMITH: I have to get closer.

6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Hold it, perhaps.

7 BARBARA SMITH: Well, it would probably
8 rattle the --

9 I'm Barbara Smith, and I would like to
10 speak on behalf of having two rural Congressional
11 districts and eight rural Legislative districts
12 because our district is so different from any of the
13 metropolitan or urban districts.

14 Other people have said why, but I would
15 like to mention even though we have tribals --
16 groups all over the state, and some of them are in
17 the metropolitan areas -- the tribal differences are
18 completely different between urban and rural.

19 In Apache -- the White Mountain Apache,
20 there's 40 percent unemployment. That's a lot. And
21 there may be just as much in the urban setting, but
22 I don't think so because there are more
23 possibilities for employment.

24 Our tourism, as it's been mentioned
25 before, is also different. We have individuals

1 instead of conventions. And if our tribal districts
2 are different and our tourism is different, our
3 forests are also different. I haven't seen any
4 forests in Pima County in the urban areas, or in
5 Maricopa County in the urban areas.

6 I've lived in Arizona for over 35 years
7 and in the White Mountains for almost 10, and I can
8 say that in Pima County, things are very different
9 compared to what they are here. And those kinds of
10 things need to be kept in mind when you are creating
11 a new district or a new Legislative district or
12 Congressional.

13 And finally, I would like to thank you
14 for your hard work. I know it's been difficult and
15 I don't envy you either. I think it would be very
16 hard to listen to all of us and keep a fair and
17 balanced idea in your head and I can't imagine
18 having to draw the maps. I think that would be
19 impossible.

20 And so thank you to your organization as
21 well for aiding in that purpose.

22 Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

24 Our next speaker is Brad Carlyon, Navajo
25 County attorney, representing self.

1 BRAD CARLYON: Thank you for letting me
2 speak.

3 I used to think serving on a school board
4 was the most thankless public job, but now I know
5 different from all of the grief that you have been
6 getting.

7 I think you hear a common theme here
8 today, and that is to protect the rural counties,
9 the rural lifestyle.

10 You have heard many of the reasons why,
11 and I can actually talk from experience.

12 Back in the mid-'80s, I worked for a U.S.
13 Congressman here in Arizona, Eldon Rudd. His
14 district went from the northeast part of Maricopa
15 County, Scottsdale, Fountain Hills, Cave Creek,
16 Carefree, and included Navajo County, Apache County,
17 Gila County, Graham County. He never came up here.
18 His base for both money and for votes was the urban
19 area and the rural counties suffered because of
20 that.

21 And that's probably the greatest fear
22 that all of us who live in these rural areas have
23 because we'll be lost. We don't have the same
24 businesses who can donate to the candidates. We
25 don't have the same compact voters where it's easier

1 to get to get your message to.

2 As you have traveled here, you've seen
3 things were different. Your cell phones probably
4 went down in battery life really quickly because we
5 have lots of dead areas. You're seeing with your
6 Internet usage, we don't have the latest technology.

7 When you get to the rural areas, we have
8 great government land masses. Here in Navajo
9 County, more than 40 percent of our land mass is
10 Indian reservations. We have great swaths of
11 national forest service. We have BLM lands. And
12 that causes on the county government level, and
13 sometimes the municipal level, problems because we
14 don't have that property tax base.

15 We need a Congressman who comes from a
16 rural area who understands those problems, who
17 understands that we need Congress to help us with
18 these payments in lieu of taxes because we don't
19 have that tax base.

20 When you live in the Maricopa or Pima
21 County with all of the municipalities, your roads
22 are there. They are held by the municipal. You
23 come up here, we have hundreds and hundreds of miles
24 of county roads but we don't have a property tax
25 base.

1 Those are different issues. We have to
2 use -- because of the government lands that are
3 missed -- we have to get agreements with federal
4 government, tribal governments because we cut across
5 there to get to them.

6 An urban Legislator will not understand
7 those problems. Somebody who comes from the rural
8 areas like us will have lived through those
9 problems, will understand those problems, and will
10 be able to help us with those problems.

11 We've had rural Legislators in these last
12 Congressional districts up here who have understood
13 and who have worked with the local governments, who
14 have worked with the people to help us solve those
15 problems. We may lose that if you give us an urban
16 hub.

17 Having a competitive district as we do
18 now has been a benefit because they have to cross
19 any political boundaries to get those votes.

20 We have seen our Republican
21 representatives, Renzi and currently Gosar reaching
22 out to the Native Americans, which we historically
23 have not seen Republicans do. Ann Kirkpatrick, when
24 she was in here, she too tried to reach across and
25 put one of her main offices in a Republican

1 stronghold in the Prescott area. So competitiveness
2 is also important to the rural areas.

3 And when you get to the State Legislative
4 districts, the big elephant in the room is DOJ and
5 Section 5 of the Voting Rights Act. And that's
6 primarily for this reason, the Navajos. That almost
7 has to be the point where you start drawing those
8 Legislative district maps because you'll have to be
9 careful of the retrograde issue when it comes to
10 that Native American vote.

11 And then how you craft the State
12 Legislative district for the Navajos will help
13 decide how you follow down from that point.

14 But once again, I along with many of the
15 others that have spoken and will continue to speak
16 after me, would like to see as many rural districts
17 as you can, because once again, on the State level,
18 rural districts are different in Maricopa County and
19 Pima County.

20 We saw a lot of that this last
21 legislative session with the State budget. There
22 was a big push to push down on to the counties. It
23 was our rural Legislators, led by Sylvia Allen and
24 Chester Crandell who came from the Legislative
25 district here who got the message out that is

1 different. The impact is different.

2 And through their efforts and the other
3 rural Legislators out there in our state
4 Legislature, they were able to protect ten rural
5 counties in our state. They understood our message.

6 Probably this far away in the White
7 Mountains from Maricopa and Pima, we are still going
8 to be a rural. But we need as many rural counties
9 out there that share those same problems and issues
10 as us so that we can have a voice. We won't have a
11 control, but have a voice in the Legislature that
12 can be heard.

13 So the more rural State Legislative
14 districts you can make, the better that we get
15 representation that covers all of this state and not
16 just Maricopa County.

17 Thank you again for your time. I
18 appreciate it. I appreciate your efforts, and I
19 look forward to you coming back with a map so we can
20 get some more input.

21 Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

23 Our next speaker in Pinetop will be Holly
24 Hanson. And then I thought if it works, we could go
25 back to Skype for Winslow, if they are ready. So if

1 you could let Ray know.

2 So Holly Hanson, representing self, from
3 Lakeside.

4 HOLLY HANSON: My name is Holly Hanson,
5 H-a-n-s-o-n, and I live in Lakeside.

6 Close enough?

7 I want to thank the members of the
8 Commission that are here for serving and also the
9 ones who are not here. I think it's a tremendous
10 and very important job, and I know you've been
11 working hard and will continue to work hard, and we
12 thank you for that.

13 I would like to ask that the districts
14 that you create be more competitive, and I hope that
15 you will look at election results and not just voter
16 registration.

17 I'm also asking, as have many people
18 before me asked, that rural districts need
19 representation. I would like to see the creation of
20 two rural Congressional districts and eight rural
21 Legislative districts. Rural people need
22 representation and their problems and their concerns
23 are different than those in the urban areas.

24 Thank you.

25 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

1 So we will go to Winslow now, but just to
2 get ready for the next four in Pinetop, we have
3 Sheryl Eaton, Janis Newton, Steve Titla, and Matthew
4 Capaldy.

5 So we'll go to Winslow.

6 BUCK FORST: Ray, you're on.

7 SARAH R. SMITHSON: Good afternoon. My
8 name is Sarah, S-a-r-a-h, middle initial R.,
9 Smithson, S-m-i-t-h-s-o-n.

10 I have lived in Winslow for the past 20
11 years and I have been a resident of Arizona for 43.
12 I have been an educator for 43 years.

13 I would like to thank the Commission for
14 presenting us with this opportunity to speak with
15 you and also to express my gratitude to the State of
16 Arizona for allowing us to have a process where our
17 input is collected.

18 I firmly believe that there is a
19 significant difference between rural and urban
20 areas, which is one of the reasons that I live in
21 northeastern Arizona.

22 Our district, as you heard Mr. Shumway
23 say, is 18,000 square miles. I believe that we can
24 better serve our people's needs if we have a more
25 compact district. That is why I strongly believe

1 that we should have two rural Congressional
2 districts, one in the east and one in the west in
3 Arizona and eight Legislative districts.

4 There are three basic reasons. Number
5 one, people in northeastern Arizona have similar
6 interests. These include the cities of Holbrook,
7 Winslow, Joseph City, Woodruff, the reservations and
8 surrounding ranches.

9 Number two, we have common interests in
10 employment and education, such as ranking, railroad,
11 tourism, agriculture, and the reservations.

12 Number three, we have economic ties
13 with -- economic and social ties with many of the
14 Native peoples here that the people in urban Arizona
15 do not have.

16 I believe very, very strongly that the
17 urban area -- that our rural areas should have a
18 greater voice in what is going on in the Legislature
19 and that we cannot do this if we are part of the
20 southern Arizona city districts.

21 Thank you again for allowing us to speak
22 with you, and I do hope this process is successful.

23 Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

25 Are there more in Winslow?

1 SUSAN LAWLER: My name is Susan Lawler
2 S-u-s-a-n, L-a-w-l-e-r.

3 I've been an inspector at one of the
4 precincts here in Winslow for 12 years. And I think
5 we need a rural -- greater rural Arizona district,
6 perhaps as Mrs. Richardson said on the east and on
7 the west.

8 Our interests along this area includes
9 tourism, ranching, railroad, and working with the
10 Native American communities. We need a district
11 that does not have spokes into the metro area. We
12 just need to have our own areas for the rural areas.

13 A district -- perhaps two districts now
14 along the western and northern part of the state and
15 northeastern part of the state. And I think this
16 would be much more fair.

17 And I thank you for your time and effort
18 that you are putting into this.

19 Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

21 Okay. Can we jump back to Pinetop now?

22 We've got Sheryl Eaton up next followed
23 by, again, Janis Newton, Steve Titla, and Matthew
24 Capaldy.

25 So right now Sheryl Eaton, representing

1 self, from Lakeside.

2 SHERYL EATON: Sheryl Eaton, S-h-e-r-y-l,
3 E-a-t-o-n.

4 And I think as you have already heard, we
5 rural people feel almost like minority with a
6 capital M and maybe even we could come under that
7 federal mandate for keeping the minorities having a
8 voice.

9 We -- I can just give one example from my
10 own experience of community of interest problem. I
11 was a teacher in Whiteriver for 21 years. Rural
12 schools have very different problems from urban
13 schools. For instance, we have trans- -- high
14 transportation costs and high administrative costs
15 just because of distances. You need an
16 administrator in a district and administrators in
17 schools and yet you can't combine districts because
18 of distances.

19 So somebody urban representing us doesn't
20 really think of those things, and there are many
21 more things just involved with schools that are
22 different from urban and rural.

23 So I would hope that we can have the two
24 rural Congressional districts and the eight
25 Legislative districts rural, you know, with no

1 contamination by urban, as much as possible.

2 I hope these Congressional and
3 Legislative districts are competitive. If we could
4 have, you know, good, honest, I don't want to say
5 fights, but, you know, a contest for being elected,
6 that would be really good. It gets people
7 interested and it's more fair.

8 And I support the Commission as it's
9 currently constituted. I think that you guys are
10 trying to be fair and honest and do the best you can
11 for all of the people, and I thank you for that.

12 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

13 Our next speaker is Janis Newton,
14 representing self, from Navajo County.

15 JANIS NEWTON: My name is Janis Newton,
16 and I'm from Pinetop, Navajo County, and I support
17 competitive rural Congressional and Legislative
18 districts.

19 I support two Congressional districts,
20 one that includes eastern -- can you see me -- one
21 that includes eastern greater Arizona and one that
22 includes western greater Arizona because it just
23 makes sense.

24 When you think -- if you think about just
25 about every issue that you can think of such as the

1 rural economy or keeping our forest healthy or the
2 interests of the Native American community up here,
3 rural needs are very different than the needs of
4 urban Arizona. We need representation that
5 understands rural issues.

6 Also it is important to make the
7 Legislative district competitive by comparing the
8 voter registrations with voter turnout and voting
9 patterns.

10 And thank you for the work that you are
11 doing.

12 Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

14 Our next speaker is Steve Titla, from San
15 Carlos Apache from Globe, Arizona.

16 So if you could spell your name for the
17 recorder, that would be great.

18 STEVE TITLA: Steve Titla, T-i-t-l-a.

19 (Speaking in native tongue.)

20 I'm just trying to work up the
21 interpreter.

22 My name is Steve Titla. I'm an Apache
23 from San Carlos Apache reservation. I'm glad that
24 we are here discussing the Arizona redistricting
25 process. I'm glad that you are here.

1 Welcome to Apache land. I'm not from
2 here, White Mountain Apache, but I'm from San Carlos
3 Apache, born and raised in Bylas, Arizona, which was
4 in Graham County on the east side of the San Carlos
5 Apache reservation.

6 A little bit of history here in this past
7 of Apache land, we have a treaty from 1852. 1852.
8 And in 1852, the treaty lands included this area
9 here and included San Carlos Apache reservation. It
10 was all one reservation, one reservation.

11 Then in 1892, the U.S. government, in its
12 ultimate wisdom, divided the San Carlos reservation
13 and the White Mountain Apache reservation along the
14 Black River line. So right now the Black River is a
15 boundary between Fort Apache and San Carlos Apache
16 reservations.

17 We are the same people. We have the same
18 culture and tradition, language. The gentleman over
19 here, I'm sure that he understands what I said
20 awhile ago.

21 And our linguistic base language is
22 Athabaskan. Athabaskan linguistic base, and we have
23 the same linguistic base as White Mountain Apache
24 and San Carlos Apache and the Navajos also, they
25 have Athabaskan. Athabaskan, as you know, in

1 Alaska. I think they have some Athabaskan in South
2 Dakota, too, I think. So we all have the same
3 linguistic base. And with regard to the Navajos,
4 you can catch a drift of what they are saying. When
5 they are talking, you can sort of know what they are
6 talking about.

7 But when I am listening to a Hopi or
8 Pima, they might as well be speaking Russian. So
9 there's no relation there. But anyway, that's the
10 linguistic -- that's our history, just for a little
11 bit.

12 And then the gentleman over here said
13 that he didn't know how he got his French name but,
14 in Bylas, what they said was that the soldiers, they
15 brought over a -- they brought over a phone book
16 from back East somewhere and they lined all Apaches
17 up, this is my grandparents that were saying that,
18 they lined all of the Apaches up and all of the
19 Apaches had Apache names, not English names.

20 And they put a phone book and the soldier
21 were sitting here, they said everybody line up, so
22 everybody lined up.

23 They said, what's your name? And some
24 guy would say his Apache name. And they said look
25 for a name in this book, and the guy would point to

1 a name in the phone book and that's how we have
2 French names or Smith or Walker or all of these
3 English-sounding names. That's how we got our
4 names, just to let him know that the French name was
5 there somewhere.

6 At any rate, with regard to the
7 Legislative districts, we would request -- as you
8 know, the Arizona Redistricting Commission is -- the
9 criteria that you must follow the U.S. Constitution
10 and the Voting Rights Act. And we ask that these be
11 followed with regard to the compact and contiguous
12 districts.

13 Now, in San Carlos, we are working on the
14 maps to present to you later on, but the San Carlos
15 Apache Tribal Council has not passed on the maps yet
16 but we will be presenting them to you with regard to
17 the criteria under the Voting Rights Act.

18 We talked to Navajo Nation and talked to
19 White Mountain Apache, so I think that we'll be
20 getting together here very soon to get together to
21 see how we can get some districts that will have a
22 certain percentage of American Indian population
23 that will be within the mean deviation so that we
24 will be able to have a chance to elect somebody.

25 In our history in Arizona, we don't have

1 a good history with -- historical history with
2 Arizona or the U.S. government. So the effect has
3 been that we have not been able to really elect
4 anybody in the Congressional district.

5 So I think that it would be good that
6 some day if we can vote a Native person into
7 Congressional district, so we'll be looking to that
8 effect. I think that we want to be -- we're U.S.
9 citizens. We're part of the State government. We
10 are state citizens and U.S. citizens also.

11 And I think that if you look in the
12 nation as far as the Armed Forces go -- I'm a Marine
13 Corps, so if there's any marines out there (speaking
14 in native tongue.) But I've been in the military
15 service and I've been overseas, the Far East. I
16 think if you look at the population of the nation
17 with regard to Native Americans, I think that the
18 portion of Native volunteers in the Armed Forces
19 much exceeds any other people in the country, I
20 would think.

21 So we volunteer. We are citizens and we
22 volunteer, we go to war for the nation, the United
23 States, and we would like to get some good
24 representation in the Congressional district.

25 As we go into the future, we are going to

1 look for presenting you maps that we think that we
2 might have a chance.

3 You know, in my lifetime, I thought that
4 there was no chance that any minority would ever be
5 elected to the president. I thought that that would
6 never happen. And low and behold, President Obama
7 was elected. I voted for President Obama, and I
8 feel that he's one of ours, a minority. And so we
9 would like to have the same chance with the State of
10 Arizona to see whether we can get a Congressional
11 person, a Native person in there, at least have a
12 chance to do that because we have a certain
13 percentage of Native voters in one district and the
14 Native person can go into other areas. Then I think
15 that we would have a real chance of supporting a
16 Native person or any other person in the district.
17 We would like to have you look at that area so that
18 we can have a compact and contiguous area.

19 Any maps that you draw, we would ask that
20 they not be retro aggressive. We don't want the
21 maps to weaken or reduce Native votes in the state.

22 I would like to say about communities of
23 interest that we have the original communities of
24 interest, I think, if you look at the tribes in
25 Arizona.

1 I was telling you about the history of
2 these Apache tribes in Arizona. I'm looking at the
3 map right now, and you have the White Mountain
4 Apache and San Carlos Apache.

5 With regard to our treaty lands, our
6 treaty lands, the eastern boundary of our treaty
7 land was New Mexico boundary that was going from
8 here up to the north here going to the west
9 Springerville boundary then going down south into
10 Morenci, Safford, Thatcher, Pima, all of those areas
11 were Apache lands.

12 But what happened was the history -- they
13 cut off those lands, they took out those lands. The
14 eastern area, including the blue range and
15 Springerville and all of those areas, once Apache
16 lands, were taken away because they discovered
17 copper in the area of Morenci. In Morenci they
18 discovered copper and then that treaty land was
19 taken away.

20 On the south side, Safford, Thatcher,
21 Pima, they have farming lands and people move in
22 those areas, squatters -- home squatters move into
23 the area and they took that land away from us.

24 And then in the Southwest area, that was
25 our lands also, treaty lands, and then they

1 discovered copper and other minerals in Winkelman
2 and Hayden and Dudleyville, in those areas and they
3 took those lands.

4 And then in Globe and Miami and up toward
5 the Salt River, those were Apache lands also. But
6 then they discovered minerals there, gold and copper
7 and silver, and they took those lands also.

8 So today, we are left with what we have
9 today, and those lands are communities of interest
10 that I would like you to take a look at along with
11 the Navajo tribe in the northeast that are their own
12 area, huge reservation. Then the Hopi tribe, too in
13 those areas. You have the Hualapai and Supai in
14 those areas.

15 And so we would like for you to take a
16 look at communities of interest with respect to
17 those tribes.

18 With regard to the county districts --
19 I'm looking at the county lines right now, and San
20 Carlos Apache reservation is in three counties. We
21 are in Gila County and in Graham County and in Pinal
22 County. So we are divided into three counties. So
23 I don't think those are communities of interest or
24 they are not compact or contiguous, in my
25 estimation. So I would like to see if those lines

1 can be redistricted.

2 And then I'm looking at White Mountain
3 Apache reservation and they are in three counties
4 also. Why do we have the Apache tribes in six
5 counties? To me, that seems to be a dilution of our
6 voting strength and discrimination maybe against the
7 Apache tribes.

8 I know that you sitting here did not have
9 anything to do with those lines probably, but you
10 have a chance here now to draw county lines where we
11 can have compact and contiguous county lines and
12 communities of interest that are respected, that
13 will go along with the Voting Rights Act.

14 So we ask you to take a look at that and
15 we'll be looking at that also as far as county lines
16 go.

17 Let's see. I'm looking through the notes
18 real quick. Excuse me.

19 And so we want to -- in the final
20 analysis, I would ask you to take a look at the --
21 making -- strengthening the Native vote in the state
22 so that we follow the Voting Rights Act and Section
23 2 -- Section 5 of the Voting Rights Act so that no
24 discrimination results against the Native tribes in
25 Arizona.

1 But we will be presenting those maps as
2 we go along here.

3 Thank you for your time.

4 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

5 Our next speaker is Matthew Capaldy, from
6 Coconino County, representing self.

7 MATTHEW CAPALDY: Good afternoon, Madam
8 Chair, Commissioner Freeman, staff. It's a pleasure
9 to be here.

10 My name is Matthew Capaldy,
11 C-a-p-a-l-d-y. I reside in Flagstaff, Arizona.

12 First of all, thank you for following the
13 will of the people and executing your
14 constitutionally mandated responsibility by serving
15 on and with this Commission. We certainly
16 appreciate it.

17 As you well know, this Commission was
18 created in the year 2000 by Proposition 106 by the
19 will of the people. And again, I express my
20 appreciation to you for executing that effort.

21 First of all, I would like to talk about
22 areas of -- communities of like interest, and the
23 fact that partisanship has no factor in that aspect.
24 It's a matter relating to quality of life, economy,
25 topography, et cetera.

1 And to speak to that, we all were
2 perplexed and think we have more in common with the
3 White Mountains than almost any other area in this
4 state. We have very similar economies, we have very
5 similar qualities of life as well as communities,
6 size, and such. The only difference, again, is
7 partisanship.

8 And the White Mountains and Flagstaff and
9 the Verde Valley, on the Legislative aspect, have
10 one distinct opportunity no real other areas in
11 greater Arizona have, and that is the creation of a
12 competitive Legislative district.

13 It would be within 5 percent. I
14 personally define a competitive district to be
15 within 5 percent of Republican or Democrat, and I
16 think the public is better served in that context
17 because races are then decided in the general
18 elections where all people can vote versus just in
19 the narrow partisan primary.

20 So I urge you to really take a look at
21 that. We've looked at the population bases of those
22 three particular regions of the Flagstaff
23 metropolitan area, the White Mountain region, and
24 the Verde Valley, and we believe that comes up with
25 one of the only competitive Legislative districts

1 that can be formulated in northern Arizona.

2 There would be two in the northwestern
3 part of the state that we have looked at. Making
4 those competitive is difficult. And then, of
5 course, with the high population of Native Americans
6 within this particular region and the need not to
7 retrogress -- or retrograde below the 63,
8 64 percent -- it would be very difficult, other than
9 north central Arizona, to create a competitive
10 district, and that's where we see that happening.

11 Of course, I would like to echo some of
12 the previous sentiments. I'm a third-generation
13 native Arizonan and spent the majority of my
14 adulthood in northern Arizona. This is my home.
15 And with that, again, I would like to see two --
16 sorry, you're probably getting tired of hearing
17 this -- two greater Arizona Congressional districts,
18 both on the east side and west side of the state
19 that don't go into the two metropolitan areas and
20 eight greater Arizona Legislative districts.

21 Again, because we don't think we have an
22 adequate voice as it is right now in the Legislature
23 being so urban centric and with their urban battles,
24 our communities out here, both at the county and
25 city level, have been paying for that.

1 And so we need to do anything and all
2 that we can to change the dynamic in the Legislature
3 and make sure that rural and greater Arizona have a
4 stronger say in the Legislature and also in Congress
5 with that additional Congressional seat that we are
6 hoping to obtain.

7 So again -- with that, we appreciate you
8 being here today and no doubt, unfortunately for
9 you, you'll be seeing me at other meetings.

10 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

11 So our next four -- let's go ahead and
12 tee those up. J.C. Kite, Joe Waters, Don Ascoli,
13 and Shirley Dye will all be speaking.

14 So we'll start with J.C. Kite,
15 representing self from Navajo County.

16 J.C. KITE: My name is Chet Kite and my
17 wife Stephanie of 50 years, we split our living time
18 between Pinetop in the summers and Phoenix in the
19 winters and we are very, very fortunate.

20 When I hear the term "fair and balanced,"
21 I want to throw up. Life is not fair and balanced.
22 And anybody that can promise you that is, A,
23 probably a politician who wants to get elected, and,
24 B, has no consideration for what is practical,
25 realizable, and doable.

1 And I want to change a challenge to the
2 Commission and phrase it in this fashion: With your
3 dividing system that you put together, do the
4 greatest good for the greatest number of people
5 within the time and means that you have to operate.

6 That's all I have to say.

7 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

8 Mr. Kite, do you mind spelling your name
9 for the record? I'm sorry, do you mind spelling
10 your name for the record?

11 J.C. KITE: Like go fly a, K-i-t-e.

12 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

13 Our next speaker is Joe Waters, Planning
14 Director, White Mountain Apache tribe from
15 Navajo/Apache/Gila Counties.

16 JOE WATERS: Good afternoon.

17 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Good afternoon.

18 JOE WATERS: I first would like to read a
19 letter from Chairman Lupe and then I would like to
20 add just a few comments to his letter.

21 The letter is addressed to the
22 Chairperson.

23 It says, "Thank you to the Commission for
24 holding a hearing on the Fort Apache Indian
25 reservation for the White Mountain Apache tribe to

1 gather public input for the redistricting process.

2 "The White Mountain tribal goes on record
3 to maintain the status quo to the maximum extent
4 possible. Our reservation currently falls within
5 three separate counties, yet we are one people and
6 devoted to the well-being of our tribal members.

7 "The present districting plan has served
8 the tribe well. We have had both Democrats and
9 Republicans elected to represent us and all have
10 served us well.

11 "I regret I will not be able to join you
12 in person, but our tribal planner, Joe Waters, is
13 authorized to speak for the tribe and answer any
14 questions the Commission may have.

15 "Enjoy your visit to our homeland. We
16 are pleased to be your host."

17 And it's signed "Chairman, Ronnie Lupe."

18 Who gets this?

19 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: You can give it to
20 our legal counsel and he'll ensure that it gets into
21 the record.

22 JOE WATERS: I would like to add just a
23 couple of comments to the Chairman's letter.

24 The first is the Arid Land Institute of
25 the University of Arizona, Lay Gibson, did a study

1 to determine communities of interest in our region.

2 Turns out that we are soundly
3 interconnected economically. Don't have a whole lot
4 of connection to the Valley or any of those cities,
5 but independently and connected together, we are an
6 economic region. We ask you to respect that
7 economic region.

8 The other one is that in looking at some
9 of the proposals, there are four Apache tribes in
10 the state of Arizona. There is San Carlos. You
11 heard from the attorney, Steve Titla. There is
12 White Mountain, Tonto Apache in Payson, and there is
13 the Yavapai Apache Nation in Camp Verde.

14 The union of those four Apache nations is
15 something that I think should be considered as the
16 Commission does its deliberation.

17 So again, welcome. The chairman
18 apologizes for not being able to be here but he's
19 glad you made it all the way on to the reservation.

20 Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

22 Our next speaker is Don Ascoli,
23 representing self.

24 You'll have to tell us what county or
25 city you reside in. If you could spell your name,

1 too.

2 DON ASCOLI: Thank you, Madam Chairman,
3 members of this Commission, and the staff and, of
4 course, the fellow citizens here. And it's good to
5 be back in front of you again.

6 My name is Don Ascoli, A-s-c-o-l-i. I'm
7 from Payson, Arizona in Gila County.

8 While I am representing myself, I wear
9 many hats, one of which is I am Chairman of the Gila
10 County Planning and Zoning Commission, which covers
11 the needs of a county, just like our elected
12 supervisors do, like the county attorney, the county
13 sheriff, the county assessor, et cetera.

14 I suggest to you that the basic community
15 of interest is a county. That is how our state a
16 hundred years ago, almost a hundred years ago, when
17 it came into being and had its Constitution, each
18 county had a state senator. The House was based
19 upon population; the Senate was based upon
20 communities of interest called counties.

21 So I respectfully request whatever you do
22 in your redistricting, you respect the community of
23 interest called county and keep them as whole as
24 possible.

25 In the commission that I work on, we have

1 spent a lot of time working with our representatives
2 and state senator in trying to advance forward the
3 good and the needs of the people of Gila County.

4 In the district we are in, and you happen
5 to be in LD5, we are represented by one senator and
6 two representatives. There have been proposals made
7 out there to slice up Gila County. In fact, it came
8 out of Flagstaff, and I will show -- because a
9 picture is worth a thousand words.

10 This is how it represents the state area.
11 And if you look at Gila County right there, it would
12 be four different representatives, four different
13 districts, excuse me, and that would be an absolute
14 nightmare.

15 We have spent ten years with a district
16 that met the requirements of this Commission ten
17 years ago, met the requirements of DOJ, and has
18 worked perfectly well. I would hate to see that
19 totally thrown out the door.

20 We have developed a certain rapport. We
21 have an identity, as has been mentioned by previous
22 speakers. This District 5 that you are sitting in
23 right now is nice and contiguous. It is a nice
24 block.

25 A couple people before me have mentioned

1 possibly, because of the population shortfall,
2 picking a bit of Verde Valley and would make it
3 whole to the requirements to the 213,000, I believe
4 is the count per Legislative district.

5 I think your job here is not to put dice
6 in a can and roll the dice and come up with all
7 kinds of new things to destruct the citizens of the
8 state.

9 I think your responsibility partly is
10 stability, maintaining the rapport through
11 government and the people, not create chaos. It's a
12 lot simpler if you would simply look at and tweak
13 and adjust boundaries as opposed to total
14 destruction. We don't need that in these days.

15 As far as Congressional districts, I've
16 heard the proposal of two. I happen to agree with
17 that. We were in Prescott a couple of days ago, as
18 you were, and it was mentioned there's 1.5 million
19 people in what's defined as rural counties. That
20 would justify two Congressional districts.

21 However, I think there's a fallacy in an
22 east/west divide. Think about it, folks. The north
23 is the high country. That's where you have
24 forestry. We have the beautiful, largest Ponderosa
25 forest in the world that crosses the north half of

1 this state. Ranching, a common interest, goes all
2 across that.

3 You go to the south, you're in the
4 desert. A whole different lifestyle. You have
5 farming, you have mining. Activities of interest.

6 I think if you look at two res- -- rural
7 Congressional districts, you got to look at a
8 north/south divide. East/west would be a mistake.
9 You would have forest in the east, forest in the
10 west.

11 We have in here -- I'm proud to -- I hope
12 I can mention it -- my supervisor, Tommy Martin, of
13 Gila County has worked diligently to deal with the
14 forest, the forest fires that we endure in the north
15 country. But it's pulled us all together because
16 it's the natural right thing to do. Don't break us
17 apart by creating political lines that don't match
18 what we do together.

19 If you are going to do two in the rural,
20 it should be a north/south, not an east/west.

21 And I would like -- one remaining comment
22 or recommendation. You talked about one man, one
23 vote, equal representation, and I'm going to make
24 this pitch again for the benefit of the guests here
25 because you folks have heard it.

1 There are five members of this
2 Commission. Three from Pima County and two from
3 Maricopa. Where is the representation from rural
4 Arizona on this Commission?

5 Over 20 percent of this state lives in
6 rural Arizona. One member of this Commission should
7 be from rural Arizona.

8 Now, I don't know if it has to be done by
9 law, a bill, a petition, whatever, but I would plan
10 on talking to my representatives and I would like
11 you to look at it from your position already on the
12 existing Commission, because we are talking about
13 something ten years from now.

14 But I would surely hope I come to one of
15 these ten years from now and I see someone directly
16 representing my interests, the interests of rural
17 Arizona.

18 Thank you very much.

19 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

20 Our next speaker is Shirley Dye, who is
21 getting ready, but let me go ahead and name the next
22 three. Roberta Peterson, Lynne Breyer, and James
23 Palmer.

24 So Shirley Dye is representing self, LD5,
25 Gila/Graham/Greeley (sic), Navajo Apache -- Southern

1 Navajo Apache.

2 SHIRLEY DYE: Hi, I'm Shirley Dye, and
3 that's spelled D-y-e, and I am here to talk to you
4 once again, because I was here in Prescott, about
5 Legislative District 5, in which you sit.

6 Legislative District 5 is currently made
7 up of southern parts of Navajo and Apache Counties
8 plus Greeley (sic), Graham, and Gila Counties. And
9 after the 2010 census, LD5 is shown to be short
10 20,809 people. LD5 needs to pick up approximately
11 21,000 people to bring it close to the target
12 population for a district.

13 And as I mentioned the other day, the
14 Camp Verde area just has that 21,000 people that we
15 need.

16 Now, you have just heard from Don Ascoli
17 about how very important counties are. As you look
18 at this map, you have Navajo, Apache, Greeley,
19 Graham, and Gila Counties, and this little section
20 here is the most eastern part of Yavapai County,
21 okay?

22 Just a couple of communities here. This
23 is all forest service and BLM land from Maricopa
24 County all the way up in here into the Coconino
25 County line. This is all Yavapai County.

1 As much as -- or as well as practicable
2 is a word that I have heard many, many times in
3 sitting in the Gila County redistricting meetings,
4 of which I was very interested in and that's how I
5 ended up submitting this map.

6 The little area of Cordes Lakes, the Camp
7 Verde, Montezuma Castle -- or Montezuma Castle and
8 Montezuma Lakes area and Rimrock, those little
9 communities pick up the exact amount of people that
10 we need.

11 And, yes, it is dipping into another
12 county and I understand that is a problem for
13 Yavapai County and so we would just have to see how
14 the cookie crumbles here.

15 But anyhow, the addition of Camp Verde's
16 population to LD5 makes perfect sense. Camp Verde
17 is rural and tourist community of interest has far
18 more in common with LD5 than the majority of LD4 or
19 LD1.

20 Just 40 miles west down the mountain from
21 Strawberry, Pine, Payson, and Star Valley, small
22 town Camp Verde is very similar to the majority of
23 rural Legislative District 5 with its ranching,
24 small farms, forest, tourist -- and tourist
25 attractions.

1 The similar communities will unite along
2 Highway 260, which is the backbone of this whole
3 LD5. We go from Camp Verde all the way to Show Low
4 and all the way to the New Mexico border.

5 But Camp Verde is also very similar.
6 Besides the high country of Pine, Strawberry, and
7 Star Valley, it is very, very consistent with our --
8 down Highway 188, the areas along the Tonto Basin
9 and other lower-lying areas where we get into the
10 saguaro -- beautiful saguaro forests and the more
11 high desert areas where we have recreation like Lake
12 Roosevelt area and all.

13 The LD5 minority/majority Hispanic voting
14 block in Greeley (sic), southern Gila and Graham
15 County and its minority/majority Native American
16 Apache voting blocks. And like you have heard from
17 the San Carlos Indian reservation, Fort Apache and
18 our own close to Payson and Tonto Apache tribes,
19 will have -- with the inclusion of that extra 21,000
20 people -- will still have basically the same
21 percentages of total majority/minority voting block
22 interests.

23 LD5, with the addition of Camp Verde,
24 will be very well-balanced politically and
25 competitively. It would be, like, 37 percent

1 Republican, 37 percent Democrat, and 21 percent
2 Independent voters.

3 There is no reason for a massive
4 reconfiguration of Legislative District 5 when a
5 simple shift of population from Camp Verde into LD5
6 meets all of the redistricting requirements. The
7 total population would only be about 700 to 750
8 people short of the exact target population of 21 --
9 213,067 people.

10 In the areas of the Voting Rights Act,
11 minority/majority populations are in compliance.
12 Our communities of interest are maintained with Camp
13 Verde fitting right in the historic, pioneer, and
14 ranching, and farming interests.

15 The LD5 boundaries remain intact with the
16 Navajo Nation to the north and Coconino County line
17 on the north, New Mexico on the east, Pinal County
18 on the south, Maricopa on the southwest, and that
19 little area of Highway Interstate 17 that goes up
20 between the Maricopa County line and the -- I guess
21 I should be doing it this way -- Maricopa County
22 line and the Coconino County line, so it has good
23 boundaries.

24 Okay. LD5 boundaries -- okay. LD5
25 boundaries remain intact except for the new

1 inclusion of Camp Verde, which has rather been an
2 island to itself surrounded by public lands and far
3 away from the main populations of LD1 and LD4.

4 So we request the Independent
5 Redistricting Commission maintain the existing
6 configuration of LD5 but with the inclusion of the
7 Camp Verde area.

8 So thank you very much.

9 And based on what I heard last Thursday
10 night, I believe that if you are going to split into
11 two Congressional districts for rural Arizona, that
12 they would be layered horizontally, not vertically
13 east and west due to some of the reasons Mr. Ascoli
14 said.

15 Thank you very much.

16 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

17 I want to be sensitive to our court
18 reporter, which is unusual for me. Are you sure
19 Michelle?

20 Okay. We'll keep going. Let us know
21 when you need a break.

22 Our next speaker is Roberta Peterson,
23 representing self from Pinetop.

24 ROBERTA PETERSON: P-e-t-e-r-s-o-n.

25 I applaud what Ms. Dye just said. I

1 totally agree with her. It makes so much sense to
2 include Camp Verde because that is a community of
3 interest.

4 I lived in Flagstaff for 19 years and
5 then moved to Pinetop 6 years ago. I don't think we
6 really have anything in common with Flagstaff except
7 good weather.

8 And then I want to ask Mr. Desmond, is it
9 true I have understood that your company has never
10 done redistricting mapping before?

11 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: I don't think we are
12 able to answer questions, is that right,
13 Mr. Kanefield?

14 ROBERTA PETERSON: We can't ask
15 questions?

16 Okay. I understand that his company has
17 never done redistricting mapping before, and I'm
18 surprised that another company wasn't chosen,
19 because there were some good ones to choose from.

20 Also, I have to say that I do not believe
21 that this Commission is fair and balanced, not only
22 because we've got Pima and Maricopa only, but
23 because I do not believe that the White Mountain
24 Independent newspaper was wrong when they reported
25 that Ms. Mathis is definitely not independent.

1 So I just want to say those things.

2 Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

4 Our next speaker is Lynne Breyer,
5 representing self from Navajo County.

6 LYNNE BREYER: Thank you. The spelling
7 of my name is B-r-e-y-e-r.

8 Madam Chairman and Commissioners, I've
9 been a small business owner in Arizona for 28 years
10 with clients in both Pinetop and Scottsdale. I
11 split my time between these two areas for all of the
12 time I have lived in Arizona. I can safely say that
13 these areas have little in common.

14 I am here to discuss issues surrounding
15 the mapping process regarding competitiveness and
16 the communities of interest.

17 People move into areas that fit their
18 needs in terms of education, economic, cultural
19 opportunities, recreation, political interests, and
20 social values, among other reasons. They naturally
21 gravitate to areas where like-minded people live in
22 the neighborhoods they choose.

23 The people in some areas of our state are
24 quite distinctive in their interests, needs, and
25 values.

1 In this case of LD5, as well as the
2 future Congressional district, the common interests
3 are tourism, outdoor activities, ranching, a
4 preference and a concern for -- sorry,
5 preference and concern for forested areas and small
6 rural communities sharing similar needs and
7 services.

8 These communities need the kind of
9 lawmakers who share and understand these same
10 interests and values.

11 For this area, I believe communities of
12 interest for drawing district lines in the
13 primary -- is the primary and commonsense method of
14 choice.

15 This district -- excuse me, this district
16 should include the similar areas existing now
17 following the Maricopa County line over to the I-17,
18 south of Camp Verde up to the Coconino County line,
19 and this would include Camp Verde. It would exclude
20 Flagstaff, which really no longer meets a rural
21 criteria.

22 This plan will satisfy the population
23 requirement respecting counties and the communities
24 of interest that are linked by lifestyle. It is
25 also a culturally diverse area and it satisfies the

1 need for tightly contained districts.

2 Residents of these areas routinely travel
3 between and do business in all of these communities
4 and recreational areas.

5 In terms of compactness, the current CD1
6 could be used as the perfect bad example for drawing
7 district lines. For the new Congressional district,
8 this sparsely populated area would further -- would
9 extend further south along the eastern border to
10 retain the same communities of interest.

11 Using the format of competitiveness is
12 less important in this process because of the
13 diversity that exists within these areas already and
14 opens the door to abuse of power by the Commission,
15 given that those charged with this work, including
16 ancillary participants and Strategic Telemetry, are
17 made up of, except for two panel members, those with
18 close ties to one party, the Democrat party,
19 although it's really irrelevant which party is in
20 control.

21 There is already evidence of the chair,
22 who is representing herself as an Independent,
23 despite evidence to the contrary, violation of open
24 meetings laws, bid-rigging, trading of votes for
25 favors, and failure to produce all public records,

1 scoring sheets which show how the mapping company
2 was selected.

3 The intent of Prop 106 was to prevent
4 this type of activity. This process has been
5 tainted and has not adhered to the State
6 Constitution. It's doubtful that it can be trusted
7 by fair-minded people.

8 Observing the rule that perception is
9 reality, this panel should immediately move to
10 correct these serious abuses as well as avoiding
11 actual partisanship and gerrymandering.

12 Given the process to date, this is going
13 to be a monumental task. You have yet an
14 opportunity to make needed efforts to commit to a
15 fair process.

16 I sincerely hope this Commission will use
17 that opportunity to follow the law in accordance
18 with the Constitutions of Arizona and the United
19 States. To do otherwise jeopardizes this entire
20 project.

21 Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

23 Our next speaker is James Palmer, County
24 Supervisor for Graham County.

25 JAMES PALMER: Thank you, Madam Chair,

1 Commissioners. Thanks for the opportunity to be
2 here and for the important work that you are doing
3 and the very difficult task.

4 I had the opportunity ten years ago to
5 stand before your predecessors in the original
6 Commission and advocate for rural representation in
7 Arizona and advocate for areas that we believed had
8 a strong community of interest.

9 We were successful in that effort, in
10 what turned out to be the creation of Legislative
11 District 5 and Congressional District 1.

12 Our purpose in that was to have districts
13 that were truly rural. We have heard a lot here
14 today about being both rural and compact, and I
15 recognize that by virtue of the numbers game and
16 what comprises rural areas, those two things are
17 virtually mutually exclusive.

18 Now, contiguous works. Compactness can
19 be very difficult when trying to stay completely
20 rural. And our hope was that we did not have
21 something that included the metropolitan areas in
22 our districts.

23 And I would advocate that this is
24 important going forward; that we maintain that, even
25 if it means reaching out to a larger area to

1 maintain the rural community of interest that we
2 have.

3 The communities of interest that we
4 advocated for ten years ago, and which I am here
5 today to advocate for, I believe are very important
6 in our communities. These include the mining
7 communities of interest in Graham, Greenlee, and
8 Gila Counties and families that have been in those
9 communities for generations and are very culturally
10 diverse and a very important part of our district.

11 The agricultural communities of interest
12 that include farming, ranching, greenhouse
13 industries that stretch across the entire breadth of
14 our Legislative District 5 and our Congressional
15 District 1. We have tribal issues that I believe
16 were met in these districts when they were formed.

17 And so I think it's important that we
18 maintain that. That we, to the extent necessary,
19 reach out to reach the population thresholds but to
20 not turn the applecart over.

21 It's important to note that our family
22 and cultural and historic ties go back to days that
23 were before statehood in these communities of
24 interests. These mining communities, these
25 agricultural communities, these small towns were

1 here long before Arizona was a state. And our
2 family ties stretch across these boundaries and they
3 are very important to us. And I think they as well
4 are very diverse and cover all walks of life.

5 I know there is no one on this Commission
6 that represents rural Arizona, so I would implore
7 you and ask that all of you represent rural Arizona,
8 that you hear our voice, that you keep us intact.
9 We have truly, in the past ten years, been heard
10 more loudly and more clearly than at any time since
11 counties represented -- or elected their State
12 representation. And I don't want to lose that. I
13 want to see us be able to hang on to that going
14 forward. I know you have a difficult task.

15 Finally, let me tell you that I had a
16 call from one of my fellow county supervisors in
17 Greenlee County, Mr. Lent, who could not be here
18 today due to a prior commitment. And he asked me if
19 I would speak on his behalf and say that he does
20 support maintaining our current Legislative and
21 Congressional districts to the extent that it's
22 possible that we only expand them to what we need
23 and we keep going forward with our voice being
24 heard.

25 And finally, let me just add, I know that

1 the meetings are set for the first round of public
2 meetings, but we feel there was a fairly large part
3 of Arizona left out. And we have sent a letter, in
4 fact, to the Commission requesting that the counties
5 of Graham, Greenlee, and Gila, that's a fifth of the
6 counties in Arizona, be considered as you schedule
7 future public meetings.

8 I would suggest that Eastern Arizona
9 College might be a fairly central location for those
10 three counties. But our citizens might have an
11 opportunity to have their voice heard in this
12 process.

13 And I thank you for all of the good work
14 that do you and ask that you listen as we come to
15 you and share our concerns and that we come up with
16 something that will effectively represent all of us
17 and that we maintain these districts as closely as
18 we can.

19 And I have comments and maps here that I
20 would like to submit.

21 Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Joe.

23 Thank you very much.

24 Our next speaker is Tommie Martin, County
25 Supervisor for District 1 in Gila County.

1 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: It takes her a
2 while.

3 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: No problem. Take
4 your time.

5 I'll go ahead and name the next couple of
6 speakers. We've got David Tenney up next, Charleen
7 Greer, Adolfo Echeveste.

8 TOMMIE MARTIN: Madam Chair and
9 Commissioner, I want to thank you very much for the
10 opportunity to visit with you today. I think your
11 job makes herding cats look easy.

12 As supervisor for Gila County, there's a
13 couple of points I would like to make. I am here to
14 support a couple of plans. The first one is the
15 Legislative District 5 being the same with the
16 addition of Camp Verde.

17 Through my lifetime -- I'm a fifth
18 generation out of Payson, and through just my voting
19 career in Payson, Gila County tends to be Arizona's
20 chopping block when it comes time to reconfiguring
21 districts. And I have voted with Flagstaff, I have
22 voted with Prescott, I have voted with Globe.

23 The last ten years of putting Gila County
24 with Navajo, Apache, Greenlee, Graham has worked
25 very well for us. We are a rural voice. And it's

1 the first time that I know of that we were not
2 diluted with an urban voice and a true rural voice
3 was heard.

4 I think adding Camp Verde to us makes
5 very good sense for several reasons. They are still
6 rural. They have an agricultural ranching
7 background as much -- many of us do.

8 And I would like to talk a minute about
9 the Apache voice there.

10 I have a very sincere interest in that
11 voice. I had a great aunt who was the last -- was
12 the surviving Apache of the Winona massacre, so I
13 have direct Apache relatives. At Tonto Apache I
14 have other folks that I consider family and they do
15 have direct family in Camp Verde.

16 Steve Titla's conversations about the
17 White Mountain Apache and San Carlos Apache, to me,
18 come right on around to Tonto Apache and then
19 Yavapai Apache. And I realize that doesn't pick up
20 Fort McDowell, but it, in fact, consolidates that
21 Apache voice and gives them an Apache voice,
22 something that also hasn't been considered.

23 As Gila County tends to get chopped up,
24 that's one of the voices that gets chopped up, too.
25 I would think that the Yavapai Apache, if there was

1 any disenfranchised voice in that part of the world,
2 it is that voice. And to consolidate them would
3 give them a solid voice.

4 I also would like to -- there's a lot of
5 talk about the Congressional District, whether it
6 goes north/south or east/west. There is a Pinal
7 County Governmental Alliance proposal that does, in
8 fact, do an east/west cut.

9 When I look at it, it's almost -- it's
10 almost the best of both worlds. It is an almost
11 north/south, east/west cut. And why I like it in
12 particular is it looks to me like it gives rural
13 Arizona two fair votes and voices in Congress.

14 Playing the supervisor game of having
15 three of us in my county, it's important to have
16 another voice sometimes when you are looking at
17 rural issues. And I think that particular proposal,
18 of all of the ones that I have seen, does that as
19 fair as any other.

20 And I would like to simply submit written
21 comments and let it go with that.

22 Thank you again very much. And I would
23 second Jim Palmer. Payson is another nice place to
24 come. That center of Arizona could stand to have
25 you all show up and we wouldn't be trotting to

1 Prescott and the White Mountain, although we like
2 to. But thank you much.

3 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

4 Our next speaker is David Tenney,
5 Supervisor, District 4 and Board Chairman for Navajo
6 County.

7 DAVID TENNEY: Good afternoon.

8 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Good afternoon.

9 DAVID TENNEY: Madam Chair and members of
10 the Commission, thank you for allowing me to speak
11 today. Thank you for what you are doing. I know
12 it's a thankless job and I know you get a lot of
13 fingers pointed at you.

14 What we hope to do today is to help be
15 part of a solution and we are confident that the
16 fact that you are here means that you care about
17 what we have to say.

18 So thank you and welcome to Navajo
19 County. Certainly better than being in the Valley,
20 whether it be Maricopa or Pima County. Much warmer
21 than it is here today. So thank you for coming.

22 My name is David Tenney. Last name is
23 spelled T-e-n-n-e-y. I am a community member here.
24 I've lived in Navajo County my entire life, and I
25 currently serve as the chairman of the Board of

1 Supervisors for Navajo County and also serve as the
2 president this year of the County Supervisors
3 Association for the State of Arizona. And at the
4 end of my remarks, I will share a little insight
5 that I gained in performing my duties there this
6 year.

7 I want to speak in favor of the proposed
8 redistricting plan that maintains the effective and
9 cohesive relationships of LD5 as it is presently
10 constituted.

11 The purpose of this exercise in our
12 political system is to equalize the population of
13 districts so that they comply with federal
14 requirements.

15 Some of the key criteria that are
16 involved in this process, as we've heard many times
17 today, include an attempt to create compact and
18 contiguous districts, an attempt to keep political
19 units and communities in a single -- within a single
20 district and attempt to avoid the drawing of
21 boundaries for purposes of partisan advantage and
22 incumbent protection.

23 I submit to this committee that the
24 proposed redistricting plan which keeps the eastern
25 counties of Arizona in LD5 meets all of these

1 criteria, and the communities of our district are
2 best served under the current configuration with a
3 simple addition of the Verde Valley, as has been
4 stated by others today.

5 With the addition of the Verde Valley,
6 LD5 will retain its previous contiguous
7 configuration determined by the Commission ten years
8 ago with very minimal changes. Other proposals that
9 have been suggested to this committee would
10 drastically diverge from this key criteria point.

11 In addition, the proposal we support
12 fully meets the required population levels for the
13 new Legislative districts in Arizona to within less
14 than one-half of one percent and does so while
15 meeting the competitive standard requirements for
16 partisan and political criteria. Roughly leaving
17 right around one-third Republican, one-third
18 Democrat, and close to one-third Independent.

19 The proposal that we support also
20 maintains the current districts for minority
21 standards of representation. The LD5 configuration
22 has been tried and tested and has yielded a fair and
23 representative outcome over the past decade.

24 This is a key point to the members of the
25 White Mountain Apache tribe, and other minorities

1 that you have heard from today and will hear from at
2 other times, I'm sure. They like that
3 configuration, as you heard today.

4 Finally, we support -- the plan we
5 support, I'm sorry -- the plan we support is rooted
6 in commonsense and time-tested relationships.

7 I have not seen another plan that can
8 claim such close compliance with all of the other
9 criteria points I have outlined while maintaining
10 the social, historical, and communal ties common to
11 each of the political units and communities within
12 the presently constituted LD5. LD5 works, plain and
13 simple.

14 We feel that this balanced and reasonable
15 proposal will fairly retain the common ties that the
16 counties, cities, towns and tribes share in the
17 areas of natural resource management, education,
18 travel, tourism, and others. We share common
19 concerns and common social issues in the management
20 of our communities. We know how to work well with
21 each other and these relationships provide benefits
22 to our citizens.

23 I therefore ask that you adopt this map
24 as presented, and I will give you a map for the
25 record -- the one that you have seen already.

1 A couple of things that I would like to
2 share with you, personal observances.

3 First of all, two of my cohorts,
4 Mr. Palmer and Mrs. Martin from Greenlee and -- I'm
5 sorry, from Graham and from Gila Counties spoke of
6 how these five counties in LD5 work together.

7 That's not something that just started in
8 2000 with the first redistricting that took place.
9 We also -- all five of those counties are members of
10 what we call the Eastern Counties Organization. It
11 was started long before the present redistricting
12 took place.

13 Those five counties have been working
14 together on economic and environmental issues and
15 natural resource issues for much longer than just
16 the past ten years, I think proving that communities
17 of interest certainly do exist between the counties
18 that are represented in LD5. Simply adding the
19 Verde Valley, who has very similar communities of
20 interest to this district, is a very simple and
21 commonsensical way to go about this.

22 Another thing that I would share with you
23 lastly that I observed this year as I spent three to
24 four days a week throughout the Legislative session
25 in Phoenix working on Legislative issues on behalf

1 of counties.

2 There were times, particularly when we
3 saw budget proposals coming out of the Senate that
4 counties were very concerned. And more than once I
5 as the president of that organization had to send
6 out a call to the counties and county-elected
7 officials to come and make their voices heard with
8 the Legislature.

9 I can assure you that the representation
10 that was seen at the Legislature on those days when
11 a call actually went out from those five counties,
12 more than double what we saw from the other ten
13 counties combined.

14 These five counties get involved. They
15 work together as a cohesive unit in this Legislative
16 district. They know who their representatives and
17 their Senator are. They work well with them.
18 They've had some that have been Republican; they've
19 had some that were Democrat over the last ten years
20 and that has worked well.

21 And I submit to you that they work well
22 together because they are a community of interest.

23 I respectfully disagree with our friend
24 from Flagstaff who here today talked about the
25 community of interest between this region and

1 Flagstaff because we all have trees. That doesn't
2 make any more sense to me than saying that Globe and
3 Bagdad ought to be in the same district because they
4 both have mines.

5 I respectfully request that you consider
6 the map that has been proposed of leaving LD5 as
7 constituted with the addition of the Verde Valley.

8 Thank you very much.

9 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

10 Our next speaker is Charleen Greer,
11 representing self, from Navajo, Pinetop.

12 CHARLEEN GREER: Madam Chairman,
13 committee member, not members, I guess, and public,
14 hello.

15 My name is Charleen Greer. I --
16 currently I am a retired attorney. We spent our
17 summers up here and our winters in the Valley. I've
18 been a resident of Arizona for 40 years and my
19 husband and I actually lived up here for 13 years in
20 the '80s and '90s.

21 While living here, I had lots of
22 opportunities to be the either northern Arizona or
23 rural member of all sorts of statewide committees,
24 and particularly the bar association because there
25 aren't that many rural lawyers. And so I was on the

1 State Bar Commission and on communities and on the
2 statewide foster care review board, et cetera.

3 And it became very, very, very clear to
4 me that urban people don't understand rural issues
5 and problems. And I just want to emphasize that
6 because I can't -- they don't understand things.
7 They don't understand how far away people are. They
8 don't understand the issues. And I don't want to
9 repeat because everyone was quite wonderful on
10 talking about those issues.

11 I very much support the two Congressional
12 -- two rural Congressional districts and eight rural
13 Legislative districts. I think probably north and
14 south makes a little more sense to me, but I haven't
15 had a lot of time to think about it.

16 What I would like to talk about is the
17 guidelines that you have on -- in your handout.
18 It's number 5, what guidelines need to be followed
19 when drawing new districts.

20 I particularly want to point out that
21 these guidelines very strongly support rural
22 communities of interest. And I say that for several
23 reasons.

24 One is, of course, that communities of
25 interest is one of the criteria, and I want to point

1 of with regard to compact and contiguous, that we
2 have seen in Arizona in the past districts that
3 broke up the rural areas, and then in order to get
4 enough people, went down to the urban areas. That
5 is not compact. It's contiguous, of course, but
6 it's not compact. It's basically gerrymandering.

7 The most important thing, though, about
8 the guidelines is that F, create competitive
9 districts where no significant detriment to other
10 goals.

11 So your job is to do communities of
12 interest, compact and contiguous, physical
13 geographic features. And lastly, if none of those
14 are harmed, then competitive districts. And I think
15 in the past, and sometimes now, people talk about
16 competitive districts as if they were the primary
17 consideration and they are, in fact, a secondary
18 consideration.

19 So I just urge you emphasize communities
20 of interest and contiguous and compact, and I think
21 you can meet the wishes of the folks here.

22 I would like to say one other thing, and
23 that is I think just about everyone here is here
24 because they are pleading for rural districts and
25 communities of interest. And I am sorry that some

1 partisan politics and things like that have come up.
2 I don't think it's the place for it.

3 But thank you very much. I appreciate
4 all of the time you all are spending. I know it's
5 got to be a real hardship on your families.

6 Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

8 I just wanted to count. We have seven
9 more request to speak forms. I don't -- we can take
10 a short recess if anyone would like to. I'm not
11 just looking at Michelle.

12 Okay. We'll keep plowing through.

13 Adolfo Echeveste. He's a tax paying,
14 voting U.S. citizen representing himself from Tempe.

15 ADOLFO ECHEVESTES: Thank you very much.
16 My name is Adolfo, A-d-o-l-f-o, last name Echeveste,
17 E-c-h-e-v, as in Victor, e-s-t-e.

18 I've been a property owner in
19 Pinetop/Lakeside area for 36 years and a homeowner
20 here for over 17 years, and I am one of those
21 fortunate ones that somebody mentioned that I spend
22 five -- my wife and I spend five months, that's
23 during the summer, in Pinetop and seven months in
24 the Valley, in Tempe.

25 I want to point out a couple of things

1 that -- I'm going to touch on some points based on
2 my personal experience, my professional experience,
3 as the executive director of the Arizona Independent
4 Redistricting Commission during the first
5 commission. Also I wanted to touch very briefly on
6 a comment that one of the supervisors just
7 mentioned, and that is -- and it's a very key point
8 for the Commission.

9 I happened to also be staff assistant to
10 Governor Jack Williams. I was in charge of inner
11 governmental relations for him for a time. And we,
12 myself and Holly Atkinson from Sun City, were
13 responsible in putting together the Regional
14 Councils of Government. They were based on social,
15 economic, communities of interest.

16 Those councils have been in place since
17 about the mid-'60s. And as the supervisor
18 mentioned, they function very well together, and I
19 would urge this Commission to take them into
20 consideration when looking at different
21 configurations for mapping.

22 One point I wanted to make with regard to
23 Tempe and then I'll get back to some other items.

24 Unfortunately, I was not able to be at
25 the East Valley hearing that you had recently

1 because it's cool up here and it's hot down there.
2 And so I thought I would take advantage of making a
3 comment regarding -- since that's my voting area,
4 Tempe is.

5 If you will look at the districts
6 throughout the state, you will find that -- and if
7 you do the research, you will find that the
8 district -- the Tempe district was the most
9 competitive, the most contiguous, met all of the
10 guidelines that the district was from -- the Tempe
11 border on the west side, the Mesa border on the east
12 side, Guadalupe street on the south side, and they
13 did have to move it over to McDowell, which is just
14 a few blocks into Scottsdale. I would have
15 preferred it been all Tempe, but that was a decision
16 made for other reasons.

17 In any event, I urge you that you keep
18 that district intact or as close to it as possible.
19 Or if you can, keep it all within Tempe.

20 Now, moving right along into a couple of
21 other items.

22 Somebody mentioned the selection of the
23 current mapping company. I need to tell you that as
24 the former executive director, frankly, whether you
25 hired one company or you hired another company, I'm

1 sure that they all have the expertise to do the job.

2 The bottom line is they are simply
3 professional staff that crank out information for
4 the commissioners to do their job.

5 Now, the leadership in the House and the
6 Senate in their wisdom selected two Democrats and
7 two Republicans. Those four individuals selected
8 the chair.

9 Now, I want to point out, also, for
10 clarification for some people that apparently have
11 some misinformation on the selection process. I
12 also applied this time around to be considered for
13 the Commission.

14 Now, fortunately or not, I think probably
15 fortunately, I was not selected and you, Chair,
16 Madam Chairman was selected.

17 But I want to point out that nowhere in
18 the application process was there any question asked
19 of what party my wife belonged to. That was not
20 included in the selection process, not in the
21 questions, not in the lengthy questionnaire.

22 My point being that we applied because we
23 were Independents. It had nothing to do with our
24 husbands or our wives.

25 My final point regarding that is that

1 this time around, separate and apart from the
2 other -- the last ten years, is that a new situation
3 has occurred that you need to be very conscious of
4 that, and that is -- and you may have read in the
5 paper -- that there are now more of us Independents,
6 over a million -- I believe a million and 37,000
7 Independents. Then there are Democrats and we are
8 rapidly catching up with the Republicans.

9 I think that that component needs to be
10 carefully weighed when you look at population and
11 numbers of Republicans and Democrats. In order to
12 have competitive districts, you have to incorporate
13 that into your consideration.

14 One final point and I'll sit down.

15 I'm sorry to see the -- from a distance,
16 I've seen the Skype in Pima County and Maricopa
17 County. Up here I'm glad to see that almost all of
18 our folks are very civil and cordial and understand
19 the Democratic process and embrace it, and I'm proud
20 of our people up here. But it did disturb me that a
21 lot of misinformation seems to be coming out.

22 For example, the director and owner of
23 NDC, one of the companies that was not selected to
24 do the mapping, Mr. Allan Hislop, Ph.D. -- after I
25 took over as executive director and all of the

1 community questionnaires had already -- the
2 decisions had been made to pay to get the documents
3 printed, approached me when they appointed me as the
4 second executive director after about two months in,
5 he told me, he says, you know, we included in the
6 initial questionnaires competitiveness. It is an
7 essential consideration along with the rest.

8 He says, "I was instructed by Lisa
9 Hauser, the attorney, one of two attorneys, to
10 delete it. I informed her that that was a serious
11 mistake that would bite the Commission in the long
12 run, as it did."

13 At the time I was busy implementing the
14 hearings and what not. I didn't pay attention to
15 those comments. It was not until I heard the court
16 -- the long drawn-out court process in Superior
17 Court, the Court of Appeals, back to the Superior
18 Court, back to the Court of Appeals up to the
19 Supreme Court that that issue became very apparent
20 that he was correct in his assessment.

21 I only bring that up because I noticed
22 during the selection process there were some
23 comments made that gave, if you will, attack the
24 professional -- their professionalism and their
25 reputation, and that's unfortunate, because they did

1 incorporate competitiveness at the beginning but
2 they were directed by Lisa Hauser not to. Whether
3 she was given direction by the Commission or not, I
4 do not know.

5 Now, having said that, I hope that -- and
6 I am fully confident that the company that you have
7 selected is competent. Bottom line, it's up to the
8 four (sic) Democrats and the four (sic) Republicans
9 to have them produce the appropriate maps that fit
10 all of the criteria.

11 And I want to say to you specifically as
12 chairman, you represent over a million and 37,000
13 Independents, that we are placing our support and
14 our confidence in the job that you are doing. We
15 respect you, we support you. Those 1,037,000 may
16 not show up to all of the hearings, but rest assured
17 that we are out there, we are watching, we are
18 supporting you. You are supporting the Commission.
19 And bottom line, if the Democrats and Republicans
20 can't seem to coalesce into the decision-making
21 process, we support you and we expect you to bite
22 the bullet. You are the third vote. You are
23 representing all of the people of Arizona.

24 So, yes, you are going to take the heat
25 but that's why we are paying you the big bucks we

1 are, right? To represent us and keep doing that
2 good job. We hope the rest of the commissioners
3 also do a good job.

4 God bless.

5 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

6 Our next speaker is Julie Junod, and
7 forgive me if I am mispronouncing your name,
8 representing self, from Show Low, Navajo County.

9 JULIE JUNOD: I have a French-speaking
10 cousin. It's Junod, but the French would say Junod.

11 My name is Julie Junod, J-u-n-o-d, from
12 Show Low.

13 Thank you for the opportunity to speak
14 today. And thank you for taking the time to come to
15 the White Mountains.

16 I would first like to reiterate my
17 agreement with some of what the other speakers have
18 said. I agree that the White Mountains and other
19 areas of the current LD5 has little or nothing to do
20 in common, that is, with Flagstaff.

21 I would also ask that in your
22 consideration, that you keep LD5 as it is with the
23 inclusion of the Verde Valley. I think that is an
24 excellent idea. I also agree with the north/south
25 rural districts.

1 I would also like to agree with a
2 previous comment that the representatives here on
3 this panel represent only the urban areas of the
4 state of Arizona. And with all due respect, I hope
5 that we can find a way to have mandatory
6 representation of the rural Arizona in the future.

7 I would also like to -- lastly to state
8 my disagreement with the Commission's choice with
9 the selection of Strategic Telemetry. And I mean no
10 disrespect to Mr. Desmond in any way. It's the
11 company that he works for that I am against,
12 primarily because of its political history in
13 representing people like President Obama, SCIU,
14 moveon.org, the AFLCIO. In other words, the company
15 has represented very leftist or liberal or
16 progressive entities and people, and that is not a
17 company that, in my opinion, would be most suited
18 for an impartial mapping procedure.

19 Thank you again for taking the time to
20 come to the White Mountains.

21 Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Our next speaker is
23 Sam Upshaw representing self from Navajo County.

24 SAM UPSHAW: You didn't give me any
25 notice.

1 First, I would like to say my name is Sam
2 Upshaw, spelled U-p-s-h-a-w. And thank you all for
3 coming up here. I know it's a long drive, but
4 there's worse things you have to do in July than
5 come to Pinetop.

6 Okay. Really quickly, folks, I'm a
7 native Arizonan. I was born in a small area. I am
8 a rural resident. I have lived in Tucson. I have
9 lived in Phoenix. I have lived up here.

10 It is very important to note, as we
11 reiterate, that the rural and urban values are very
12 different. I know this because I've lived in both.

13 I have also lived out of state, and in
14 particular Florida and Colorado, and I have seen the
15 effects of this redistricting process change the
16 whole political climate of the state, and I think to
17 the detriment of the electoral -- to the Democratic
18 process, in my opinion.

19 I am also an Independent, and I would
20 just like to point out that the reason I am an
21 Independent is not because I can't make up my mind
22 between the Democrats and the Republicans, but
23 because I don't believe either party at the national
24 level, not the state, but at the national level
25 adequately represents my interests and values on --

1 you know, especially at the national level, okay?

2 Quickly, I support the idea of two rural
3 Congressional districts and I would like to see an
4 east and west. And the reason for that, folks, is
5 that then we have two representatives for the
6 forestry and border issues instead of one
7 Congressman who represents the border and one that
8 represents forestry. We will have two, one of each
9 -- I'm sorry, two of each.

10 Now, also -- and just for Mr. Titla's
11 very eloquent -- he left the room -- his very
12 eloquent talk about the San Carlos Apache tribe.

13 Just for the record, my -- I am not a
14 third-generation cattle rancher because the federal
15 government seized my family's property down the
16 middle strip east of the Hayden/Winkelman area in
17 the 1970s after we had been there since the 1930s.
18 And they seized that -- our property along with
19 several other ranches in the area and awarded them
20 to the San Carlos Apache tribe. So just FYI, that
21 has gone both ways. Okay? I am living proof of
22 that.

23 I would also like to say that I have
24 family over in the Camp Verde area, and the
25 Legislative District 5 as it stands with the

1 inclusion of the Verde Valley would meet all of your
2 criteria and it would also keep the people there.
3 We have the same socioeconomic, and public policy
4 interests. We are very -- culturally, we are very,
5 very similar.

6 And the -- something that the -- the
7 values that we have, we do not share with Flagstaff.
8 In fact, a lot of the issues that we've had with our
9 catastrophic wildfires came -- the reason that we
10 had such a gigantic fuel buildup in our forest,
11 which resulted in the Rodeo-Chediski and the Wallow
12 fire was because a lot of interests, many of them
13 based in Flagstaff, through litigation, et cetera,
14 would not allow us to manage our forests in the ways
15 that were time tested, and proven to keep wildfire
16 risks down. So please, we do -- I have nothing in
17 common with Flagstaff.

18 And also I would just like to -- the one
19 gentleman mentioned the elephant in the room was the
20 Voting Rights Act. And I would just like to tell
21 you my perspective on that and then I will yield my
22 time, so to speak.

23 I believe that in 2011, the Voting Rights
24 Act is for the most part irrelevant. And the reason
25 that I say that is because I believe having fought

1 forest fires for many years and fought side by side
2 with the Native American fire crews, et cetera, I
3 believe that a cattle rancher, whether he is --
4 whatever the color of his skin or what language his
5 ancestors spoke, a cattle rancher in rural Arizona
6 has more in common with another cattle rancher just
7 because they don't look the same than either one of
8 them does with -- from somebody who looks the same
9 that lives in Tempe or Tucson. Okay?

10 And I wrote down a whole lot of other
11 things, but I do appreciate y'all's time and thank
12 you for listening to us.

13 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

14 Okay. Our next speaker is Barry Weller,
15 representing self, from Apache County.

16 BARRY WELLER: Thank you for the
17 opportunity to speak, and thank you for coming up to
18 this area.

19 My name is Barry Weller. That's
20 W-e-l-l-e-r. I live in very rural Apache County,
21 but I want to claim minority status for the fact
22 that I have only been living up here about two
23 years. I lived down in Mesa for many, many years,
24 and I'm a minority in the sense that I don't have
25 five generations in Arizona or up in the rural area.

1 But I do have a perspective, as the
2 previous speaker, to both the rural and the urban
3 issues, so to speak, and I have been a little bit
4 politically involved for some time. And since I've
5 been up here, I've been very politically involved.

6 It's very expensive to travel the
7 district for gas money, I assure you. So we are not
8 compact, but we are contiguous and we are
9 like-minded.

10 LD5 is really what I want to speak to
11 briefly.

12 I support the minor modification of
13 taking on the Verde Valley, because I have traveled
14 this district we are like-minded and it is
15 competitive in the sense that we do sometimes elect
16 Democrats and we do sometimes elect Republicans.
17 And when you talk to a Democrat in Apache County,
18 he'll say "I'm an Apache County Democrat," which
19 doesn't mean he's a Democrat, it just means that
20 he's approaching that perspective so that he may be
21 considered to have a voice.

22 People up here just get along and they do
23 things and they are like-minded. They don't worry
24 about that political difference most of the time.
25 It's the issue that they get to, and that's been a

1 wonderful experience being up here.

2 I just want to lend my support without
3 any major political clout to keeping things simple,
4 as the representative from the White Mountain Apache
5 tribe said. I totally agree with him. The minor --
6 the least amount of change the better. These people
7 get along, the system has been working, and I ask
8 that you consider keeping it as it is.

9 I have not given a lot of consideration
10 to the Congressional district division, but
11 practically, I would say the east/west split makes
12 more sense. It seems to also support the majority
13 of the Native Americans getting into the same
14 Congressional district, which is part of their
15 language issue that they spoke to earlier.

16 And lastly, I will say that the person
17 that spoke about the process in the mapping
18 organization, I'm not sure exactly where he might be
19 coming from. I cannot imagine a large organization
20 not being somewhat influenced by the major
21 polarization of the political environment over the
22 last decade and over the last few years.

23 So I think it is very critical to look at
24 the potential influence from their political
25 involvement or the types of things they have done in

1 the past.

2 And I would ask that the Commission, or
3 your organization, look more closely at tainting of
4 the selection of the organization presently.

5 Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

7 I have three more forms. Our next
8 speaker is Karen MacKean, Chairman, Navajo County,
9 Republicans from Navajo County.

10 KAREN MACKEAN: Hi. My name is Karen
11 MacKean. I am a resident of Show Low in Navajo
12 County.

13 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: M-a-c- --

14 KAREN MACKEAN: M-a-c, capital K-e-a-n.
15 Thank you, Julie.

16 I'm here to submit the proposed map for
17 Legislative District 5. The proposed map keeps the
18 current district but will add required number of
19 people and other criteria by annexing the area just
20 west of the existing district, as many people have
21 said, Camp Verde area.

22 Since this map comes within 700 persons
23 of the exact number necessary for a new district, we
24 would like very much to see this happen.

25 Important to the community of interest is

1 to keep our representatives. We worked very hard to
2 elect them. That's Senator Allen and
3 Representatives Barton and Crandall.

4 Rural communities like ours have
5 important similarities and is the reason most of us
6 have chosen to live here. We enjoy the lifestyle
7 very much and want to keep it. Also I believe
8 Flagstaff would not be representative of our
9 community of interest.

10 And I would like to submit the proposed
11 LD5 map to you.

12 Thank you very much.

13 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

14 Our next speaker is Bill Faurot, maybe,
15 forgive me if I am mispronouncing, representing
16 self, from Navajo.

17 BILL FAUROT: Just won a nickel.

18 Last name is spelled F-a-u-r-o-t and it
19 is pronounce Faurot.

20 I only have three quick points to make.
21 There is a divide between people who live in rural
22 areas and people who live in urban areas.

23 There is no conceivable way that
24 Flagstaff would ever fit into a rural area. That's
25 number one.

1 The existing CD1 and LD5 --

2 Is that better in the back?

3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes.

4 BILL FAUROT: Existing CD1 and LD5 have
5 worked very well for the last ten years. Prior to
6 that, and in some situations, there is the case
7 where the State of Maricopa has decided how things
8 will run. And that -- the folks up in Flagstaff
9 aren't far behind.

10 The last point is there is an
11 extraordinary misconception in the world about
12 Independent voters. In Navajo County, they are a
13 major group, but in that group, the number of people
14 who identify themselves as Independents is
15 miniscule. On top of that, only a third of them
16 voted. Most of the people who are in this
17 Independent class are people who simply didn't check
18 any box, for whatever the reason, and therefore,
19 they are lumped as Independents. They are not.
20 They just didn't check the box.

21 Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

23 I think this is my last request to speak
24 form. David Kwail, Chairman, Yavapai Apache Nation
25 from Verde -- Camp Verde in Yavapai County. And

1 forgive me if I mispronounced your name. Sorry.

2 DAVID KWAIL: You got it wrong but that's
3 okay.

4 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thanks.

5 DAVID KWAIL: I am the chairman of the
6 Yavapai Apache Nation. I appreciate all that was
7 said regarding my tribe, my Yavapai Apaches.

8 And the idea of wanting to include Camp
9 Verde, of which I am a -- I vote in that district
10 setting. I am a citizen of Camp Verde, plus I am
11 the chairman of my tribe.

12 I have just a small concern about being
13 included in LD5, is that my community is
14 checkerboard. I do not know if you will be
15 including all of my districts or all of my
16 communities as it gets moved or as it gets included.

17 I have a community also with Clarkdale.
18 I'm not sure what half of the Verde Valley is
19 thinking about, Cottonwood, Clarkdale, Jerome, and
20 Sedona.

21 I did not attend the meeting that was
22 held in Prescott, and I should have, of course. I
23 knew about this one but not the one in Camp Verde or
24 wherever you had it.

25 I like the ideals of the north and the

1 south. My father worked in the south. He was -- he
2 worked in the open pit mine in Ajo, Arizona, retired
3 from there and came back to our community in Camp
4 Verde.

5 I was -- like, the first year of my being
6 a teenager, 13, that we moved back to the Verde.
7 After that I was -- grew there, stay there now, know
8 the country, know the high country, and the
9 difference I agree, yes, Flagstaff is getting -- is
10 a big-time city compared to my 10,000 in Camp Verde.
11 Compared to Prescott, also growing like Chino Valley
12 and Prescott Valley, uniting. In my younger days
13 they were very many miles apart.

14 So I just wanted to address that, and
15 I've heard the comments and I will have to get with
16 my mayor to see where his position is regarding this
17 discussion. It sounds like there's an invitation
18 and we will discuss that. Mayor Burnside, is his
19 name.

20 And I thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

22 Chairman, do you mind stating your name
23 for the record and spelling --

24 DAVID KWAIL: David Kwail, K-w-a-i-l.
25 (Speaking in native tongue) is the original, so I

1 won't spell that for you. Sorry.

2 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

3 Well, if -- are there any other request
4 to speak forms that anyone else that didn't get to
5 speak that would still like to address the
6 Commission?

7 Hearing none -- or seeing none, I just
8 wanted to express my great appreciation, and I know
9 Vice Chairman Freeman is going to want to do the
10 same thing in a minute.

11 It's a testament to me that all of you do
12 have strong feelings and relationships built among
13 yourselves, that you are all still here and that you
14 all listened to each other. I think listening to
15 each other is the most important attribute any of us
16 can have, frankly, and it's really great to see that
17 up here in northern Arizona.

18 We have been now to Prescott in the
19 Navajo County and then today here in Pinetop and
20 have heard a lot about the rural versus urban
21 debate. And I want all of you to know that it's
22 incumbent upon each of us, each of the five members
23 to represent all 6.4 million Arizonans.

24 It's not that I can only -- I represent
25 people from Pima or Vice Chairman Freeman represents

1 Maricopa County or that he represents Republicans
2 and I represent Independents. Each of us has to
3 represent all of the Arizonans, and that's what we
4 took an oath to do.

5 So I just want to give you that
6 assurance, because even though there isn't a
7 specific commission member from a rural county, we
8 hear you and that's why we are here. We want you to
9 talk to us and tell us what's important to you, and
10 that's what you did today and we really appreciate
11 that.

12 So with that, I'll give -- let Vice
13 Chairman Freeman speak.

14 COMMISSIONER FREEMAN: Thank you.

15 I agree with everything that the chair
16 has said.

17 I really want to thank the White Mountain
18 Apache tribe for welcoming -- making us feel welcome
19 here.

20 This is a really special part of the
21 state for me. When I was growing up, my folks had a
22 little cabin just right down the road from here. So
23 I spent a lot of my summers up here and other times
24 of the year here as well. They are great memories,
25 and I wish I had that cabin right now.

1 And it really is a spectacular part of
2 the state. When we -- yesterday we were in Window
3 Rock, another great part of the state, northeast
4 part of the state.

5 And when I was driving down, I made a
6 point to drive down through Eagar and come across on
7 270 so I could see the northern part of where the
8 Wallow fire hit. And I know there are a lot of
9 people hurting up here about that and still are.

10 But this morning I went out with some
11 friends that I stayed with and we went out onto Unit
12 3B, which is just to the east of here in Apache
13 Sitgreaves National Forest, and it was really
14 spectacular. It's just beautiful and the forest was
15 alive and green and there was lots of water there
16 and we saw some wildlife and it was great.

17 So this is a great part of the state. I
18 really want to thank all of you for coming and being
19 involved in public participation and watching. This
20 Commission is very important, and it's very
21 important that we hear from you.

22 You need to tell us how these maps should
23 look, and the more commentary, the better. The more
24 specific commentary, if you could prepare maps and
25 submit them, that will really help us do our jobs,

1 and you should expect us all to listen to you as
2 well.

3 So thank you again for coming out today.

4 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

5 The time is 3:50 p.m., and this hearing
6 is concluded.

7 Thank you.

8 (The hearing concluded at 3:50 p.m.)

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I, MICHELLE D. ELAM, Certified Reporter
No. 50637 for the State of Arizona, do hereby
certify that the foregoing 117 printed pages
constitute a full, true, and accurate transcript of
the proceedings had in the foregoing matter, all
done to the best of my skill and ability.

WITNESS my hand this 11th day of August,
2011.

MICHELLE D. ELAM
Certified Reporter
Certificate No. 50637