

ARIZONA INDEPENDENT REDISTRICTING COMMISSION

Tuesday, October 11, 2011
6:14 p.m.

Location

**Phoenix College - Auditorium
1202 West Thomas Road
Phoenix, Arizona 85044**

Attending

Scott Day Freeman, Vice Chair
Jose M. Herrera, Vice Chair
Linda C. McNulty, Commissioner

Ray Bladine, Executive Director
Kristina Gomez, Deputy Executive Director
Buck Forst, Information Technology Specialist

Mary O'Grady, Legal Counsel
Joe Kanefield, Legal Counsel

Reported By:
Marty Herder, CCR
Certified Court Reporter #50162

Phoenix, Arizona
October 11, 2011
6:14 p.m.

P R O C E E D I N G S

(Whereupon, the public session commences.)

VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Okay. Well, can everyone hear me?

Okay. We'll start the hearing. This hearing of the Arizona Independent Redistricting Commission will come to order.

Won't you please rise with me to recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Whereupon, the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.)

VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you all for coming tonight, and thanks to Phoenix College for hosting the Commission.

This is the first public comment hearing of the Commission in our second round of public comments -- series of public comment hearings.

With me tonight to my left is Vice-Chair Jose Herrera -- Commissioner Jose Herrera and to my -- that's to my left. I'm sorry.

And to my other left, my right, is

1 Commissioner Linda McNulty.

2 I'm Scott Freeman. I serve as the vice chair of
3 the Commission as well.

4 Other commissioners, our chair, Colleen Mathis,
5 and Commissioner Richard Stertz are not here tonight.

6 The idea with these public comment hearings is
7 there's so many of them over the next three weeks, is the
8 Commission sort of divides and conquers.

9 And although the other commissioners aren't here,
10 I'm sure they are watching.

11 All of these hearings are streamed live on our
12 website, which is azredistricting.org. And I know they're
13 watching live.

14 I know I won't be able to make it to all of them
15 myself, but I will be watching each one on the Internet with
16 great interest.

17 We really appreciate everyone coming out to give
18 us their thoughts.

19 The Commission has now published two draft maps,
20 one for the congressional maps -- the congressional
21 districts and the other for legislative.

22 And the point of these hearings is to get feedback
23 from the people so we can collect that and distill those
24 comments, and then go back to work as either redesigning or
25 rehauling these maps, tinker with them, making the

1 appropriate adjustments, to bring us to a point where we
2 have final maps, both congressional and legislative.

3 To comply with federal law, we have a Spanish
4 translator here with us tonight. And he's going to read a
5 statement.

6 Jose -- Carlos Reyes, I believe, is here -- there
7 he is.

8 (Whereupon, the interpreter made a statement in
9 Spanish.)

10 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you, Mr. Reyes.

11 And then some more introductions. With us tonight
12 are the Commission's lawyers, Mary O'Grady and Joe
13 Kanefield.

14 Also with us somewhere is our executive director
15 Ray Bladine, our Commission's assistant executive director
16 Kristina Gomez.

17 She is here -- in the back. There we go.

18 We have our outreach coordinators, Lisa
19 Schmelling, Kristi Olson, Jean Shields, and Karen Herman,
20 and Anna Garcia.

21 And we also have our public information officer
22 Stuart Robinson who is with us tonight.

23 Also we have our mapping consultant here with us
24 tonight, Andrew Drechsler, from the firm of Strategic
25 Telemetry. He's going to give a presentation to you all

1 here in a few moments.

2 And are we leaving anyone out?

3 Oh, our information -- our technology expert, Buck
4 Forst.

5 And everything tonight is being taken down by our
6 court reporter, Marty Herder, who is making everything
7 that's said tonight a part of our record.

8 If, if any member of the public desires to make
9 comment to the Commission tonight, you can -- in the back
10 you'll see these yellow forms. These are our public comment
11 forms. Please complete them and give them to Ms. Gomez or
12 any member of our staff so they can get them up to me, and
13 later tonight we'll be calling names and have you come up to
14 the podium to provide comment.

15 If you don't want to come and speak to the
16 Commission directly, included in the packet that you would
17 have received as you came in is this blue form, the back,
18 where you can complete that and provide written comments to
19 the Commission.

20 The Commission also accepts comments through its
21 website, which I mentioned, azredistricting.org.

22 You can make comments there, or you can call the
23 Commission to let us know your thoughts.

24 I do want to make sure everyone is aware of these,
25 our information packets, pick them up in the back.

1 There is a letter from our chair, Ms. Mathis, and
2 a memo sort of describing where the -- how the Commission
3 has got to this point, explaining the process. And perhaps
4 most importantly there are color -- nice color printouts of
5 the congressional and legislative maps.

6 And we'll be going through them more with the
7 presentation that Mr. Drechsler is going to provide us with.

8 And I think with that, those introductions in
9 order, I think I'll turn the program over to Mr. Drechsler
10 for his presentation.

11 ANDREW DRECHSLER: Thank you very much.

12 Good evening.

13 Today we are here to discuss the draft maps
14 presented by the Arizona Independent Redistricting
15 Commission.

16 The draft maps are currently under a 30-day
17 review.

18 And this is a -- this is one of the main reasons
19 we're here today, is because we want to hear the public's
20 thoughts and comments on the maps and what they like and
21 what they don't like.

22 However, before we get into the maps, we just want
23 to do a quick review of the overall process.

24 Is that better?

25 All right. The Arizona redistricting process is

1 governed by the state constitution as amended by the voters
2 in 2000 with the passing of Proposition 106. It stipulates
3 that the Arizona Independent Redistricting Commission redraw
4 Arizona's congressional and legislative districts to reflect
5 the results of the most recent census.

6 What are the guidelines of Prop 106?

7 One, they must comply with U.S. Constitution and
8 the Voting Rights Act.

9 Two, it must have equal population for all of the
10 districts.

11 And criteria A and B are federally mandated.

12 Criteria C is compact and contiguous.

13 D is respect communities of interest.

14 E, use visible geographic features, city, town,
15 and county boundaries, and undivided census tracts.

16 F, create competitive districts where no
17 significant detriment to other goals.

18 We just wanted to go over the Voting Rights Act.

19 Arizona's congressional and legislative districts
20 must receive preclearance or approval from the Department of
21 Justice or a federal court under Section 5 of the Voting
22 Rights Act before they can take effect.

23 With preclearance -- to give preclearance, Arizona
24 must demonstrate that the new districts do not discriminate
25 against minority voters in purpose or effect, which means

1 there can be no intentional or accidental discrimination.

2 Under Section 5, Arizona's redistricting plans
3 cannot be retrogressive.

4 The plans cannot weaken or reduce minority voters'
5 rights.

6 The presence of discrimination can be determined
7 by analyzing population data and election results.

8 So the time line is for the Commission, back in
9 earlier this year they set up the Commission, and the
10 commissioners were appointed through a thorough screening
11 process. And on the Commission there's two Democrats, two
12 Republicans, and an Independent.

13 Tonight we have Vice-Chair Scott Freeman, we have
14 Vice-Chair Jose Herrera, and Commissioner Linda McNulty.

15 As Commissioner Freeman stated, Colleen Mathis is
16 the chair and Commissioner Stertz is not here.

17 The first round of hearings, before drawing a
18 single line, the Commission held 23 public hearings around
19 the state in July and August to get input from members of
20 the public about issues relevant to redistricting, such as
21 geography, communities of interest, minority voting rights,
22 and competitiveness.

23 Next we started mapping.

24 The first step was to produce a grid map, which
25 was approved on August 18.

1 And part of -- the grid map was required by
2 Proposition 106.

3 And there is two requirements in there. It was to
4 be equal population and compactness.

5 Since adopting the grid maps, the Commission has
6 met more than 25 times to consider adjustments to the grid
7 maps to accommodate all the state constitutional criteria.
8 During this time they received additional public comments
9 and draft maps.

10 Approval of the draft maps on October 3rd, for the
11 congressional maps, that incorporate changes based on the
12 constitutional criteria. And then it approved the draft
13 legislative maps earlier this week on October 10.

14 The second round of hearings, which you're a part
15 of today, is going to be visiting 25 towns and cities around
16 the state to share the draft maps and receive additional
17 public input during the month of October.

18 Final maps will -- upon completion of the second
19 round of hearings, we'll take -- and the public comment
20 period, the Independent Commission will adapt -- adopt final
21 maps.

22 And the final step in the overall redistricting
23 process is preclearance.

24 Because Arizona is subject to Section 5 of the
25 Voting Rights Act, the district maps must be approved by the

1 federal Department of Justice or the federal court in
2 Washington, D.C., before they can be used for the next
3 elections.

4 We'd like to show the progress of the maps and
5 show how we came to the current draft maps.

6 The map you see here was the congressional map
7 that was approved by the last Redistricting Commission and
8 most recently used in the 2010 elections.

9 Per Proposition 106, the Commission was required
10 to start with a blank slate, not taking into consideration
11 any previous election results or incumbents.

12 Also per Proposition 106 the Commission started
13 with the grid map. As discussed earlier, the grid map would
14 only take into consideration two of the six criteria, equal
15 population and compactness.

16 In August the Commission asked that two grid maps
17 be drawn, and on August 18 they agreed on option two seen
18 here.

19 After more than 25 meetings, the Commission voted
20 to approve the draft map you see here.

21 Besides taking into consideration the
22 six criteria, the Commission also took into consideration
23 public comments provided during public meetings, round one
24 of public hearings, comments mailed in, e-mail,
25 hand-delivered, faxed, telephoned, and I'm probably missing

1 a couple more.

2 But overall there's been over 2,000 comments that
3 helped develop this draft map.

4 As you see here, some of the highlights of the
5 map, you can see two predominantly rural districts,
6 three border districts, two districts in the city of Tucson,
7 five districts that are entirely in Maricopa County, and it
8 avoids splitting Arizona's Indian reservations.

9 Much like the congressional draft map, the
10 legislative map followed a similar process.

11 Here we see the legislative map that was last --
12 that was developed by the last Commission, and it was most
13 recently used for the 2010 elections.

14 Again, per Proposition 106, the Commission started
15 with a blank slate.

16 A grid map was approved in August. Similar to
17 the, to the congressional map, the grid map only took into
18 consideration two of the six criteria, that being equal
19 population and compactness.

20 Which leads up to the draft map.

21 Arizona has 30 legislative districts. Each
22 district elects one senator and two house members.

23 The population in the old districts currently
24 range between 155,000 and 378 -- 378,000.

25 The new draft map has roughly 207 to 215,000 per

1 district.

2 To comply with the Voting Rights Act, the draft
3 map then includes 10 districts in which minority voters
4 should have the opportunity to elect their candidate of
5 choice.

6 The draft map includes three districts wholly
7 within Pima County, Districts 3, 9, and 10, and three
8 additional southern Arizona districts, 1, 2, and 4,
9 17 districts primarily within Maricopa County, District 12
10 and 15 through 30, and nine districts primarily rural, 1, 4,
11 5, 6, 7, 8, 11, 13, and 14.

12 As we stated -- as Commissioner as
13 Vice-Chair Freeman stated earlier, we want to hear your
14 input.

15 You have many different opportunities to fill
16 out -- to give us your input.

17 You can fill out a yellow request to speak form
18 and provide the Commission your input.

19 Examples of input might be thoughts on any of the
20 constitutional criteria, the congressional draft map, the
21 draft legislative map.

22 You can submit your input by speaking at the
23 hearing tonight or filling out one of these blue public
24 input forms or you can go to our website.

25 Our website, as we stated, is

1 www.azredistricting.org, or call us at (602)542-5221, or
2 toll free from within the state at 855-redistrict.

3 This is just a quick shot of the web page, and we
4 just wanted to point out a couple of features.

5 You will see that you can review the maps, and the
6 maps have -- the meeting information has meetings of past
7 meetings and current meetings, or past meetings and future
8 meetings, and all recordings of -- and streamed to the last
9 meetings.

10 And the public input form is where you would be
11 able to fill out some comments on the website.

12 The final draft maps can be found under the maps
13 tab, and within that is a tab called draft maps.

14 One of the features that you will be able to find
15 is, and this is a, I think, really helpful feature that
16 people have been -- have found useful to see where -- what
17 consists of the district is the KMZ file, which is also the
18 Google map.

19 In here you'll able to zoom in and get a good
20 sense of what your district looks like.

21 This is just a quick screen shot, and you can zoom
22 in further to see the exact streets that surround your
23 community.

24 Also, the Commission would like you to stay
25 connected. As we mentioned before, you can come visit us at

1 the website to draw your own maps, watch current meetings or
2 past meetings, get updates on future meetings, or you can
3 follow us at Twitter at /AIRC or friend us at Facebook.

4 Thank you very much.

5 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you, Mr. Drechsler.

6 All right. The next item on our agenda is the
7 public comment.

8 I have about 21, 22 requests to speak. If you do
9 want to speak to the Commission, use the yellow sheets in
10 the back, complete them, and give them to one of our staff,
11 and they'll bring it to me.

12 Given the number of requests, I think we're going
13 to ask that you try to limit your comments to about
14 four minutes.

15 And Mr. Forst will have the timer. When you hear
16 the buzzer go off, just do your best to try to wrap up as
17 quickly as you can.

18 If you have written materials, a map, or something
19 else that you want to submit to the Commission, our
20 executive director, Mr. Bladine, is sitting right over there
21 to my right, and just hand those materials to him. He'll
22 give them to us, and it will become part of our record.

23 Again, the purpose of this public comment hearing
24 and these series of public comment hearings is to get your
25 input on the draft maps.

1 So we're really interested in hearing specific
2 changes you may have to these maps, where you think the
3 lines should be moved to and why, or why these lines should
4 remain the same, if they are appropriate where they are, we
5 would be interested in hearing that as well.

6 If you have any thoughts or ideas on how your
7 changes might impact other districts and how they're
8 constituted, I would love to hear that as well, because it
9 is a complicated puzzle trying to fit together
10 nine congressional districts and 30 legislative districts
11 applying all six of the constitutional criteria.

12 It has not been an easy task, and I think your
13 input will be invaluable to us.

14 So when I call your name, please come up to the
15 podium. I would ask you to please state your name and spell
16 it so our court reporter has it, speak directly into the
17 microphone so that the people in the back can hear you and
18 people who are watching online can hear you as well. And
19 tells us, if you're representing yourself or some
20 organization, please let us know that. And give us the town
21 or county where you live, that would be helpful as well.

22 I think I'm now up to about 25.

23 So, okay, our first speaker is
24 Supervisor Mary Rose Wilcox.

25 SUPERVISOR MARY ROSE WILCOX: Members of the

1 Commission, thank you very much. Thank you for being in
2 this lovely, historic building too. We always like to
3 showcase Phoenix College.

4 I'm Mary Rose Wilcox, Maricopa County supervisor,
5 and I'm representing the Hispanic Coalition For Good
6 Government, and wish to thank you, members of the
7 Commission, for encouraging changes made to the
8 congressional doughnut map during the meeting in Tempe.

9 We believe that the IRC made significant progress
10 in addressing its prior serious concerns regarding the
11 direction of the doughnut map, the congressional one.

12 As with any progress that's complex as this, we
13 understand that not all of our concerns would be addressed
14 in one fell swoop.

15 What I would like to do is just outline
16 three areas we have concerns with, three kind of major and
17 one minor.

18 On the Congressional District 7 map, 7th Avenue to
19 43rd Avenue, between Bethany Home Road and Northern Avenue,
20 we believe this should be removed from the current
21 boundaries.

22 The reason we believe this is because you
23 basically -- Bethany Home Road is a dividing line between
24 Washington ASD and Madison ADS to the north of Bethany Home
25 Road and south of the streets, Alhambra ASD and Osborn.

1 Additionally 43rd Avenue and Bethany Home Road
2 going north is a municipal dividing line between Glendale
3 and Phoenix. So we believe we do more. The historic south
4 Glendale area has cultural and historic differences to the
5 areas just east of it.

6 The other area is 32nd Street to 48th Street
7 between McDowell Road and Thomas Road. This very much goes
8 into line with areas of like needs, and we ask this to be
9 added back into CD 7.

10 The other, Central Avenue to 7th Avenue between
11 Indian School Road and Camelback Road, we would prefer this
12 be added back in.

13 Again, there's neighborhoods, and this mirrors
14 more succinctly the lightrail that goes up to this area and
15 kind of ties everything together.

16 The other minor concern is west of 83rd Avenue,
17 north of Bethany Home Road. This had been in the area
18 earlier when we discussed it, and we would prefer it to come
19 back in.

20 But on the whole, once again, we're very, very
21 pleased that doughnut map was taken away and this was
22 brought forward.

23 The changes that are made are ones that we feel
24 are very good for the congressional.

25 On your legislative map, I have approached MALDEF

1 to do an analysis of the majority minority. And as soon as
2 I get that, we'll appear at one of the other hearings and
3 come. But at first glance, just from my experience, I think
4 that the growth of the Hispanic community is well
5 accommodated in these areas.

6 That is all.

7 Again, thank you very much.

8 And we serve as a resource if you want any special
9 meeting set up or hearings, we would be glad to accommodate
10 that.

11 Any questions?

12 Thank you very much.

13 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

14 Next speaker is Dulce Gonzalez.

15 DULCE GONZALEZ: My name is Dulce Gonzalez,
16 D-U-L-C-E, Gonzalez is G-O-N-Z-A-L-E-Z.

17 And I come as a resident of south Glendale.

18 First of all, I would like to thank the Commission
19 for keeping our community within Congressional District 7 in
20 the latest draft of the map. We have a lot in common with
21 the rest of the communities within District 7, so we
22 appreciate that.

23 However, I would like to ask that the Commission
24 remove the area east of 43rd Avenue and the area north of
25 Bethany Home from the current draft.

1 These areas do not share as much in common with
2 the rest of the communities in the district. They're not
3 like historical on south Glendale, central Phoenix, west
4 Phoenix, or south Phoenix.

5 And also 43rd Avenue provides a natural municipal
6 boundary between Glendale and Phoenix, which would allow for
7 the split.

8 Again, I thank you for keeping south Glendale
9 within District 7, and please consider incorporating these
10 areas into the new map.

11 Thank you for your time, your consideration, and
12 all of your hard work.

13 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

14 Our next speaker will be Bob Rosenberg.

15 And just so the people know who's on deck, the
16 next speaker will be Brian Aby.

17 I'd just ask you, when you come up to the podium,
18 don't be afraid to grab that microphone and get it right up
19 next to your mouth. It will help us up here to hear you.

20 BOB ROSENBERG: Thank you, Mr. Vice Chair, members
21 of the Commission, and counsel to the Commission.

22 My name is Bob Rosenberg, Bob, is spelled with one
23 O, Rosenberg is R-O-S-E-N-B-E-R-G.

24 The last time I met with you was in Burton Barr
25 Central Library in Nina Pulliam Auditorium. And at that

1 time I talked about how the atmosphere in the state
2 legislature was much more cordial and collegial. And I
3 talked about how Art Hamilton, who was the Democratic leader
4 in the house, was the person who led the fight to name that
5 library after Burton Barr, who was the Republican leader in
6 the house.

7 They were very good friends.

8 Tonight I'd like to talk with you about the
9 national legislature.

10 Ten years ago last July I was -- sometimes I choke
11 up because I'm an emotional person, and that doesn't bother
12 me. If it bothers anyone else, I hope that they are able to
13 deal with their internal conflict.

14 But last ten years ago last July, I was fortunate
15 enough to be in a very small group, five people, having
16 lunch with former governor from the United States,
17 Senator Paul Fannin.

18 Paul Fannin, as those of you who have been around
19 for a while know, was a staunch Republican.

20 When he became the junior senator from Arizona,
21 the senior senator was Carl Hayden, who was a staunch
22 Democrat.

23 Senator Fannin, when he arrived, was 99th in
24 seniority. And his -- since everything is assigned by
25 seniority, his office was way over in the distance in a coat

1 closet.

2 One afternoon the phone rang, and it was
3 Senator Hayden.

4 Senator Hayden said, senator, I understand your
5 office is over there.

6 That's right, senator, it is.

7 He said, well, Senator Hayden said, well, I
8 noticed that just down the hall from me there is some much
9 more comfortable office space, would you like more
10 comfortable office space, a little more elbow room?

11 Senator Hayden -- or Senator Fannin said, senator,
12 I am humbled and thankful that you offer me such a gracious
13 offer, but I hasten to remind you that I am 99th in
14 seniority here.

15 There was a long, pregnant silence on the line.

16 And Senator Hayden, who at the time was the
17 dean of senate, been in the Senate longer than anyone else,
18 dean of congress, been in congress longer than anyone else,
19 president pro tem, fourth in line for the presidency, and
20 chairman of senate appropriations commitment. Every dollar
21 this government spent had to march across his desk in order
22 to get spent.

23 Long, pregnant silence. Then Senator Hayden said,
24 senator, that's not the question that I asked you. Would
25 you like more comfortable office space?

1 Senator Fannin said, I would deeply appreciate it.
2 Then Senator Fannin told us, the movers arrived in
3 one hour.

4 While the two of them served together in the
5 United States senate, Senator Carl Hayden and Senator Paul
6 Fannin worked together like partners, as partners, doing the
7 people's business for the people of Arizona.

8 When the junior senator -- I heard the beep, I'll
9 close quickly -- when the junior senator from Arizona was
10 Barry Goldwater, he and Senator Carl Hayden worked together
11 as partners to do the people's business.

12 I'd like to see that kind of cordiality brought
13 back into both legislatures, and that's why I hope that you
14 will do everything in your power to create competitive
15 districts.

16 Thank you. And if there are any questions, I'd be
17 happy to answer.

18 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you, sir.

19 BOB ROSENBERG: Thank you.

20 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Next is Brian Aby, and on
21 deck will be Bill Engler.

22 BRIAN ABY: Vice-Chair Freeman,
23 Vice-Chair Herrera, Commissioner McNulty, my name is Brian
24 Aby. That's Brian with an I. Last name is spelled A-B-Y.

25 I'm here representing myself as a member of the

1 electorate, and I'd like to speak on the issue of
2 competitiveness, the item F in your guidelines.

3 First let me say I appreciate you coming to
4 Phoenix College. It's a beautiful college here in the
5 center of Phoenix. I live in current Legislative
6 District 11, which is about two miles north of here. And
7 this is very convenient for me tonight. Thank you very
8 much.

9 The issue of competitiveness to me is one of the
10 most important of the guidelines. I believe that right now
11 under the current map I think maybe there are three
12 competitive districts in the state of Arizona.

13 I'm not sure how many there are -- I'm speaking
14 now about the legislative map. I'm not sure how many there
15 are in the new map, the draft map that you all have
16 prepared, but I'm led to believe there may be seven or
17 something like that.

18 You could say that that's a dramatic improvement
19 over the current map, and indeed it is, and I commend you
20 for that improvement.

21 But I also would like to urge you that you can do
22 better.

23 I think that -- I have talked to people who
24 variously estimate that the number of competitive districts
25 could approach 10 or 12 in this state.

1 I am not sure what the exact number would be, but
2 I urge you in your deliberations to consider competitive --
3 competitiveness, excuse me, to be very importantly. Because
4 it's, in my mind, crucial.

5 We all know what the political climate is in
6 Arizona.

7 We know the existing effort to change the way that
8 we select candidates in the primary process.

9 And I think all of this is a symptom of a
10 situation which we are -- we move toward more extreme
11 candidates who are elected in primaries, and we have fewer
12 moderate people who make it through to run in general
13 elections.

14 And this is all part, in my mind, of the
15 competitiveness issue. And I hope that you will -- you've
16 done well, I think you can do better, and I would urge you
17 to do so.

18 Thank you very much for your time.

19 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

20 Bill Engler, who will be followed by Danny
21 Sullivan.

22 BILL ENGLER: Thank you, Vice-Chair Freeman,
23 fellow commissioners.

24 My name is Bill Engler, E-N-G-L-E-R. I live in
25 Anthem.

1 I'm addressing you on behalf of myself, and I'd
2 like to start by saying also I am the chair of
3 Legislative District 6 Democratic party.

4 The map, now I'll speak to the legislative maps.

5 I don't think there's any way you could redraw
6 these maps that would make people in my position, whether
7 they're Republicans or Democrats, very happy.

8 I've been very active in the party for nine years,
9 and after this I'm going to have to look again to work with
10 new people, as will my Republican counterparts.

11 However, you're not drawing this map for me, or
12 any other district chair or PC in the districts.

13 You're redrawing the maps for the people of the
14 state of Arizona.

15 I urge you because of that to please look for
16 competitive districts.

17 I know you can do better and still meet the other
18 constitutional criteria.

19 I echo the thoughts of the earlier speakers,
20 because in my legislative district our legislators are
21 elected in the Republican primary.

22 There are some cases where they're elected in the
23 Democratic primary.

24 It does not lead to good representation for the
25 people of Arizona.

1 I thank you for your time.

2 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

3 Danny Sullivan will be followed by Gina -- it
4 looks like Arts to me.

5 DANNY SULLIVAN: Thank you. My name is Danny
6 Sullivan, that's D-A-N-N-Y, S-U-L-L-I-V-A-N.

7 I come representing myself.

8 I'm a resident in the north Phoenix area in what's
9 currently Congressional District 3.

10 I want to thank you all for the hard work that
11 you're doing. It's greatly appreciated.

12 Also I would like to thank you for coming to the
13 decision to keep the north Phoenix area connected to the
14 Anthem, New River area.

15 Those are definitely communities of much shared
16 interest, and I really appreciate and I know a lot of us in
17 the area appreciate the decision you've made to keep those
18 areas connected.

19 I would like to suggest that Scottsdale Road is a
20 very logical boundary on the east side of our district.
21 It's been designated as a boundary for legislative
22 districts, and so it only stands to reason that if it would
23 be a very natural congressional district boundary.

24 So, I would like your serious consideration to
25 have Scottsdale Road as the boundary on the east side of our

1 district.

2 And also, again, I do appreciate what you did for
3 us in keeping those communities in north Phoenix and Anthem
4 and New River connected.

5 And I know there was quite a body of bipartisan
6 consensus that also kind of led to that decision.

7 And thank you again for allowing me to speak.

8 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

9 Okay. Gina Arts. If I'm mispronouncing that,
10 please correct me.

11 Will be followed by, it looks like, Julie Chaffin
12 or Chaffin.

13 GINA ARTS: Good evening. My name is Gina Arts.
14 I currently live in the Arcadia neighborhood.

15 As an Arizona native and a long-time resident of
16 the Arcadia neighborhood, my family's lived in several homes
17 throughout the valley and state. We've even spent some time
18 out of the country, but we always return back to the Arcadia
19 district.

20 It represents who we are.

21 I work in the movie industry, and we're constantly
22 redrawing our maps, and I understand how hard it is. It's
23 not an easy task.

24 However, I do know the bottom line is what's best
25 for the customer. We, the constituents, are the customer,

1 and we need to be represented as such.

2 After reviewing the proposed maps and attending
3 the redistricting meeting on Saturday, October 8th, I had to
4 ask myself if there was any semblance of common sense in
5 drawing boundary lines.

6 As a neighborhood we work together on many issues
7 that affect our entire community.

8 What we -- what you proposed would split the
9 Arcadia neighborhood.

10 I ask at the very least when you do these boundary
11 lines that you consider school district boundaries for --
12 instead of splitting neighborhoods in half and separating
13 them and putting them in neighborhoods where there's no
14 common issues involved.

15 At one point I was very surprised to see that you
16 had split that Arcadia neighborhood in the legislative
17 district.

18 And I do, Mr. Herrera, thank you for saying it
19 doesn't make sense to split that. And brought the line down
20 a little bit.

21 But I want to at least ask that you please use
22 those district boundary lines when proposing the cutoff.

23 It shouldn't affect, and especially in Arcadia
24 neighborhood, how you hit your demographics or any of the
25 other points that you needed to address when you get there.

1 So thank you very much.

2 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you.

3 VICE-CHAIR HERRERA: Spell your last name.

4 GINA ARTS: A-R-T-S.

5 VICE-CHAIR HERRERA: Thank you.

6 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Next is Julie, it looks like
7 Chaffin.

8 JULIE CHAFFIN: Chaffin.

9 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: She'll be followed by --
10 sorry, next on deck is Pamela Petty.

11 JULIE CHAFFIN: First name is Julie, J-U-L-I-E.
12 Last name Chaffin, C-H-A-F-F-I-N.

13 Thank you so much for allowing this opportunity to
14 express our opinions.

15 My husband and I have been residents of the valley
16 for 27 years, the last six in Paradise Valley, and the prior
17 16 in northeast Phoenix where our daughters attended the
18 Paradise Valley Unified School District.

19 And we feel very strongly about the connection
20 between our town of Paradise Valley as it links into Phoenix
21 through the Arcadia and Biltmore areas. This is the area
22 where we spent time supporting our children with their
23 activities, extracurricular endeavors, shopping,
24 worshipping, working, exercising, and relaxing.

25 When discussing the congressional redistricting

1 maps, I am in favor of joining Paradise Valley with a
2 contiguous and surrounding neighborhoods of Phoenix like the
3 Arcadia, Biltmore area.

4 It's our neighborhood, and I feel that there is
5 that community of common interest that is compact and
6 contiguous.

7 That there's also synergy within that area.

8 And as some of the gentleman had addressed, I
9 would ask that you would maybe look at the boundary of
10 Scottsdale Road to work within that area, and possibly even
11 look at, like, Indian School as the southern boundary for
12 marking that out.

13 I'd ask that you would keep, like, the north and
14 south side of Camelback Mountain together. I have concerns
15 about working with Tempe and kind of the way that district
16 was sort of put together.

17 But we would ask specifically about keeping
18 Paradise Valley with the neighborhoods that touch it, those
19 of the Arcadia and Biltmore region.

20 Thank you very much for your time.

21 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

22 Next is Pamela Petty, who will be followed by Jeff
23 Winkler.

24 PAMELA PETTY: Hello. I'm Pamela Petty,
25 representing myself, P-A-M-E-L-A, P-E-T-T-Y.

1 And like everyone who's come before, I would like
2 to thank you all for your hard work and diligence. I really
3 appreciate it, especially in light of criticisms you've
4 received.

5 I'm surprised and pleased to find myself in new
6 Congressional District 9, because so many people in this new
7 district share such similar educational, professional,
8 social, and economic backgrounds, so I'm just very tickled,
9 but I'm really here to talk about Legislative District 28.

10 I live in north central Phoenix, and I'm concerned
11 about the boundaries that you proposed.

12 It seems to me as a resident there that the
13 district doesn't satisfy either the requirement to include
14 either communities of interest nor the requirement for
15 competitiveness.

16 Regarding the community of interest criteria, it
17 seems to me that while I live in north central Phoenix and
18 have far more in common with people in the Camelback
19 corridor and with friends in midtown than with
20 Paradise Valley, which seems to be more closely aligned with
21 north Scottsdale in both social and economic interests.

22 As for the competitiveness in LD 28, I'm just
23 looking at your data, and I just started looking at it
24 today, and with 42 percent Republican registered voters and
25 28.2 Democratic voters, it doesn't seem to be very

1 competitive.

2 Your own competitive index shows a 14.6 percent
3 difference, which seems to be really very high.

4 So I urge you to reconsider the boundaries in that
5 district for those two reasons, communities of interest and
6 particularly the -- what appears to be a lack of
7 competitiveness.

8 Thank you very much for your work.

9 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

10 Jeff Winkler, followed by Karen Garrett.

11 JEFF WINKLER: Mr. Vice Chair, members of the
12 Commission, thank you for your service and thank you for
13 your time.

14 I know it's a burden on all of you, and I think
15 all of the citizens of Arizona, no matter what they think,
16 appreciate your service.

17 My name is Jeff Winkler, Jeff with a J,
18 W-I-N-K-L-E-R.

19 I'd like to address the proposed legislative map.

20 I do believe it's a good start, but I think
21 there's some more that can be done to address the
22 competitiveness issue.

23 The most recent poll of Arizona voters was
24 actually released over the weekend, it was in the Republic
25 on Monday, yesterday, and it was commissioned by the folks

1 that are advancing the whole idea of nonpartisan primaries.
2 And I think it's the first time that voters were actually
3 asked about how loyal they are to their own party.

4 And the poll turned up some pretty surprising
5 results.

6 It showed that a third of Republicans and a third
7 of Democrats contemplated some time in the next five years
8 changing their registration to Independent.

9 What does this tell us about the mood of the
10 electorate in Arizona?

11 It tells us that they're fed up with the
12 hyperpartisan nature of our politics, both within Arizona
13 and nationally and they're looking for candidates who will
14 bring us together.

15 At least that's what it tells me when I read that
16 poll.

17 Specifically, to my community of interest, I live
18 in Phoenix. I live in east Phoenix in the Arcadia
19 neighborhood, in the currently proposed LD 28. I would
20 really encourage you to take a hard look at keeping Arcadia
21 in a legislative district that includes the Camelback
22 corridor.

23 That is really where we live, where we work, where
24 we play is in the Camelback corridor along Camelback Road.

25 It would be great to see that route stay together.

1 In addition -- additionally, when it comes to city
2 of Phoenix politics, and the final process, we're part of
3 the Camelback Village East Planning Committee. We share
4 that with our neighbors in the Biltmore, and we have a
5 history of working very cooperatively as communities of
6 interest on city issues.

7 So I would encourage you to please consider
8 keeping the -- or at least considering the Camelback Village
9 East Planning Committee boundaries when you're contemplating
10 LD 28.

11 Thank you for coming.

12 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

13 Karen Garrett, to be followed by Ken Chevront.

14 KAREN GARRETT: Thank you, Vice Chair,
15 commissioners, and everyone else up there. And my name is
16 Karen Garrett, K-A-R-E-N, G-A-R-R-E-T-T.

17 I don't know how many people are here, but I've
18 almost watched every -- either in person or live meeting
19 that you've had.

20 I was sitting at home when you adopted the
21 congressional map.

22 I was flabbergasted, and I hate to be too
23 negative, but the word is appalled that you would spend the
24 whole weekend changing the maps, and then springing it on
25 them. The people that were there on Monday weren't the

1 people that would have been there to talk about what had
2 been transpired that day.

3 I didn't have the ability to get down there, so
4 today I'm speaking to that.

5 First you put Fountain Hills in. Then you take
6 Fountain Hills out. Then you put it in, then -- now it's
7 out.

8 That is not taking into consideration their rights
9 to have communities of interest.

10 Fountain Hills has been in the current LD
11 District 8.

12 They have been part of north Scottsdale. The
13 people that live there work in Arizona, in the Maricopa
14 County area. And now because you've been lobbied, I
15 believe, I don't know this for sure, by Flagstaff and other
16 communities that want their communities of interest, you're
17 now taking out Fountain Hills and Apache Junction.

18 This is not acceptable, and I hope that somehow
19 someone will get the point that this is not protecting our
20 rights.

21 And that's basically all I had to say.

22 You're not going to -- communities of interest is
23 more important.

24 I know there's been argument about
25 competitiveness, but it is to be considered, and

1 competitiveness can be considered if all the other
2 considerations are met. And this consideration for
3 Fountain Hills has not been met.

4 Thank you.

5 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

6 Ken Chevront, followed by Barney Switzer.

7 KEN CHEUVRONT: Hi, good evening. Ken Chevront,
8 C-H-E-U-V-R-O-N-T, very similar to the restaurant at
9 Central.

10 I come as a citizen and also as a former
11 legislator. I represented central Phoenix, which we're in
12 the middle of, for 16 years. And I want to first give you
13 accolades for everything you've done.

14 Jim Hunt -- Jim, Jim Huntwork is a very good
15 friend of mine, and over the last ten years we've spoken
16 about the trials and tribulations he went through as being a
17 commissioner.

18 So I definitely know what you're going through.

19 What I want to talk about first, I think you've
20 done a good job of going through the map. My concern is
21 what I call the bat district, which is 24.

22 And what -- a district that I had represented a
23 long time, but I went through three different machinations
24 of history. And it seems like central Phoenix is always
25 given what anybody else doesn't want or try to bring in

1 areas that really have no community of interest.

2 This one does a better job than the existing one,
3 but the challenges you're bringing to two reservations, both
4 the Salt River Pima and Fort McDowell into central Phoenix,
5 so you're taking a district that pretty much has a
6 cohesiveness and bringing it in an area that really has no
7 commonality. And you make it go all the way up to the
8 Beeline Highway, which is very concerning.

9 That's not a lot of residents, and I know that
10 you're looking at trying to, you know, create districts that
11 meet certain criteria, but I think if you put that area in
12 Tempe or another one, you can still meet those criteria
13 without really alienating them from the rest of central
14 Phoenix.

15 Scottsdale is another reason. I heard a person
16 speaking earlier trying to keep different -- southern
17 Arcadia with northern Arcadia and also keeping it within the
18 Scottsdale School District.

19 If you look at the southern part of Scottsdale,
20 which you put in this district, that is the Scottsdale
21 School District which is similar to most of Arcadia and
22 Scottsdale with the town of Paradise Valley.

23 Unlike central Phoenix which is mostly made up of
24 Phoenix Elementary, Osborn, and Madison.

25 And so I think by putting those areas -- if you

1 could put those areas whether up in different District 28
2 or -- so it's not such an odd configuration, I think that
3 would do well long term.

4 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

5 Barney Switzer, followed by Ken Clark.

6 BARNEY SWITZER: Hi. I'd like to say thank you
7 for your service, and I am going to speak on
8 competitiveness.

9 If you look at statewide races, you see the
10 Republicans have a 10 percentage point advantage, about
11 50 percent -- 55 percent in this state.

12 That said, in statewide races they're close when a
13 Democrat is highly qualified and has a clean record, and
14 when the Republican challenger is not clean.

15 But this gives a sense of where Arizona is. This
16 has nothing to do with what you're doing.

17 The same is not true in congressional and
18 legislative districts. We can easily find examples of
19 incompetent, borderline corrupt representatives elected in
20 state districts due to the dynamics of primary elections
21 with too many or too few competitors.

22 Are vote splitting primaries with too many
23 candidates vying for a safe seat followed by term limits or
24 retirement really the way we want to select our
25 representatives?

1 Competitive districts provide a safeguard against
2 this. Competitive districts are not an advantage for
3 Democrats. They aren't an advantage for moderates and
4 centrists. They're an advantage for sane people.

5 So is this what the draft maps provide? Not
6 really. The drafts offer a handful of competitive
7 legislative districts. Less than half of the congressional
8 districts are competitive.

9 And how are the uncompetitive districts divided?
10 In a state that polls at 55 percent Republican, of
11 legislative districts with a 15 percent spread or more,
12 65 percent are safe Republican seats.

13 And in a state that is 55 percent Republican, of
14 congressional districts with 15-point spread, 67 percent are
15 safe Republican seats.

16 If you make the assumption that Republicans will
17 still take the competitive districts half the time, that
18 leaves them with over 60 percent of the congressional
19 delegation and the legislative delegation.

20 That's higher than 55 percent.

21 Okay.

22 That gives the Republicans a louder voice than
23 they would have under a truly representative system.

24 But, okay, it's an extremely difficult job. I
25 understand that.

1 They already have that advantage.

2 So why are some Republicans upset at these maps?

3 They've controlled the state legislature for
4 decades. Do these draft maps threaten that control? No.

5 If you think about it, it makes sense. There is
6 no such thing as enough for partisans. They follow an
7 ideology that elevates self-interest and greed above all
8 other human values. They will never have enough. They
9 can't be appeased.

10 Thank you.

11 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Ken Clark, followed by Jean
12 McDermott.

13 KEN CLARK: Thank you, commissioners. My name is
14 Ken Clark, C-L-A-R-K, co-chair of the Arizona Competitive
15 Districts Coalition.

16 I want to -- just general comments. The next
17 30 days are all about public input, obviously. And what we
18 want to speak to or I want to speak to is how to make that
19 public input process a little more user friendly.

20 The four points in that regard.

21 First, the Commission still has not defined
22 competition.

23 The regular user needs this to be able to look at
24 a map and see what's really going on.

25 And the Commission ten years ago did not define

1 competition until it was too late.

2 And then they used the JudgeIt model, but after
3 all these decisions had already been made, and that was the
4 one of the reasons they found themselves in court. And I
5 hope this Commission doesn't make the same mistake.

6 If you look at one of the maps for legislative,
7 for instance, you've got this central Phoenix district with
8 this what I call an airplane rudder that goes out to the
9 McDowell Mountains.

10 You can look at that and you can't even tell --
11 there are ways, I suspect, to make that central Phoenix
12 district more competitive, but you can't really tell by
13 looking at the maps or any of the data sheets.

14 For several reasons.

15 There are -- there's no executive summary of the
16 data.

17 For instance, I come to these meetings, and
18 there's a nice spreadsheet that shows Voting Rights Act,
19 voting age population, competition measures. Even if I
20 disagree with those competition measures, it's all laid out
21 there for me.

22 When you go on the website, you have one
23 spreadsheet that is a compilation of where different
24 districts break out into cities, and it tells you the
25 Voting Rights Act measure for that city, but it doesn't tell

1 you for the whole district.

2 So if you want to get in there and really dig in
3 and give you guys the specific suggestions that you deserve,
4 it's very difficult to do that, because you can't say, well,
5 I can't take from that district because of the Voting Rights
6 Act district, because it's not part of -- it's very
7 difficult to see what's going on.

8 You see what I'm saying?

9 The other problem, for instance, well, the
10 competitiveness spreadsheet as well shows one type of
11 measure for competitiveness.

12 Now, I understand, even though I'd like to see you
13 come up with a definition for competitiveness, I understand
14 that there are several ways to measure competitiveness.

15 There's straight registration, and it has its
16 problems. And there's performance, and it has its problems.

17 Well, give us two columns. Give us one for
18 straight registration and one for performance.

19 It would -- it allows the public a more user
20 friendly interface, more or less, to be able to see what's
21 going on.

22 The -- again, I mention the executive summary
23 would be a really great way to just pull that down and see
24 what's going on.

25 We've got folks who have come to me and said they

1 want to get on Maptitude and start playing with these
2 district lines and give you some ideas.

3 Well, it's not -- the new lines are not on
4 Maptitude yet. I'm told they'll be up there tomorrow. But
5 for the next 30 days, that's what people that I'm speaking
6 with want to do.

7 And it's great that folks are coming to you and
8 asking for greater, greater competitiveness. Of course we
9 like that.

10 We also understand that you all need specifics.

11 So help us help you help us help the state.

12 May give you some specifics.

13 Thanks.

14 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

15 Jean McDermott, followed by Polo Martinez.

16 JEAN MCDERMOTT: My name is Jean McDermott,
17 J-E-A-N, capital M-C, capital D-E-R-M-O-T-T.

18 And I am representing myself, and I'd like to
19 thank you for all the time and effort that you're putting
20 in. I know it's a hard job to please everyone.

21 I'm concerned about the District 28, in my
22 position is about 14th Street and Maryland. And I am
23 concerned with the legislative district in particular, is
24 that I don't feel that -- I do not have a connection feeling
25 with Paradise Valley or Arcadia.

1 I consider more my home and my interest and where
2 I do is more north central, Madison School District.

3 And for the last ten years we've been in 11, but
4 all the years before that we were with north central area.
5 And I feel much more connected with that area. And that's
6 my concern, that we prefer to be back in with the district
7 considered north central, which would be west of 51 in the
8 area.

9 And just have more in common with it. And I shop
10 in central Phoenix, north Phoenix. My grandchildren go to
11 Madison School District.

12 My interests are with the Irish Community Center
13 and the Phoenix Art Museum, and I don't go to
14 Paradise Valley or to Scottsdale or Arcadia.

15 Thank you very much for your time.

16 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

17 Next is Polo Martinez, followed by Francisco
18 Avalos.

19 POLO MARTINEZ: Good evening. Thank you,
20 commissioners, staff, and everyone in the audience.

21 I was born and raised in New Mexico --

22 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Sir, could you state and
23 spell your name, please?

24 POLO MARTINEZ: Sure. Polo, P-O-L-O, Martinez.

25 I was born and raised in New Mexico, but I retired

1 here in Arizona, although I get back to New Mexico
2 frequently.

3 And perhaps if you're that kind of individual
4 going back and forth between the two states, you recognize
5 how very different they are.

6 As I live here in Arizona, sometimes as both a
7 Hispanic and a Democrat, I feel very disenfranchised.

8 However, I'm told that those who are optimistic
9 live a longer life. So I'm constantly looking for reasons
10 to be optimistic.

11 I'm encouraged by a recent vote of yours, four to
12 one, that says we will proceed with the options that we have
13 identified now in trying to get to the best designation
14 districts that we possibly can.

15 That 4-1 vote to me is similar to -- it's amenable
16 to what the Supreme Court does. You can always count on
17 them coming back with 5-4 decisions. And, you know, oh,
18 what's that going to mean? You know, we're in trouble. We
19 could go 5-4 either way.

20 But when you see a 6-3 or 7-2 vote, you start
21 feeling very confident that even if you were on the losing
22 side, there's probably some reasons that you've missed that
23 say, hey, that decision is the way it should affect me.

24 That's the feeling I see when I look at 4-1 or 5-0
25 vote.

1 So I heartily encourage you to continue with your
2 4-1 and 5-0 endeavors. It makes all of us, Democrats and
3 Republicans, I think, take heart that based on those, those
4 elements that you see in arriving at your decisions have
5 convinced you through power of reason and logic to come up
6 with the option that you select.

7 Now, I'd like to speak to only one of those issues
8 of the six that you consider, and that has to do with what
9 many others have been talking about here, and that's
10 competitiveness.

11 I feel that as much as you may want one
12 neighborhood in another, the convenience of the closest and
13 proximity of mutual interest, that the element of
14 competitiveness is so important because it allows people in
15 those particular districts to come forward with ideas and to
16 battle on the basis of ideas and not on givens, not on
17 assumptions that based on the demographics that we have here
18 we could therefore go forward without making reasonable,
19 hard, logical arguments to persuade people to come up to the
20 decisions that we want them to come up with.

21 So, as a footnote, the more competitive the
22 districts can be, the more uniform and unified you can be in
23 thrusting forward with your decisions, the more confident
24 and optimistic and therefore more long living I can be.

25 Thank you.

1 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Francisco Avalos, followed by
2 Wes Harris.

3 FRANCISCO AVALOS: Good afternoon. My name is
4 Francisco Avalos, that's F-R-A-N-C-I-S-C-O. Last name is
5 A-V-A-L-O-S.

6 And I live in the 32nd Street and Thomas Road
7 area, south of Arcadia.

8 Mr. Vice Chair, members of the Commission, I come
9 before you to thank you for all the hard work you put in to
10 creating the congressional and legislative maps.

11 I think the Commission drew Congressional
12 District 7 in a way that would meet the Voting Rights Act,
13 and people in our district are grateful for that.

14 I stand before you today, however, to make one
15 suggestion that I hope you'll take into consideration when
16 drawing the final map.

17 I live in a neighborhood that was taken out of
18 Congressional District 7.

19 I don't know why I was taken out, but I know that
20 this is why the Commission has asked the public to come out
21 and let you know about our concerns with the draft maps.

22 I want to request that the Commission adjust
23 Congressional District 7 so that Thomas Road remains as the
24 boundary, at least between 32nd Street and 48th Street.

25 In taking my neighborhood out of District 7 and

1 putting me into District 9, you include me with the Arcadia
2 neighborhood, Tempe, Ahwatukee, and Chandler.

3 My neighborhood has never been in the same
4 district with those neighborhoods.

5 I would just like to say that my neighborhood is a
6 minority-majority area, low-moderate income levels, and has
7 a lot more in common with the rest of District 7 not 9.

8 I care about my community, and I want to advocate
9 what is best for its future representation. And for this
10 reason, I would like to ask the Commission to please place
11 our neighborhood back into Congressional District 7 again.
12 Again, the areas are 32nd Street -- between 32nd Street and
13 48th Street, between Thomas Road and McDowell.

14 Thank you very much for your time and
15 consideration.

16 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

17 Wes Harris, followed by Robert Meza.

18 WES HARRIS: Good evening, Wes Harris, W-E-S,
19 H-A-R-R-I-S.

20 Mr. Vice Chair, commissioners, and staff, few have
21 attended as many of these proceedings as I have.

22 I was on hand when you held your first meeting
23 which was in a room not nearly large enough to have all that
24 came.

25 And I've been to virtually every meeting in

1 reasonable driving distance from Phoenix since, save the
2 last two, the past weekend.

3 Because of the requirements of the open meetings
4 laws, these proceedings were far from efficient and as such
5 far from interesting as well, due to a long, dramatic time
6 spent adjusting lines on the screens. But at times they
7 were captivated by short periods of interesting and sadly
8 too many times petty and childish exchange and ramblings by
9 two of the members of this Commission.

10 Both have been interested only in the agenda at
11 the detriment of the Commission, the state, the citizens in
12 state, the constitution of the state, and the nation.

13 Nor has the chair been fair and independent,
14 siding with the two Democrats on every vote of substance,
15 including the unilaterally designed congressional district
16 map that pleases only one segment of the voting population
17 of this great state.

18 And that segment is the minority-majority
19 Democrats.

20 More specifically, the Hispanic Coalition For Good
21 Government, namely Representative Ed Pastor, Raul Grijalva,
22 and Supervisor Mary Rose Wilcox.

23 Regarding competitiveness, which seems to be an
24 issue that everyone is talking about, let me share with you
25 some of the mathematical statistics about the population of

1 this state.

2 Assuming a population of six and a half million,
3 broken down into 36 percent Republicans, that's 2.3 million,
4 34 percent Independents, which is 2.2 million, and
5 30 percent Democrats, which is 1.9 million, it is clear that
6 the Democrat party is a minority party in this state.

7 Based on this breakdown of the map that existed
8 on Friday, I did not see this map online, and it's still not
9 up online so I couldn't deal with the specifics of this
10 current version of the legislative district map, the number
11 of Democrats in the minority-majority districts equals
12 795,000.

13 So they're basically packed in those districts.

14 To which you add another 109,000 Native Americans,
15 for a total of 904,000 on a -- leaving just over a million
16 to be spread to 23 different districts.

17 This will give the other districts a two-to-one
18 ratio versus the Independents and the Republicans.

19 If split evenly through the rest of the state,
20 this would equal only 45,000 Democrats in each of the
21 remaining of 23 districts with populations of 210,000 per
22 district.

23 A clear minority.

24 To achieve more Democratic leaning districts would
25 entail severe gerrymandering, which the chair has allowed

1 Commissioner McNulty do virtually single handedly in direct
2 violation of the preamble in Prop 106, which precludes
3 gerrymandering.

4 To say that I'm happy -- unhappy with the outcome
5 is putting it mildly.

6 A comment from the chair sums it up, and I quote:
7 We cannot make everyone happy, and if I did make someone
8 happy, then I should take back everything I gave them.

9 That was a week ago.

10 Well, the fact is that these maps only make one
11 segment of the state happy, and that is the minority
12 Democrats.

13 Far too many and too much time was spent on the
14 minority-majority districts, both congressional and
15 legislative, to the detriment of the majority of the voters
16 in the state.

17 The people in Yuma wanted to be together and not a
18 part of Tucson congressional district.

19 Representative Grijalva's interest won out over
20 theirs.

21 The Native Americans also expressed that they
22 wanted all to be together in one district.

23 And yet, again, Representative Grijalva's
24 interests won out over theirs.

25 The citizens of Fountain Hills wanted to be with

1 their community of interest in Scottsdale, yet they are now
2 with Bullhead City.

3 The citizens of my community in Moon Valley wanted
4 to remain with their communities of interest north of
5 North Mountain, yet you put them with those south of
6 North Mountain.

7 In short, this Commission has been anything but
8 independent and anything but fair and balanced.

9 I'm almost done.

10 It has made a travesty out of openness and
11 transparency. It has, in my opinion, abused its power,
12 wasted tens of thousands of taxpayer money hiring
13 controversial consultants and attorneys, hired an attorney
14 to defend their questionable actions in court rather than
15 answer a simple question probed by our taxpayer funded
16 Attorney General's Office, and elongated these proceedings
17 to the benefit of the mapping consultant by virtue of what I
18 think is an ill-conceived contract provision that was set up
19 to make their contract competitive, which it will turn out
20 to be terribly uncompetitive when this is over.

21 The spirit of Proposition 106 was to provide a
22 fair and balanced approach to redistricting.

23 This Commission has had a chance to be a true
24 servant of the citizens of the state, and I submit to you
25 failed miserably and let us all down for partisan reasons.

1 There are two on this Commission that I believe
2 tried desperately to satisfy the spirit of Proposition 106,
3 but there are three of you who have voted unfairly.

4 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

5 Robert Meza, followed by John Beaulieu.

6 REPRESENTATIVE ROBERT MEZA: Thank you,
7 commissioners. Robert Meza, M-E-Z-A.

8 I just want to say what an excellent job you've
9 done in minority-majority districts. The four on the west
10 side of Phoenix, they're excellent. Those are Districts 19,
11 27, 29, and 30.

12 The thing I do need to mention is that under the
13 Hispanic voting age population, each of the districts, the
14 19, 27, 29, and 30, fall below the 50 percent range.

15 There might be a red flag with the
16 Justice Department, but as it is currently they will pass
17 the Justice Department test.

18 And I just wanted to say excellent job, thank you
19 for all your time.

20 Are there any questions?

21 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

22 REPRESENTATIVE ROBERT MEZA: Okay. Thank you.

23 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: John Beaulieu, followed by
24 Senator Steve Gallardo.

25 VICE-CHAIR HERRERA: Just for the record, that was

1 a representative?

2 JOHN BEAULIEU: Good evening, Mr. Vice Chair and
3 panel.

4 It's John Beaulieu, spelled B-E-A-U-L-I-E-U.
5 First name is J-O-H-N.

6 I'm chair of the District 15 Democrats, and I
7 represent the Democratic Party, which is
8 D-E-M-O-C-R-A-T-I-C, not the Democrat party.

9 This is the first time I've really had a chance to
10 look at the maps in printed form, and I'm excited to be part
11 of the new CD 9.

12 And my only -- I wouldn't say it's a criticism of
13 the legislative district map, but I'd like to see the
14 boundary go back up to Indian School Road and run flat out
15 to -- which I believe is Pima Road.

16 Let me check that real quick.

17 I'm having a little trouble following where it
18 goes out to -- out to Alma School Road.

19 No, that's incorrect.

20 Sorry, I'm having a hard time reading the map.

21 But, anyway, I'd like to see that flattened out
22 through 28 and 23, to bring us out to the Salt River part
23 of the district, and say that as a former chair of the
24 central Phoenix area, we would be proud to bring in the
25 people out in the Fort McDowell and Salt River Indian

1 reservations.

2 Thank you.

3 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

4 Senator Gallardo, followed by Judy Whitehouse.

5 SENATOR STEVE GALLARDO: Thank you,

6 Mr. Vice Chairman, members of the Commission. Thank you for
7 the opportunity to address you today.

8 First of all, for the record, my name is
9 Senator Steve Gallardo, state senator from District 13
10 southwest Phoenix.

11 I'm here representing the Minority Coalition.

12 We have been on the phone and looking online for
13 the last 24 hours talking back and forth.

14 The actual coalition is still reviewing the actual
15 map. We do, at least for the most part, understand that
16 there are some recommendations that we are going to bring
17 forward.

18 What we'd like to do is be able to look at the
19 entire state, working with Tucson representatives as well,
20 to come before the Commission, probably in the next week or
21 so, with some official recommendations throughout the state
22 of Arizona in regards to many of the minority districts.

23 We also want to be able to have an opportunity
24 to -- once we make those recommendations and have final
25 analysis of the actual map, is be able to take a step

1 backwards and start looking at it from a whole and see where
2 could we make competitive districts if necessary.

3 I mean, if once we established our minority
4 districts be able to step back and say, hey, you know, by
5 making this small, little change, perhaps we can make one
6 district more competitive than the current map.

7 So that's one of the things we want to look at.

8 So far, as Supervisor Wilcox also indicated, the
9 districts were created for the most part for growth. I
10 think that's important to be able to look at, not only for
11 2012, but for the next ten years, how are these districts
12 going to look like and try to project that.

13 I know that's kind of difficult, but we would try
14 to do our best to project at least for the next ten years.

15 So we're taking that into consideration as well.

16 But we do hope to be able to come with a list of
17 some recommendations to the Commission in regards to
18 minority districts and hopefully some recommendations and
19 possible changes for the purposes of competitiveness as
20 well.

21 So with that, I want to thank the Commission for
22 their hard work.

23 I monitored online over the last -- particularly
24 the last three weeks or so, but I monitored quite often
25 online, and I do want to thank the Commission for the hard

1 work.

2 I know it's not an easy task.

3 Been there, done that, several times here at the
4 county. So I understand the difficulties, and, and hope
5 that at the end of the day we'll have a map that's fair for
6 the entire state of Arizona.

7 Thank you for your hard work.

8 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

9 Judy Whitehouse followed by John Hire(sic).

10 JUDY WHITEHOUSE: Hi. It's good to see you again.

11 I've testified before, and I've expressed my
12 appreciation to both vice chairs and Commissioner McNulty,
13 and I'm sorry the other two aren't here, but hopefully I'll
14 see them before you are done with your work.

15 I do appreciate everything you've done.

16 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: And, Ms. Whitehouse, could
17 you state your name and spell it?

18 JUDY WHITEHOUSE: Oh, yes. It's Judy, J-U-D-Y,
19 Whitehouse, W-H-I-T-E-H-O-U-S-E.

20 And I hope also that you appreciate the level of
21 citizen participation and input that you've had, because I
22 think it's been outstanding.

23 We have -- I've heard personally so many really
24 good comments to help you with your work.

25 My involvement in this process comes from my

1 involvement in election fairness issues. I have been an
2 inspector at the polls. I've been working with election
3 integrity groups to make sure that all people have a chance
4 to vote if they're eligible and that their vote is counted
5 accurately.

6 That's important, but so is this process that
7 you're doing right now. Because without drawing lines that
8 reflect our Arizona population, which is about one third
9 Republican, one third Democrat, one third Independent, if
10 you draw lines that disrespect the Independents because
11 they're all safe Republican and Democratic districts, that
12 to me is not fair.

13 And even though I belong to a party, I don't want
14 unfair races. I want fair, competitive races.

15 And since this process is to set legislative
16 boundaries for the state legislature, that is what we should
17 be concentrating on as communities of interest, that speak
18 to the state legislature.

19 Cities and counties and school boards have their
20 own boundaries. They have their own communities of
21 interest.

22 They do not affect what we should have for our
23 legislature.

24 Same with our congressional boundaries.

25 Competitiveness that takes into account the one

1 third Independent, one third Democrat, one third Republican,
2 give or take, is what we should be doing to make sure that
3 our congressional representatives represent Arizona and not
4 just a few.

5 So I'm glad that maybe we'll get some better input
6 so we can evaluate this and give you some more specific
7 directions.

8 But that was what I would ask of you.

9 Now I know you're doing the best job you can. I
10 appreciate all the work. And I appreciate all my fellow
11 citizens for their work too.

12 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

13 John Hire, followed by Phyllis Rowe.

14 JOHN HINZ: Could that be John Hinz?

15 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: It very well could be. It
16 is. Sorry.

17 JOHN HINZ: Before my time begins, I'd like to
18 comment on your input.

19 I came early to sign in. The sign-in sheets are
20 currently these blue comment forms to fill out. I filled
21 out one. It wasn't till you told us that we had to fill a
22 yellow comment form, which were not on the table, for me to
23 be able to speak.

24 On the other hand, although I did come early, I
25 had a chance to listen to all the other people. So now let

1 me begin.

2 Commissioners, staff, fellow citizens, my name is
3 John Hinz, H-I-N-Z.

4 I'm a senior citizen and a native of Phoenix.

5 Welcome to Phoenix College, my alma mater.

6 I'm disappointed.

7 Before I say that, my condolences, no matter what
8 you do, you're going to get complaints, so but nevertheless
9 I am disappointed.

10 This is the shirt I wore while I was gathering
11 signatures to create this Commission, because I was so
12 dissatisfied with the politicians gerrymandering their own
13 districts.

14 For the last redistricting, how much better did we
15 do?

16 Well, if I don't vote in the primary, there's no
17 sense in me voting because that's where the person is
18 elected.

19 We're getting, with some nice exceptions, we're
20 getting the most extreme of the most extreme representing us
21 in the legislature.

22 And I firmly reject the notion that only someone
23 of my ethnicity can properly represent me.

24 I am of European extraction. Some of the
25 sleaziest politicians are of European extraction.

1 One of my best representatives was Art Hamilton,
2 who happens to be of African heritage. So I respectfully
3 reject that.

4 I would point out that I agree with most of the
5 speakers. We do need competitiveness.

6 You'll see it on this shirt here. Better seen on
7 back.

8 We have compact, mostly rectangular districts. We
9 urge you to work more towards that than this gerrymandered
10 whatever.

11 We also suggest that, yes, Republicans have
12 majority. Give them one district.

13 And let the other eight be competitive.

14 This was much easier when Carl Hayden was our only
15 representative, represented the whole state.

16 It wasn't much harder when Rose Javincoff
17 (phonetic) represented all of this.

18 But now you've got nine where you've got to really
19 move those arms around.

20 But I would, I would agree with almost everybody
21 else.

22 It isn't, it isn't someone who represented me who
23 makes a difference in the legislature. It's the entire
24 competition of the legislature, who probably will vote
25 against my own representative, no matter what his ethnicity

1 is.

2 So I wish -- I would urge you more to consider
3 that and to make them more competitive.

4 Thank you very much.

5 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

6 Phyllis Rowe, followed by Steve Muratore.

7 PHYLLIS ROWE: I'm Phyllis Rowe, P-H-Y-L-L-I-S,
8 R-O-W-E.

9 This is the fifth redistricting that I have been
10 through since I've lived in Phoenix.

11 And I've come to several of them, and I think
12 you've done a remarkably good job. You've gotten numbers so
13 that they're pretty close, they're similar.

14 The last one had some districts that were -- that
15 extended all the way across Maricopa County almost, and they
16 were very hard for the candidates to navigate.

17 I'm concerned about the commonality of new
18 districts. And I was hoping that perhaps the district that
19 I was looking at, particularly District 28, and I'd like to
20 see it end at Central Avenue, where, where there is a
21 difference from the east to the west there.

22 And also I would like to see it go just south of
23 Camelback Road perhaps, to Highland, rather than all the way
24 down to Indian School Road.

25 This way you could have the Arcadia area all

1 together.

2 And I urge you to take the school districts into
3 consideration also.

4 Because when you go over the school districts, it
5 seems to create a problem.

6 Now, I ran for legislature three times, and each
7 time it was in a different district.

8 The districts change. And I know that you've got
9 the problem with doing, doing the districts in, in this -- I
10 think you've done a remarkably good job considering all the
11 ones that I've testified before. At least they're compact
12 districts, and I think you've done a good job there.

13 And I thank you very much for your service, and I
14 hope you'll consider changing District 28.

15 Thank you.

16 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

17 Steve Muratore, followed by Rosie Lopez.

18 STEVE MURATORE: Thank you, Mr. Vice Chairman,
19 commissioners.

20 My name is Steve Muratore. I publish the online
21 blog the Arizona Eagletarian.

22 As you know, I'm concerned that the district maps
23 you give us for the next year -- ten years are made
24 according to Prop 106 mandate requiring you to draw fair and
25 competitive districts.

1 The draft maps you have adopted do not meet that
2 constitutional requirement, necessarily.

3 The congressional map provides four safe districts
4 for Republicans and only two for Democrats, and those two
5 happen to be voting rights districts.

6 Now, arguably only three districts are
7 competitive.

8 This is, in my opinion, an unacceptable lack of
9 compliance with the Arizona Constitution.

10 In addition, where I live on the Salt River
11 Pima-Maricopa Indian community has been drawn into a very
12 heavily Republican district that, if left as is,
13 disenfranchises me and my neighbors for the next ten years.

14 To me this is intolerable. I have shown you where
15 I live during the previous meetings, and believe it is
16 critical for you to correct this oversight.

17 As to the legislative draft map, the most
18 optimistic view, as I could tell from looking at the
19 competitiveness report, is that only eight districts were
20 even close to being competitive.

21 Eight is not enough.

22 I obtained from redistricting expert Tony Sissons,
23 pursuant to news items he had published in 2010, background
24 for his assertion that more than ten legislative districts
25 could easily -- more easily than not be made competitive.

1 A map that I presented to you on Sunday in Tempe,
2 and which I have posted on the Arizona EagleTarian, shows at
3 least 12 competitive districts can be drawn because outside
4 Maricopa County nearly equal number of voters are registered
5 Democrat as opposed to Republican.

6 Democratic.

7 Therefore I assert that you are legally required
8 to provide substantively more competitive districts than the
9 three to eight -- depending on the index used to measure --
10 would result from this draft legislative map.

11 As I have watched the process closely over the
12 last year, I very much appreciate the personal sacrifices
13 that each of you have made. And I, I respect all of you
14 tremendously. And the hard work you've put into the
15 process.

16 I am confident, however, that on these maps you
17 can and must do better.

18 Thank you.

19 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

20 Rosie Lopez, follow by Ester Duran Lumm.

21 ROSIE LOPEZ: Good evening. My name is Rosie
22 Lopez, R-O-S-I-E, L-O-P-E-Z.

23 And this is my third time here testifying.

24 And I want to thank the Commission, first of all,
25 for all their good work and keeping all the different

1 communities of interest together.

2 I think you've done a great job, especially in
3 District 16 where I am currently living, now known as a --
4 your proposed District 27.

5 I want to speak on Isaac -- rather, the district,
6 what is it, 13 and 14. I'm not sure which one it is. I
7 think it's 29 and 19.

8 And lived in Isaac School District for 44 years,
9 and I know what the district looks like and I know what the
10 commonalities are in communities of interest. But I know --
11 but I do also know that the historic districts are not in
12 line with those -- with that area, and there are no
13 commonalities there.

14 And I would urge you to remove the historic
15 district from those areas, because I know that they are not
16 the same.

17 They don't have communities of interest.

18 And the other thing is I would urge you to also
19 take a hard look at Buckeye, Litchfield, Luke Air Force
20 Base, and those districts, District 29 and 19.

21 I also feel that they have no commonalities there.

22 I cannot speak for Tucson, but I also see
23 Litchfield there and I think it's kind of strange that
24 District 3 would be part -- Litchfield would be part of
25 District 3 for the congressional district.

1 As I say, I don't speak for Tucson. I don't live
2 in Tucson. I live in south Phoenix. So I cannot say too
3 much about it. But it just kind of perked me up on that
4 one, and I hope that you take a hard look at it -- at that.

5 Now, with regards to my congressional district,
6 currently District 4 and your proposed District 7, I would
7 ask the Commission to consider removing Bethany Home Road
8 and Northern Avenue, between those areas, and 43rd and
9 7th Avenue. There are no commonalities there either.

10 And especially with historic Glendale and areas
11 south of Bethany Home Road.

12 And I would also ask you to consider adding, as
13 Mr. Avalos stated this evening, the areas from 32nd Street
14 and 48th, and McDowell and Thomas. I think those
15 districts -- that those areas have been -- have communities
16 of interest there with us, and I ask you to consider adding
17 them back.

18 Thank you so much.

19 I appreciate your hard work. And I know it's a
20 lot of work, but I thank you so much for allowing us to
21 speak here tonight. And I hope that you take my
22 recommendations into consideration.

23 Thank you.

24 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

25 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Ester Duran Lumm, followed by

1 Mike Stevens.

2 ESTER DURAN LUMM: Thank you. First of all, thank
3 you to all of the Commission and everyone involved with
4 these maps.

5 I sure wouldn't want to be in your shoes. I think
6 you worked really hard and we do appreciate it, especially
7 the chance to give you our input.

8 I'm here representing -- my name is Ester,
9 E-S-T-H-E-R. The last name is Lumm, L-U-M-M.

10 I'm here representing myself.

11 I've been a precinct committeeperson since I moved
12 into the Litchfield Park area. That is not actually the
13 city of Litchfield Park, but it's part of the
14 Dreaming Summit that's north of Camelback.

15 I'm looking at your maps where you have now put
16 our neighborhood into district -- Legislative District 13.

17 And if you turn it sideways, it looks really cute,
18 almost like Felix the cat, with two little gerrymandered
19 peaks there that you could make it look like a cat. But I
20 don't know why people think that Dysart Road is the magic
21 western boundary. It should actually be Litchfield Park
22 Road -- Litchfield Road, I'm sorry.

23 You didn't do it to District 19. You stayed
24 straight out with Litchfield Road, but then when you got
25 just above Indian School, that's where you went in, back to

1 Dysart Road.

2 I can tell you that being a precinct
3 committeeperson that we have absolutely nothing in common
4 with anything west of Luke Air Force Base.

5 There's a lot of business there, there's a lot of
6 empty lots, and then there's a lot -- like Verrado, which
7 have absolutely nothing in common with, but we have a lot
8 of, a lot in common where we shop. Everything that we do is
9 with District 29.

10 So we would very much appreciate it if you would
11 just kind of scoot that line back over to Litchfield Road,
12 between Indian School on the south and Northern on the
13 north, and just scoot it out to Litchfield Road where it
14 really makes more sense in terms of commonality, communities
15 of interest.

16 And just wanted to briefly mention one other
17 thing.

18 I heard some comments about some of the minorities
19 having too much of their weight.

20 The fact is that if you look at the population and
21 what representation we should have, and speaking here as a
22 Latina, we really don't even get as many districts as we
23 should.

24 So I thank you for what you have done. And we
25 should actually have more, both congressionally and

1 legislatively.

2 Thank you for your time.

3 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

4 Mike Stevens, followed by Sherry Williams.

5 MIKE STEVENS: Good evening. And thank you,
6 members of the Commission.

7 My name is Mike Stevens, M-I-K-E, S-T-E-V-E-N-S.

8 I live in Mesa right now, but I'm actually an
9 Arizona native, lived here my entire live. I don't know if
10 that gives me any more credibility, but I'll throw it out
11 there.

12 In my time here in Arizona, I've actually lived in
13 pretty much in every area of the Phoenix metropolitan area,
14 north Phoenix, south Phoenix, central, Mesa, Tempe,
15 Glendale.

16 So that's when I really started following the
17 redistricting process, I got pretty excited. You know, the
18 last ten years we've had a pretty lopsided legislative -- at
19 least locally, legislative districts. And so I got excited
20 at the chance of something that would truly reflect the real
21 demographics of this state, where we are closer to a third
22 Republican, a third Democrat, a third Independent.

23 Suffice it to say that I am a little disappointed
24 in the maps as they stand right now.

25 2008 we had five of these seats congressionally

1 controlled by Democrats. Today we have six of eight
2 controlled by Republicans. And I show that -- I think that
3 sort of demonstrates actually we had a lot of
4 competitiveness at the congressional level.

5 Now, despite the fact that we've gained a
6 congressional district, we seem to have taken a step back
7 there where only three of those congressional districts are
8 competitive.

9 But my real concern is actually the legislative
10 maps.

11 With 50 percent basically of these legislative
12 districts being controlled by Republicans, which would make
13 sense if 50 percent of the state was registered Republican,
14 that creates a really daunting thing where essentially
15 months before the election has ever happened, Republicans
16 know and voters know that Republicans will control the
17 house, they will control the state senate.

18 And that does put us in a sort of a situation
19 where if you're not a Republican, if you're a Democrat or if
20 you're an Independent who leans to the left, the only thing
21 you have to look forward to over the last next ten years is
22 the hope that some competent Democrats can win majorities in
23 those six competitive legislative districts.

24 And that won't give you good government and that
25 won't win you a productive government. It would give you a

1 gridlocked government.

2 We're looking at a ten-year situation where the
3 best, if you're not a Republican, that you have to hope for
4 is gridlock.

5 And that doesn't speak for very well to
6 competitiveness in a state where it really is a third
7 Republican, a third Democrat, and a third Independent.

8 Thank you.

9 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

10 Sherry Williams, followed by Laura Copple.

11 SHERRY WILLIAMS: Good evening.

12 My name is Sherry Williams, S-H-E-R-R-Y, B as in
13 boy, Williams, W-I-L-L-I-A-M-S.

14 Thank you for the opportunity to give my comments.

15 Good is not good enough when great is an option.

16 You have the opportunity to do something great.

17 Not only in Arizona, but in this nation.

18 I live in what is currently Legislative
19 District 15, which now is the proposed LD 24, which is a
20 joke.

21 We have all the tools and all the technology. We
22 can do better. We deserve better.

23 What if partisan politics were put aside.

24 What if you simply did the right thing.

25 What if the Arizona Redistricting Commission would

1 set a standard for our nation in fairness on redistricting.

2 What if you, the Arizona Redistricting Commission,
3 would put on a cloak of justice and put the interest of all
4 Arizonans front and center.

5 What if you could show our youth that Arizona is
6 not crazy.

7 What if you would take advantage of this teachable
8 moment.

9 What if we took advantage of all of the resources
10 that we have so that the future of our young people, they
11 would actually know that we're concerned about what happens
12 in the future.

13 Your goal is to maximize competitiveness and
14 fairness.

15 What if you actually did what you were
16 commissioned to do.

17 What if you came up with real competitive
18 districts.

19 What if you cared about Arizonans having real
20 representation.

21 What if you did all this.

22 It would allow citizens to be fairly represented.

23 You would break the chains of unfairness.

24 You would set the tone for all commissions in this
25 nation.

1 You would actually make history in a positive way
2 for Arizona for a change.

3 You would all be heroes and sheroes.

4 However, if you don't break the cycle of
5 unfairness, you will continue to threaten democracy as we
6 know it.

7 But what if you truly did what you were
8 commissioned to do.

9 You would have an opportunity to do the right
10 thing.

11 This is the time. It's now. It's not ten years
12 from now.

13 We deserve better.

14 Remember, good is not good enough when great is an
15 option.

16 We have all the tools we need to do what needs to
17 be done.

18 Thank you for your time, and thank you for
19 allowing me to speak.

20 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

21 Laura Copple, followed by Andy Gonzales.

22 LAURA COPPLE: Good evening. Laura, L-A-U-R-A,
23 Copple, C-O-P-P-L-E.

24 I want to thank the Commission in giving us all
25 this opportunity to enter our comments into the public

1 record.

2 I spoke to you on Friday in Tempe.

3 And I want to go into a little bit more detail
4 about the 2009 ruling by the Arizona Supreme Court regarding
5 competitiveness.

6 And before that time, and I know you all know
7 this, but we have people behind me who don't seem to value
8 competitiveness in terms of the criteria set out by the
9 redistricting law of 2000.

10 So I'd like to read what the justice said about
11 competitiveness.

12 The direction that competitiveness should be
13 favored unless one of two conditions occurs does not,
14 contrary to Commission's assertion, mean that the
15 competitiveness goal is less mandatory than the other goals,
16 can be ignored, or should be relegated to a secondary role.
17 The constitutional language means what it says. The
18 Commission should favor creating more competitive districts
19 to the extent practicable when doing so does not cause
20 significant detriment to the other goals.

21 Practicable means can be put into practice. It
22 does not mean practical or if we choose to.

23 When must the Redistricting Commission consider
24 competitiveness?

25 And according to Justice Hurwitz, he says delaying

1 consideration inevitably threatens to relegate the
2 competitiveness goal to precisely the secondary role that
3 the court correctly abjures.

4 I agree with much of what has been said here
5 tonight, and favor more competitive both congressional and
6 legislative districts, especially the legislative districts
7 seem to be way out of balance right now.

8 And just want to go on record saying that I think
9 this is your moment.

10 I love what Ms. Williams had to say about doings
11 great things here for the next ten years for all Arizonans.

12 I appreciate this opportunity.

13 Thank you.

14 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

15 Andy Gonzales, followed by Randall Holmes.

16 ANDY GONZALES: Hello. My name is Andy Gonzales,
17 A-N-D-Y, G-O-N-Z-A-L-E-S.

18 From historic Glendale, and I'm representing
19 myself.

20 Madam Chair, members of the Commission, I come
21 before you today to thank you all for all of the hard work
22 and for keeping our community in Glendale within
23 Congressional District 7.

24 We have a lot of commonality with other
25 communities in this district, south Phoenix, Maryvale,

1 Laveen, Guadalupe, and Tolleson, and feel best represented
2 when our communities are all together.

3 I would just like to suggest to the Commission
4 that it make small alterations of this draft map.

5 I don't think that the areas north of Bethany Home
6 Road and east of 43rd Avenue are similar to the communities
7 I just mentioned, so I think it would be best if 43rd Avenue
8 and Bethany Home Road remain the boundaries in northeast
9 area of Congressional District 7.

10 Thank you, commissioners, for all your hard work
11 thus far. You're doing a great job.

12 Thank you.

13 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Randall Holmes, followed by
14 Scott Saari.

15 RANDALL HOLMES: Hi, folks.

16 Sorry we all couldn't be here tonight. Excuse me.

17 I spoke to you before about competitiveness, and
18 it's still the top of my list for priorities.

19 First of all, a little history. There may be a
20 few people left who don't know the origin of the word
21 gerrymandered. It was originally pronounced gerrymander,
22 named after Elbridge Gerry, one of our founding fathers, who
23 managed to draw himself a district in Massachusetts that
24 someone remarked was shaped like a salamander, thus
25 gerrymander.

1 When a district is drawn to sacrifice compactness
2 in favor of favoring one candidate or one party or faction
3 or the other, that's what we call a gerrymander.

4 I guess Mr. Gerrymander should draw himself a
5 district to favor his own election or something like that.

6 When you sacrifice compactness in favor of
7 competitiveness, that is not a gerrymander.

8 And I guess the words have been tossed around kind
9 of loosely.

10 You can call that a salamander district, but you
11 can't call it a gerrymander district.

12 As far as communities of interest goes, we have to
13 think about the word interest, and what we call the public
14 interest, excuse me, as opposed to special interest, private
15 interest, regional, parochial interests. And we all have
16 conflicts of interest.

17 We all have interests that we hold dear, the
18 general public interests as well as our personal interests,
19 and we have to balance those competing interests.

20 But I still maintain that all interests are best
21 served when the public interest is served. And if the
22 legislature is truly competitive, then all interests are
23 better served because all legislators have to compete for
24 your vote.

25 I am one of the most partisan Democrats you'll

1 ever meet. And I don't care what Senator Joseph McCarthy
2 called our party, and still done today, the reptilian party
3 can call us whatever they want. I don't care.

4 It's trivial. It's a weapon of mass distraction.
5 Let's not waste time on that.

6 But I would rather have 30 districts that are
7 competitive, and I would rather not have even one district
8 that was a safe Democratic district, because getting enough
9 Democrats to make one district safe takes Democrats away
10 from the other districts. And I want all districts to be
11 competitive. That's my ideal.

12 And whatever of that we have to sacrifice, so be
13 it.

14 But, all interest is best served when the public
15 interest is served.

16 Thanks.

17 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

18 Scott Saari, and then Dennis Burke.

19 SCOTT SAARI: Council members, and counsel, and
20 Mr. Herder.

21 As a former court reporter, I can speak to the
22 legendary reputation of your court reporter, and I feel good
23 about the record.

24 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Just make sure you state and
25 spell your name correctly.

1 SCOTT SAARI: My name is Scott, last name is
2 Saari, S, as in Sam, A-A-R-I.

3 I've kind of -- I've been a member -- or a
4 resident of Arizona since 1982.

5 I came to go to ASU as a music student under a
6 full teaching assistantship.

7 After I graduated with my degree in classical
8 guitar, I struggled to make a living in teaching, including
9 here at Phoenix College.

10 And I actually performed a concerto on the stage,
11 so this is a special room for me.

12 I'm fairly newly active in politics, and I
13 don't -- I'm afraid I don't understand the technical nature
14 of the maps that you're trying to draw, but I do appreciate
15 the difficulty that you're under here.

16 And I've also been dismayed to hear that you have
17 to be distracted by what I think is a frivolous
18 investigation that really has no basis but intimidation.

19 And I feel that this intimidation spirit is what
20 is dominating politics in Arizona. And I am totally against
21 it.

22 It's something that we have to fight as a people.

23 And I understand you have a lot of goals to
24 achieve. To me nothing is more important than our
25 democracy, and nothing is more important to democracy than

1 fairness in the legislative maps.

2 And that means they have to be competitive.

3 Otherwise there will be no way, no hope, for either party or
4 for both parties to really compete.

5 And we just cannot afford to have that kind of
6 politics in our country as we preach to the rest of the
7 world the virtues of democracy.

8 It's, it's really important that we practice what
9 we preach here. And it comes down to this level, I feel,
10 and I appreciate your work, but I really feel like I
11 represent a lot of people who don't usually get involved in
12 this kind of thing, as one who's new to it, to say that.

13 The ones that don't have a voice are the ones that
14 really have to be protected too.

15 And I think everybody would agree that
16 competitiveness is a primary consideration.

17 Thank you for your time.

18 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

19 Dennis Burke, followed by Bill Roe.

20 DENNIS MICHAEL BURKE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman,
21 commissioners.

22 My name is Dennis Michael Burke, B-U-R-K-E.

23 With Bart Turner and Ann Eschinger a dozen years,
24 I was one of the people who drafted the program and asked
25 the citizens to approve it.

1 And so I would like to thank you for your service
2 and also apologize for the many abuses to your time and
3 sensibilities that we may have brought upon you.

4 Regarding competitiveness, I would like to suggest
5 a mental touchstone that might be useful to you. And that
6 is that every vote should count. Every Arizonan should feel
7 that their vote counts.

8 And that means that as many contests as possible
9 should be decided at the general level, not at the primary
10 level.

11 And to the extent that you can do that without
12 creating a map that looks like lizards wrestling, is, is, is
13 the project.

14 Also, we vote as individuals and we vote as
15 members of the communities. That also is a challenge for
16 balance.

17 But if you will keep in mind, as sort of a
18 democratic, and I would say big D democracy ideal, we want
19 as many Arizonans as possible to think that their vote
20 counts. That's, that's the essence of democracy.

21 So competitiveness is not meant to be a second
22 tier value at all in this process.

23 We just hope that you can do it, and we trust that
24 you can do it with some -- honoring some of these other
25 values as well.

1 Thank you very much.

2 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

3 Bill Roe.

4 BILL ROE: Good evening. Thank you very much.

5 I'm Bill Roe, B-I-L-L, R-O-E, from Tucson, Pima
6 County, southern Arizona.

7 And I want to thank you, as everyone else has.
8 I've been to a lot of these. I know how much time you're
9 spending on them.

10 I've played with the lines a lot. And I
11 understand the difficulty. Every time you change some of
12 these, it's like a waterbed mattress. You punch here, and
13 it jumps up somewhere else every single time you change
14 something.

15 I could come and ask you to adjust the line in my
16 neighborhood. The new line cuts right across my
17 neighborhood association in a legislative district. And in
18 several similar things.

19 But that's really not very important when you look
20 at a bigger picture.

21 And I am very, very concerned about representation
22 for southern Arizona, for Tucson. And I'm pleased that the
23 map -- the legislative map now does not take the opportunity
24 to cut out representation in southern Arizona.

25 I think it is incredibly important that we have

1 competitive districts in southern Arizona.

2 I think it is particularly important for the
3 University of Arizona to have strong delegation protecting
4 it and the entire university system.

5 The universities in this state are incredibly
6 important economic drivers. The business community
7 recognizes that. And we need to have districts set up --
8 you've heard the same thing I think from Flagstaff in
9 particular, but we've got to have districts that will affect
10 and support our university system and our K through 12
11 system.

12 We cannot have a successful business community
13 here, a successful business environment, without that.

14 So thank you very much, continue your good work,
15 and good luck with your waterbed.

16 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

17 And we have one more.

18 Kenneth Jones.

19 KENNETH JONES: Good evening. My name is Kenneth
20 Jones. That's Kenneth, and I think everyone can spell that.
21 And J-O-N-E-S.

22 I'm here on behalf of myself.

23 And I'd like to thank the commissioners for all
24 your work. You've been given a pretty thankless task, but I
25 think you deserve thanks.

1 I'm here to speak on -- in support of the
2 legislative district boundaries as proposed for the west
3 valley, west Phoenix, Avondale, and southwest Goodyear,
4 which in the proposed map includes District 19, 29, 21, 20,
5 and 30.

6 Competitiveness is important, but I'm pleased to
7 see that these maps are largely rectangular, but obviously
8 due to how city boundaries zigzag and don't necessarily
9 follow white lines like 43rd Avenue, Bethany Home Road,
10 Dysart Road, et cetera, are still basically rectangles.

11 And keep these cities contiguous and compact and
12 will allow maximal representation for those cities. Allow
13 Avondale for once to elect possibly a city councilman, a
14 representative, or a senator.

15 And due to the growth, say, in Glendale, it will
16 maximize their ability to elect two or three or four or five
17 house members and increase senators.

18 And of course we've had huge Hispanic growth in
19 the west valley in that same area. And I am happy to see
20 that these districts have been included as part of the
21 minority-majority district proposals, you know, for the
22 legislature.

23 However, I do propose some changes slightly, and I
24 have a quick map that I made copies for each of you.

25 The area immediately south of my district -- and

1 I'll hurry this along -- District 29, Wigwam Creek, which
2 you guys are referring to Wigwam Creek South and the
3 Rio Crossing neighborhood, are actually in the city of
4 Avondale. And I believe they should be taken from
5 District 29 and moved into District 19. That moves
6 4,859 people, as of 6:00 o'clock this morning playing with
7 the numbers, by moving the community immediately to our west
8 of Dysart Road, known as Dreaming Summit, north of the
9 Culture Creek Wash.

10 That would move 4,877 people back into District 29
11 as proposed.

12 And that actually is still a good fit for us
13 because both my HOA, which is known as Wigwam Creek North,
14 and the Dreaming Summit community are within Glendale's
15 annexation easement, and, in fact, are currently attached by
16 territory within the actual city of Glendale at the
17 intersection of Glendale Avenue and Dysart Road.

18 So even though it looks gerrymandered as I drew
19 the legislative map, it fits. This narrow area south of
20 Maryland Avenue, all the way down to Camelback Road, and the
21 homes south of the Wigwam Creek -- excuse me, the Culture
22 Creek Wash, these are all custom built homes, on quarter
23 acre, half acre, and one acre lots. So they share a
24 commonality, and that leaves that area south of Maryland
25 down to Camelback bounded on the east by 129th Avenue within

1 District 13.

2 That moves 912 people out of District 29, in
3 proposed District 13.

4 It also keeps those people with Litchfield mailing
5 address, which they currently have.

6 And since both of our two areas, Dreaming Summit
7 and Wigwam Creek, are within Glendale's annexation easement,
8 we will eventually be annexed by Glendale, as required by
9 the legislature, sort of fixed it, as you'll recall a couple
10 years ago, when we had the problems with strict annexation.
11 The cities are now required to annex contiguous parcels as
12 they extend outward, and both of our parcels would have to
13 be annexed next.

14 So it would be a good fit to have Dreaming Summit
15 drawn into proposed District 29.

16 Thank you very much for your time. And good luck
17 with the rest of the month.

18 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Do you want to give your map
19 to our executive director?

20 KENNETH JONES: Just want to make sure I don't
21 pick up some other people's stuff here.

22 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: That was my last request to
23 speak form.

24 If there's anyone else, anyone out there who has
25 competed a form and would like to address the Commission,

1 please raise your hand.

2 All right then. Well, that concludes our public
3 comment. Thanks to everyone for coming out and providing us
4 with your insights.

5 Thanks to Phoenix College for hosting.

6 Before we adjourn, I'd like to turn it over to my
7 fellow commissioners to see if they have anything to say
8 before we close out here tonight.

9 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you for coming.
10 Thank you for your precise input dealing with the maps and
11 your particular concerns. It's a very important process,
12 and the input of citizens like you, the kind like we've
13 heard tonight, is extremely helpful. Thank you.

14 VICE-CHAIR HERRERA: Yeah, I think I've said this
15 numerous times. This is probably my favorite part of the --
16 of being in the Commission, is coming and listening to
17 people speak about the maps and how we should either move
18 them, keep them the same, or things that we've done wrong,
19 things we've done well.

20 And this is, this is fun. I really enjoy that,
21 and I appreciate you being here tonight instead of being
22 home with your families and watching TV.

23 We will be in Payson, I think, tomorrow.

24 And I would appreciate if you have family members
25 that live in the area or nearby, that they care about this

1 process, invite them to attend. Whether competitiveness is
2 important to them or other criteria, I think we should have
3 the public participating at each one. And so encourage your
4 family, friends to attend all of them if possible.

5 Thank you so much. Have a good night.

6 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thanks. We'll be in Payson
7 tomorrow night, Flagstaff on Thursday, Window Rock, Arizona,
8 on Friday. On Saturday we'll be up in Eager, Springerville,
9 in the morning, and then in the afternoon we'll be in
10 Hon Dah just outside of Pinetop.

11 And beyond that I am not exactly sure. But if you
12 go to our website, you'll see the entire schedule laid out
13 for the next three weeks.

14 Okay, folks. Thanks, everyone, for coming. Have
15 a good evening.

16 We'll adjourn the meeting at 8:14.

17 (Whereupon, the meeting adjourned.)

18
19
20 * * * * *
21
22
23
24
25

1 STATE OF ARIZONA)
)
2 COUNTY OF MARICOPA) ss.
3

4 BE IT KNOWN that the foregoing proceeding was
5 taken before me, Marty Herder, a Certified Court Reporter,
6 CCR No. 50162, State of Arizona; that the foregoing 89 pages
7 constitute a true and accurate transcript of all proceedings
8 had upon the taking of said meeting, all done to the best of
9 my skill and ability.

10 DATED at Chandler, Arizona, this 15th day of
11 October, 2011.

12

13

14

C. Martin Herder, CCR
Certified Court Reporter
Certificate No. 50162

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25