

**ARIZONA INDEPENDENT REDISTRICTING COMMISSION**

October 15, 2011  
3:03 p.m.

**Location**

Hon-Dah Resort - Casino  
777 Highway 260  
Pinetop, Arizona 85935

**Attending**

Colleen C. Mathis, Chair  
Scott Day Freeman, Vice Chair  
Linda C. McNulty, Commissioner

Ray Bladine, Executive Director  
Buck Forst, Information Technology Specialist  
Joe Kanefield, Counsel, Ballard Spahr

**PREPARED BY:**

AZ Litigation Support, LLC  
Michelle D. Elam, CR  
Certified Reporter  
CR No. 50637

Pinetop, Arizona  
October 15, 2011  
3:03 p.m.

CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Good afternoon.

This meeting of the Arizona Independent Redistricting Commission will now come to order.

The time is 3:03 p.m. on Saturday, October 15th.

And let's start with the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Pledge of Allegiance was recited.)

CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Well, it's great to see so many of you here at the Hon-Dah Resort and Casino in our second round of public hearings. We were here during the first round and had a great crowd as well. So glad you're all back to provide input today.

The primary purpose of our meeting today is to get input from you. We're here to listen, and the whole -- the topic will be the draft congressional and draft legislative maps that the Commission has approved.

So we're looking forward to hearing what you have to say. And if you would like to speak with us, please fill out a yellow request to speak

1 form that you should have seen on the way in.

2 And if you're not interested in speaking  
3 at the podium today, you can fill out a blue sheet  
4 and your comments will still be entered into the  
5 record just the same as if you had stood at the  
6 podium and said them.

7 So two easy ways to come give us input  
8 today. And you'll be hearing more about that in a  
9 little bit from our presentation, but I just wanted  
10 to point that out early.

11 So let's have roll call.

12 Vice Chair Freeman.

13 VICE CHAIR FREEMAN: Here.

14 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Vice Chair Herrera.  
15 Commissioner McNulty.

16 COMMISSIONER MCNULTY: Here.

17 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Commissioner Stertz.

18 And just so everyone knows, all of the  
19 commissioners aren't attending necessarily all of  
20 the meetings. In fact, all of the meetings we've  
21 had so far in the second round, there's just been a  
22 subset of the Commission at each of them.

23 We're going to 26 places across the  
24 state, so we're kind of divvying them up among the  
25 commissioners. So I'm sure Vice Chair Herrera and

1 Commissioner Stertz are watching this via streaming  
2 or will be watching it once they have an opportunity  
3 to do so. Because it will be all recorded and you  
4 can pull it up on your computer at home at a later  
5 time. All of our hearings are available on our  
6 website to watch.

7 Other folks at the table today, we have  
8 legal counsel, Joe Kanefield and our mapping  
9 consultant, Andrew Drechsler.

10 Way to cover, Ray.

11 RAY BLADINE: I don't know what's setting  
12 it off, a mic.

13 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: And our chief  
14 technology officer, Buck Forst.

15 Our executive director, Ray Bladine, and  
16 we also have a court reporter, Michelle, who is  
17 taking an accurate transcript of today's meeting.

18 We also have public outreach coordinators  
19 in the back Karen Herrman and Shane Shields, and  
20 please feel free to talk to any of our staff if you  
21 have any questions or need anything throughout the  
22 meeting, they will be happy to help you out.

23 We also have some translators today.

24 By federal law, we are required to  
25 translate -- provide translation services for

1 anybody who needs them, and today we have three.  
2 And we'll ask each one of them to come up and say a  
3 few words in their native languages and provide the  
4 opportunity for translation services for anyone who  
5 might need them.

6           So I'll start with Carlos Reyes, he is  
7 our Spanish translator today.

8           CARLOS REYES: Good afternoon, Madame  
9 Chair Mathis and commissioners.

10           Ladies and gentlemen, in accordance with  
11 the Voting Rights Act and translator -- a translator  
12 and interpreter will be available at the public  
13 hearings in order to provide translating  
14 interpreting services that might be needed for those  
15 citizens that need translating or interpreting  
16 services.

17           Please contact the translator and  
18 interpreter present at the meeting so that he or she  
19 can assist you.

20           And now I will read the transcript in  
21 Spanish. (Speaking in native tongue.)

22           The interpreter for Apache and Navajo  
23 will also come up and read the script in their  
24 language.

25           CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you, Carlos.

1           Our next interpreter is Bonnie Lewis, for  
2 Apache.

3           Thank you.

4           BONNIE LEWIS: Okay. Hello to Apache  
5 speakers. (Speaking in native tongue.)

6           Thank you.

7           CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

8           And our last interpreter is Louise  
9 Kerley, for Navajo.

10           LOUISE KERLEY: Yá'át'ééh, Chair Mathis.  
11 (Speaking in native tongue.)

12           CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

13           So with that, I think we'll go over to  
14 our mapping consultant, Andrew Drechsler, and he'll  
15 be giving us a presentation on the process.

16           ANDREW DRECHSLER: Thank you very much,  
17 Madame Chair.

18           Good afternoon. Thank you very much for  
19 being here today.

20           As the Chair mentioned, we are going to  
21 make -- the purpose of this meeting today is to  
22 present the draft maps.

23           The draft maps are currently under a  
24 30-day review period, which means -- one of the big  
25 reasons we are here today is we want to hear your

1 opinions on the maps.

2           Before we start with the maps, we just  
3 wanted to give a quick overview of the process.

4           Arizona's redistricting process is  
5 governed by the State Constitution, as amended by  
6 voters in 2000 with the passage of Proposition 106.

7           It stipulates that Arizona Independent  
8 Redistricting Commission redraw Arizona's  
9 congressional and legislative districts to reflect  
10 the results of the most recent census.

11           Due to the 2010 census, Arizona gained a  
12 congressional seat, so we're going from eight seats  
13 to nine seats.

14           What are the guidelines of Proposition  
15 106?

16           These are the six rules that are sort of  
17 governing the map drawing.

18           A, must comply with the United States  
19 Constitution and Voting Rights Act.

20           B, equal population.

21           Just a reminder, criteria A and B are  
22 federally mandated, which means we have to have  
23 those two.

24           The other six are part of the State  
25 Constitution and are to the extent practicable.

1 C, contact and contiguous; D respect  
2 communities of interest; E, use physical geographic  
3 features, city, town, and county boundaries and  
4 undivided census tracts, and not favor competitive  
5 districts where no significant detriment to other  
6 goals.

7 We just want to cover the Voting Rights  
8 Act.

9 Arizona's congressional and legislative  
10 districts must receive preclearance or approval from  
11 the Department of Justice or a federal court under  
12 Section 5 of the Voting Rights Act before they can  
13 take effect.

14 To get preclearance, Arizona must  
15 demonstrate that the new districts do not  
16 discriminate against minority voters in purpose or  
17 effect, which means that there can be no intentional  
18 or accidental discrimination.

19 Understand Section 5, Arizona's  
20 redistricting plans cannot be retrogressive. The  
21 plans cannot weaken or reduce minority voters'  
22 rights.

23 The presence of discrimination can be  
24 determined by analyzing population data and election  
25 results.



1           We wanted to quickly go over the timeline  
2 of the entire Commission.

3           There's six main steps involved with the  
4 commission.

5           The first step was setting up the  
6 Commission.

7           Earlier this year, commissioners were  
8 appointed through a thorough screening process. And  
9 all of the commissioners are serving in a voluntary  
10 capacity.

11           The Commission members are Scott  
12 Freeman, vice chair, who is with us today; Jose  
13 Herrera, vice chair; Chairwoman Colleen Mathis, who  
14 is here today; Commissioner Linda McNulty, who is  
15 also here today; and Commissioner Richard Stertz.

16           The second step was the first round of  
17 hearings.

18           Before drawing a single line, the  
19 Commission held 23 public hearings around the state  
20 in July and August to get input from members of the  
21 public about issues relevant to redistricting, such  
22 as geography, communities of interest, minority  
23 voting rights and competitiveness.

24           Then started the map, step 3.

25           Per Proposition 106, we're to start with

1 a grid map, which means that we are not supposed to  
2 take into consideration any of the past lines.

3 This was approved on August 18th. And  
4 only two considerations -- two of those six criteria  
5 were taken into consideration, that being equal  
6 population and compactness.

7 Since adopting the grid maps, the  
8 Commission has met more than 25 times to consider  
9 adjustments to the grid map to accommodate all of  
10 the State's constitutional requirements. During  
11 this time they received additional public comments  
12 and draft map.

13 Approval of the maps.

14 On October 3rd, the Commission approved  
15 the draft congressional map that incorporated the  
16 changes based on all of the constitutional criteria  
17 and the public comment that we heard. It then  
18 approved the draft legislative map on October 10th,  
19 just Monday of this week.

20 We're currently in step 4, the second  
21 round of hearings.

22 We're currently visiting 25 towns and  
23 cities around the state to share the draft maps and  
24 receive additional public opinion during the month  
25 of October.

1 Step 5, final maps.

2 Upon completion of the public comment  
3 period, the Commission will adopt final maps.

4 And the final step in the process is  
5 preclearance.

6 Because Arizona is subject to Section 5  
7 of the Voting Rights Act, the district map must be  
8 approved by the federal Department of Justice or a  
9 federal court in Washington D.C. before they can be  
10 used for the Arizona elections.

11 Before we show you the draft  
12 congressional map, we just wanted to go through the  
13 process.

14 This was the last map -- this was the map  
15 that was approved by the last commission and most  
16 recently used in the 2010 elections.

17 Per the proposition -- per Proposition  
18 106, we started with a blank map and then the -- one  
19 of first steps we did was draw the grid map.

20 And again, the grid map only takes into  
21 consideration the equal population and compactness  
22 and is meant as a starting point for the draft maps.

23 After more than 25 meetings, the  
24 Commission voted to approve the draft map that you  
25 see here.

1           Besides taking into consideration the six  
2 criteria, the Commission took into consideration  
3 public comments provided via public meetings, round  
4 one of public hearings, comments mailed, e-mailed,  
5 and faxed and telephone into the Commission.

6           Over 5,000 public comments were inputted  
7 to help development of this map. And as you see  
8 here, some of the highlights of the map, it includes  
9 two predominantly rural districts, three border  
10 districts, two districts in the city of Tucson, five  
11 districts that are entirely in Maricopa County, it  
12 avoids splitting Arizona Indian reservations and two  
13 districts where minority voters have the opportunity  
14 to elect a candidate of their choice.

15           This map -- there's a wall size of this  
16 map in the back of the room as well.

17           The legislative map went through a very  
18 similar process. This was the legislative map  
19 developed by the last Commission and the most  
20 recently used for the 2010 elections.

21           Again, Proposition 106 required us to  
22 start with a blank slate, and this was the grid map  
23 for the legislative that was developed and approved  
24 on August 18th.

25           The legislative draft map, some

1 highlights -- the old districts that you saw a  
2 couple slides ago currently have population of  
3 155,000 to 378,000. So the new draft that you see  
4 here has populations of 207,000 to 215,000.

5 To comply with the Voting Rights Act, the  
6 draft map includes ten districts in which minority  
7 voters have the opportunity to elect a candidate of  
8 their choice. The draft map includes three  
9 districts wholly within Pima County and three  
10 additional Southern Arizona districts, seventeen  
11 districts primarily within Maricopa County and nine  
12 districts primarily rural.

13 As the Chairwoman mentioned today, one of  
14 the main reasons that we're here today is we want to  
15 hear what your thoughts are on the maps, things you  
16 like and things that you may change.

17 We have asked you to fill out a request  
18 to speak form at the public hearings and provide the  
19 Commission your input.

20 Example of thoughts include any of the  
21 constitutional criteria, thoughts on the draft  
22 congressional map, and thoughts on the legislative  
23 map as well.

24 So you can submit your input by speaking  
25 at today's hearing. At the back of the packet you

1 received, there's a blue form where you can do  
2 written comments. And there's an address on it to  
3 mail it in. Another option is the phone number at  
4 the bottom. You can also call the Commission and  
5 give us any thoughts on the maps.

6           You can also visit at us  
7 [www.azredistricting.org](http://www.azredistricting.org) or call us at 602-542-5221  
8 or toll free at 855-733-7478.

9           This is just a shot of the home page of  
10 our website. Just a couple of things that we want  
11 to point out.

12           The two arrows on the left show where you  
13 can find the maps. The arrows on the right, one has  
14 meetings. So if you wanted to watch any of the  
15 meetings that covered the deliberations of how we  
16 got to the draft map, all of those are on the  
17 website and you can watch that. Also information on  
18 future meetings is on the website and you can stream  
19 most of our meetings.

20           And if we don't have Internet access at  
21 one of the locations where we're doing a public  
22 hearing, the stream is usually up within 48 hours.

23           There's also a place where you can enter  
24 -- click to do public input.

25           And then down at the bottom is the arrow

1 pointing to maps. So if you click on either of  
2 those, it will bring you to the draft maps that we  
3 have approved and that you saw today.

4 When you click -- when you click on the  
5 bottom maps area, it brings you to this screen.  
6 This is just something we wanted to point out.

7 Circled in red are the ability to get to  
8 the Google map, and this is something that many  
9 members of the public really liked because they are  
10 able to click on those and really scroll down and  
11 see what are the boundaries that make up your  
12 district.

13 So if you click on either of those, it  
14 will bring you to a page that looks like this and it  
15 will allow you to scroll in and you can get down as  
16 much as you want and show exact boundary lines,  
17 whether that road making it up or other features  
18 that make up the boundary lines.

19 Finally, we want you to stay connected.  
20 We want you to visit our website at  
21 [www.azredistricting.org](http://www.azredistricting.org).

22 Besides watching our current meetings or  
23 past meetings and getting updates on future  
24 meetings, there's the ability to draw your own maps.  
25 We have an online mapping software where you can go

1 in and draw maps and submit them to the Commission  
2 or you can follow us at Twitter at #AIRC or friend  
3 us at Facebook.

4 Thank you very much.

5 And a couple other things.

6 Again, we have both of the draft maps on  
7 the wall in the back. You have a computer screen  
8 showing the draft legislative map. We have a poster  
9 of the congressional map on the wall in the back.

10 You have the maps in your packet, both  
11 the congressional draft map and the legislative  
12 draft map. And these maps are also available on the  
13 website as well.

14 And if you have any questions, I will be  
15 here afterwards and will be more than happy to  
16 answer any questions.

17 Thank you very much.

18 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you  
19 Mr. Drechsler.

20 So we're at the point in the meeting  
21 where we take public comment, and I have a whole  
22 stack of forms, but feel free to fill one out if you  
23 haven't yet and our assistants will get us the  
24 information so you can also speak.

25 Just a few ground rules.



1           When you come up to the microphone, when  
2 your name is called, please speak directly into the  
3 microphone and get as close to it as you can so it  
4 comes over the Internet well and everyone else in  
5 here, too.

6           Please state your name and spell it for  
7 the reporter so that we get an accurate transcript.

8           And if you could also say where you live,  
9 not your home address or anything, but just a city,  
10 town, or county, that would be great.

11           We'll limit comment to four minutes per  
12 person since we have such a large amount of people  
13 that want to talk today.

14           So if the buzzer happens to go off and  
15 you're still talking, if you could try to wrap it up  
16 within a reasonable amount of time, that would be  
17 great.

18           So with that, I think we'll -- oh, and I  
19 also just wanted to say in terms of your input, if  
20 you could be as specific as possible -- if there are  
21 things that -- lines that, you know, you don't like  
22 or you think need to be changed, if you could tell  
23 us exactly what you think you think -- you don't  
24 like about that and how the lines should be moved.

25           And if you've given any thought to how

1 that impacts the rest of the map, because I think as  
2 you all know, these lines, it's a very sensitive  
3 puzzle in that if you move a line just seemingly a  
4 very small amount, but that impacts the whole map,  
5 actually. So there's a big ripple effect.

6 So to the extent you have given any  
7 thought to that, please feel free, because we would  
8 love to hear any solutions.

9 So with that, our first speaker is John  
10 Hatch, mayor from the Town of Taylor.

11 JOHN FAY HATCH: Thank you, commission.  
12 I am grateful for a this opportunity.

13 My name is John Fay Hatch. I represent  
14 today the Town of Taylor.

15 I have a letter here from the Town of  
16 Taylor that I would like to present to be entered  
17 into the record and I also have a few comments that  
18 go along with that.

19 Today I would like to talk about the  
20 congressional district, the new proposed District 6  
21 on the map.

22 This proposal removes Pinetop and  
23 Lakeside by placing it in a separate district from  
24 Show Low, even though they are contiguous and share  
25 historic goals and objectives. This is

1 unacceptable.

2           Southern Navajo and Apache County  
3 communities will be split from each other and who  
4 are now communities of common interests. We share  
5 services, goals, and objectives. These resources  
6 took years to develop but are now in jeopardy.

7           Navajo and Apache County communities are  
8 communities of common interest with each other, but  
9 the current proposal splits these communities from  
10 each other.

11           Navajo and Apache County communities are  
12 all communities of common interest with political  
13 units and government agencies, Gila Graham, and  
14 Greenlee Counties as well.

15           Navajo and Apache Counties communities  
16 are communities of common interests for the  
17 following reasons, and I have a few of these reasons  
18 that I would like to touch on today very quickly.

19           Economic.

20           We are tied together economically through  
21 Real Arizona Development Council. This is the  
22 development authority for all communities in  
23 Southern Navajo and Apache Counties. This includes  
24 nine cities and towns as well as private sector  
25 partners.

1           The collaborative for most Navajo and  
2 Apache Counties region for job development and  
3 industry attraction.

4           There's also the White Mountain  
5 partnership. This is the recognized tourism  
6 department authority for Southern Navajo and Apache  
7 Counties.

8           There's also the Workforce Investment  
9 Authority. WIA is the state-designated workforce  
10 development authority for Southern Navajo and Apache  
11 Counties, including nine cities and towns as well as  
12 private sector partners.

13           Aside from these reasons, there are also  
14 community values.

15           Traditional conservative values of strong  
16 families and strong communities as well as strong  
17 support and relief for each other, as displayed  
18 through reliance upon each other in times of  
19 disaster and crisis.

20           Some examples of this character are  
21 exemplified through recent Rodeo-Chediski forest  
22 fire, Wallow forest fire, Round Valley High School  
23 plane crash incident, flooding and relief and an  
24 equine epidemic relief and support actions, just to  
25 name a few.

1           There are several others in this category  
2 that should not be ignored. In education, Northern  
3 Pioneer College serves both Navajo and Apache  
4 Counties. Northern -- Northern Arizona Vocational  
5 Institute of Technology serves both of these areas.

6           Northern Arizona Training Center located  
7 in Taylor serves Navajo and Apache Counties,  
8 including the nine cities that will be affected by  
9 these boundaries of the new proposed District 6.

10           There's a transportation and social  
11 services, and all of these things come together to  
12 tie these communities together that stand in  
13 jeopardy of being split if these boundaries of this  
14 new proposed District 6 are approved.

15           A while back I attend the last meeting  
16 here in this building. A woman stood up and said  
17 that she did not feel that this Commission  
18 represented or was concerned about the concerns of  
19 rural Arizona. And I didn't know at that time how  
20 right she was until I viewed the boundaries of this  
21 District 6.

22           All of the concerns that I heard  
23 expressed at that meeting have been completely  
24 ignored if this district is accepted as it is drawn  
25 now.

1           In the final days and weeks of this  
2 process, I would encourage and ask this Commission  
3 to please reconsider the needs and desires of the  
4 rural communities in Navajo and Apache County.

5           These ties have taken years to develop  
6 and are in jeopardy if this process goes forward as  
7 it is now lined out.

8           I thank you for this opportunity.

9           CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

10          Our next speaker is David Tenney, Navajo  
11 County Supervisor from Navajo County.

12          DAVID TENNEY: Thank you, Madame Chair,  
13 and members of the Commission.

14          I appreciate the opportunity to speak.

15          My name is David Tenney, T-e-n-n-e-y. I  
16 live in Linden.

17          And first I would like to welcome you  
18 back to Navajo County. Glad to have you here with  
19 us again today.

20          I'm a life-long resident of the White  
21 Mountains. Currently serving as a member of the  
22 Board of supervisors, representing District 4, which  
23 is Show Low, Heber-Overgaard, Taylor, Linden, Clay  
24 Streams, Pine, all of those areas.

25          I also currently serve as the chairman of

1 our board and as the president of the State  
2 Association of Counties.

3 I want to speak mainly -- if I have any  
4 time at the end I'll touch on the congressional  
5 district, I want to speak mainly to the legislative  
6 districts, as Mr. Hatch from Taylor just did.

7 I'm here in my capacity as leader of the  
8 community to dispel the notion that Navajo County  
9 and four of our neighboring counties can be  
10 sacrificed to satisfy the political aims of  
11 communities that are far removed from us physically,  
12 socially, and economically.

13 The legislative draft map has me very  
14 concerned that the communities of Eastern Arizona  
15 only have relevance for their population and our  
16 relevant and effective voice in the state  
17 legislative process is about to be silenced.

18 The communities of Heber-Overgaard,  
19 Snowflake, Taylor, Winslow, Holbrook, Show Low, and  
20 Pinetop have far more in common with Safford,  
21 Springerville, Eagar, Payson, and White River than  
22 we do with Flagstaff, Window Rock, and Sedona.

23 Any map that puts White River and  
24 Pinetop-Lakeside in a different district than Show  
25 Low, keeps Show Low with Flagstaff needs only one

1 word to describe it, and it's the word my teenagers  
2 use on me quite often, and that word is "seriously."

3 I can't imagine that anyone could believe  
4 that Show Low has more -- is more of a community of  
5 interest with Flagstaff than with Pinetop-Lakeside.

6 If you don't believe me, I invite you to  
7 Show Low High School this Friday to see the Blue  
8 River/Show Low football game to see just what our  
9 community of interest is.

10 There will be probably 6 or 8,000 people  
11 at that game as opposed to 60 or 700 if it were to  
12 be Show Low versus Flagstaff or Coconino high  
13 schools.

14 White River, Pinetop-Lakeside, and Show  
15 Low share everything, our shopping centers, a  
16 hospital, roads, forest, and the list goes on.

17 Therefore I support the comments that  
18 Chairman Lupe, the White Mountain Apache Tribe,  
19 delivered to the body the last time you were here.

20 We need common representation so that our  
21 issues are addressed by people who are part of our  
22 community and we need our local communities to stay  
23 together.

24 Our communities are founded and  
25 maintained on ranching, farming, tourism, and



1 natural resource development.

2 Navajo, Gila, Apache, and Graham and  
3 Greenlee Counties are neighbors. We share roads,  
4 water, forest, and issues that go with that, yet  
5 these counties have been pulled apart by the draft  
6 map that has been adopted by this body.

7 The legislative map puts Greenlee County  
8 in with the Navajo and Hopi tribes. These  
9 communities have little or no interaction and are  
10 physically isolated from each other by hundreds of  
11 miles.

12 The legislative draft maps split Graham  
13 County into two different districts and does not  
14 keep Graham and Greenlee counties together. Graham  
15 and Greenlee are nearly identical in their  
16 communities of interest.

17 They both have significant agriculture,  
18 mining, and water issues and they actually cooperate  
19 with each other when providing some county services.

20 No two counties in the state are more  
21 interdependent than these two, and yet they stand to  
22 lose the best representation they have ever had in  
23 the Arizona legislature.

24 The legislative draft map splits Gila  
25 County into three LDs and Navajo County into two.

1           While this configuration may supply  
2 population numbers to other areas, it doesn't lend  
3 any credibility or confidence to the competitive  
4 voting strength of our citizens and it devastates  
5 our voice in Phoenix.

6           The distance that separates Flagstaff and  
7 our Native American neighbors to the north from the  
8 rest of the region cannot be rationally justified as  
9 a stronger community of interest or competitiveness  
10 argument when most, if not all, of the population  
11 that would satisfy the requirements for legislative  
12 district compromising Flagstaff and surrounding  
13 areas and the communities of the Navajo Nation are  
14 literally next door to each other.

15           There's only one logical split in Navajo  
16 County, and that is north/south. South with the --  
17 north/south with the Navajo and Hopi reservations to  
18 the north and the small cities and towns along I-40  
19 and the White Mountains to the south.

20           The DOJ has favorably ruled on this  
21 configuration before. And the fact that the Native  
22 American voters of the Navajo Nation have decreased  
23 in population relative to the rest of the state does  
24 not justify the proposed configurations for the  
25 communities of the White Mountains and our other

1 eastern communities.

2 In the alternative, Flagstaff and Navajo  
3 Nation have significant ties and communities of  
4 interest. Flagstaff is only 25 miles from the  
5 Navajo Nation. And according to the latest census,  
6 the population in Flagstaff is more than 10 percent  
7 Navajo already.

8 The Navajo Nation spends a significant  
9 amount of money in Flagstaff with consumer goods,  
10 services, and education, just like White River does  
11 with Pinetop and Show Low.

12 You have every reason to keep the  
13 northern communities together and the eastern  
14 communities of Pinetop-Lakeside, White River, Show  
15 Low, and the eastern counties that I have mentioned  
16 in separate legislative districts, that reflect the  
17 true representation of communities of interest,  
18 contiguous principles, and competitiveness.

19 Am I out of time?

20 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: I'm sorry, I  
21 couldn't hear you.

22 DAVID TENNEY: Am I out of time?

23 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: I didn't hear a  
24 buzzer, so you can keep going.

25 DAVID TENNEY: I don't hear very well, so

1 I don't know what that buzzer -- just let me know.  
2 I just have a few more remarks I would like to  
3 make --

4 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Go ahead.

5 DAVID TENNEY: -- concerning  
6 congressional districts.

7 First of all, I urge you to consolidate  
8 Gila County and put it all in CD 1. There are not  
9 that many people involved.

10 Second, go back to keep CD 1 rural.  
11 There are approximately 1.5 million Arizonans who  
12 choose to live in nonmetropolitan areas. That's  
13 more than 20 percent of our state population.

14 Please give the rural voters the respect  
15 and choice to elect one of their own, regardless of  
16 party.

17 The other point I would make is similarly  
18 to keep CD 4 rural. Your earlier efforts had two  
19 truly rural CDs, made many of us believe that the  
20 rural vote could actually mean something in both  
21 rural districts and it's difficult to understand  
22 what changed so suddenly.

23 Then finally, make CD 1 a real border  
24 district, not just a token one. Please remove the  
25 perceived gerrymander around Bisbee and Douglas and

1 make the representative of CD 1 accountable for the  
2 issue, if you're going to imply that their  
3 responsibility is down there.

4           That's all of my remarks on the CD, but  
5 again, I just want to encourage you to really take  
6 at look at the communities of interest for this  
7 area.

8           We work together very well for a reason,  
9 because we have the same issues. And I encourage  
10 you to look at that as you consider these maps.

11           Thank you for your time today.

12           CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

13           Our next speaker is Brad Carlyon,  
14 representing self from Show Low.

15           BRAD CARLYON: Good afternoon.

16           As was said, my name is Brad Carlyon,  
17 C-a-r-l-y-o-n.

18           My two big issues are communities of  
19 interest and competitiveness, but I also understand  
20 the Section 5 of the Voting Rights Act impacts both  
21 of those areas greatly.

22           In our northeast part of the state, we  
23 have to start with the Navajo Nation because that's  
24 going to be one of the Section 5 areas.

25           And because of the overall state

1 population growth, they don't appear to be  
2 sufficient in themselves anymore to carry a state  
3 legislative district, at least not to the level the  
4 DOJ wants.

5           While I understand why the White Mountain  
6 Apache Tribe wants to be with Southern Navajo  
7 County, I also understand why this Commission has  
8 added them to that legislative district, just to get  
9 above that 60 percent number.

10           So that does affect our communities of  
11 interest, as the prior two speakers and many  
12 following me will talk about.

13           But taking those parts out and  
14 understanding that we're probably going to have to  
15 lose the White Mountain Apache Tribe because of the  
16 DOJ and Section 5, there's other parts of Navajo  
17 County that have a strong community of interest,  
18 whose population isn't so great -- and I understand  
19 there's a trickle effect throughout the state, but  
20 it makes literally no sense to anybody who lives in  
21 this area why Show Low and Pinetop-Lakeside would be  
22 separated.

23           Those of us who live in the area, we  
24 don't see the separation. We have too much  
25 interaction, too much -- we know everybody. And

1 it's kind of hard when you say my neighbor is no  
2 longer my neighbor in the sense of a legislative  
3 district. That community is still strong here.

4 And I also understand that  
5 competitiveness is going to be strongly impacted  
6 because you have to make a certain number of your  
7 districts noncompetitive. You have to overstack  
8 them, which therefore impacts everybody else in the  
9 state, especially those who adjoin.

10 So when you create that majority district  
11 for the Native Americans, it's going to impact the  
12 competitiveness in the adjoining district.

13 Looking at your numbers that you provided  
14 this afternoon, there's a 68 percent advantage for  
15 the Republicans it appears in competitiveness.  
16 Higher than I would like. I would like to see it  
17 drop three or four percent.

18 If we add Pinetop-Lakeside, it would add  
19 maybe a percentage or two impact, it would help,  
20 depending on what you subtract out of the district.

21 I hope you will add Pinetop-Lakeside.  
22 And as you look at it, also look at putting Winslow  
23 back into the district.

24 Once again, as talked by Supervisor  
25 Tenney, Winslow has a strong community of interest

1 with all of Navajo County.

2           You know, I would like to have our sister  
3 city of St. Johns and Springerville and Eagar in  
4 with us, but you have to find a way to swoop down to  
5 get to the White Mountain and San Carlos, and that  
6 seems to be the burden that you have to carry in the  
7 maps that you have to draw.

8           But if you could bring us back Winslow,  
9 get us all of those areas off of I-40 that is in the  
10 middle of nonreservation portion of the county, that  
11 will strengthen our community of interest and also  
12 get that competitiveness for that legislative  
13 district to be truly competitive.

14           So I hope you will take those thoughts in  
15 mind. Try to keep Navajo County nonreservation  
16 portions together because we are such a strong  
17 community of interest.

18           Thank you for your time.

19           CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

20           Our next speaker is William Faurot,  
21 representing self from Navajo. And forgive me if  
22 I'm mispronouncing your name.

23           WILLIAM FAUROT: No you just one a  
24 nickel. You did it right.

25           My name is William Faurot. That's



1 F-a-u-r-o-t, and I reside in Linden.

2 The United States of America was  
3 established to represent all of the people, not some  
4 of the people. All of the people elect  
5 representatives to represent them in their beliefs.

6 Formerly, the redistricting process was  
7 carried out by the legislature. The process was  
8 partisan because not every neighbor is like the  
9 other neighbor.

10 Arizona citizens were told that if the  
11 process was done by a small committee of impartial  
12 people, that a fair and balanced result could be  
13 achieved.

14 Arizona citizens believed and voted to  
15 change the Constitution.

16 What happened is that the appointed  
17 Commission turned out to be composed of corruptible  
18 humans, after all, who failed to heed the  
19 requirements of geographically compact and  
20 contiguous districts, communities of interest, and  
21 respect for existing geographic boundaries.

22 The commissioners are five appointed  
23 humans who represent some of the people but not all  
24 of the people.

25 It is time for the people of Arizona to

1 loudly reject the proposed map which was presented,  
2 by the way, without accompanying documentation, and  
3 more importantly, change the Arizona Constitution so  
4 that all citizens are represented by their elected  
5 legislators, not by appointed bureaucrats who  
6 redistricted Arizona in a partisan manner by blatant  
7 gerrymandering.

8 Thank you for your time.

9 Who gets the copy?

10 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Our next speaker is  
11 Rich Crockett, mayor for Pinetop-Lakeside.

12 RICH CROCKETT: Thank you, Commission,  
13 for your service. We don't get thanked very often,  
14 and we want you to know that we appreciate what you  
15 do.

16 I echo the sentiments of Mayor Hatch and  
17 Chairman Tenney. On Thursday of next week I will be  
18 presenting to our council a resolution that we will  
19 be forwarding on to the committee for consideration.

20 In part, that resolution reads: In the  
21 town of Pinetop-Lakeside first preference is to be  
22 in a legislative district in a configuration as  
23 generally proposed in the October 3rd, 2011,  
24 legislative grid map what-if scenario 9 minority  
25 district option 1 version 8a as District 5, as that

1 district is, number one, consistent with the current  
2 legislative district.

3 Number two, includes the majority of the  
4 East Central Arizona communities of interest.

5 Number three, is more compact,  
6 contiguous, and grid-like.

7 And number four, in particular, includes  
8 the town of Pinetop-Lakeside with its immediately  
9 adjacent Navajo County areas along with the city of  
10 Show Low and the White Mountain Apache Tribe.

11 The town of Pinetop-Lakeside's second  
12 alternative preference, if the general  
13 configurations for Districts 6 and 7 as set forth in  
14 the approved draft map of October 9, 2011, that at a  
15 minimum, you include the town of Pinetop-Lakeside  
16 and its immediately adjacent Navajo County areas in  
17 District 6 with the city of Show Low and  
18 additionally the White Mountain Apache Tribe in  
19 council concurs.

20 The problems we see with the legislative  
21 district map that its proposed is that you have  
22 split Gila County into three legislative districts,  
23 6, 7, and 8. What is it about Gila County?

24 Does the IRC consider it a sacrifice  
25 county? You also split it in your congressional

1 districts map.

2           You put Greenlee County in with the  
3 Navajo, Hopi, and two Apache Indian reservations,  
4 with which they have little to no interaction. For  
5 example, commerce or trade.

6           They are also physically isolated from  
7 the rest of this proposed district by a long and  
8 torturous drive on Highway 191.

9           You have split Graham County in two and  
10 do not keep Graham and Greenlee Counties together,  
11 two counties which have a lot of similarities. For  
12 example, jobs, commerce, similar economic issues,  
13 mining, and agriculture.

14           They have cooperated in county services.  
15 No two counties in the state are more intertwined  
16 than these two. To separate these two counties  
17 would be wrong.

18           You have split Navajo County three ways,  
19 when there is only one logical split north and  
20 south. With the Navajo and Hopi reservations to the  
21 north and the small towns along I-40 and the White  
22 Mountains in the south.

23           Please do not split the southern part of  
24 the county yet again.

25           We appreciate what you tried to do with

1 LD 7 and to make it predominantly a Native American  
2 district, but do not just add Greenlee County with  
3 less than 10,000 population just to make the numbers  
4 work.

5 Two proposed solutions.

6 Consolidate the nonreservation portions  
7 of Gila, Graham, and Greenlee Counties into a single  
8 LD. They have a definite community of interest with  
9 their similar natural resource-based economy,  
10 mining, grazing, and agriculture.

11 The second, adjust the boundary for LD 6  
12 to, number one, drop the Gila County portion, and  
13 number two, include the remainder of the southern  
14 portion of Navajo county.

15 I thank you for your time and for being  
16 here in Navajo County today.

17 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

18 Our next speaker is Terry Hill,  
19 representing self from Shumway.

20 TERRY HILL: Thank you.

21 My name is Terry Hill. T-e-r-r-y,  
22 H-i-l-l.

23 My opinion is that the legislative  
24 district maps are an outrageous example of  
25 gerrymandering.

1           The loss of communities of interest with  
2 Pinetop-Lakeside in South Apache County going into  
3 District 7 makes no sense at all.

4           The old District 5 with the addition of  
5 Camp Verde would have made a lot more sense than  
6 what I see today with this new district.

7           Including Flagstaff in the new District 6  
8 will eliminate the rural representation in the  
9 state -- in our state legislature, as that urban  
10 population of Flagstaff will outweigh the rural  
11 population in the White Mountains.

12           And I concur with Mayor Hatch of Taylor  
13 and David Tenney, County Supervisor.

14           Thank you very much.

15           CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

16           Our next speaker is Ken Smith, from  
17 Pinetop.

18           KEN SMITH: Ken Smith, S-m-i-t-h.

19           First of all, what I want to do is  
20 compliment this Commission. I don't see how you've  
21 put up with it, but I am -- but I commend you for  
22 doing it, and I thank you for doing it. It's  
23 extraordinary what you have had to put up with  
24 during your tenure.

25           One of the things you've had to do is try

1 to balance six often contradictory principles.

2           And so as we pick a principle and say  
3 that you didn't meet that one, I suspect that we  
4 could spend the day pointing out individual examples  
5 of places where that particular principle is not  
6 being met but there are others, and they don't  
7 necessarily fit with each other, as you know better  
8 than I do.

9           One of the things I think all of us in  
10 here could agree on is that the state is in a  
11 terrible financial crisis. And I've come up with a  
12 way of saving a great deal of money. If what we are  
13 to do is to have largely uncompetitive districts,  
14 then we could just dispense with the elections  
15 because this Commission will already have decided  
16 who the winners are going to be.

17           Why go through the process of spending  
18 all of the money it takes to have an election and  
19 all of the time that it takes to have an election,  
20 when the winners are known with the districts having  
21 been selected with that in mind.

22           We also will have disenfranchised -- if  
23 you look at the congressional layout as it is now  
24 and, you know, I suspect that legislative layout is  
25 worse in this instance, but as it stands now,

1 two-thirds of the citizens of this state will have  
2 been disenfranchised because they will have been  
3 located in districts where their votes don't matter,  
4 where their votes don't count because the winner is  
5 already known before the election takes place.

6 You also will have decided that there are  
7 twice as many Republicans in this state as there are  
8 Democrats, looking at the congressional. That  
9 doesn't fit with the numbers very well.

10 This is a democracy, or supposedly so.

11 Is it a democracy if two-thirds of our  
12 votes don't count?

13 Thank you very much.

14 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

15 Our next speaker is Eric Kramer,  
16 president of White Mountain Democrats representing  
17 self from Pinetop.

18 ERIC KRAMER: Erik Kramer, E-r-i-c,  
19 K-r-a-m-e-r.

20 I want to thank the Commission for your  
21 hard work.

22 I do want to speak today in favor of  
23 competitiveness.

24 As Mr. Smith mentioned, if we don't have  
25 competitive districts, we're effectively



1 disenfranchising a large number of people in the  
2 state for a period of ten years. That would not be  
3 a good thing.

4 We need more competitiveness. We need  
5 more competitiveness in that legislative District 6.

6 As we draw the lines, I think it's fair  
7 to say that in Navajo County, there are many  
8 false-flag Democrats who infiltrate the Democratic  
9 primaries. And even the statistics you show might  
10 not make the district as competitive as it might  
11 seem to be.

12 But again, we need more competitiveness,  
13 and we thank you for your work.

14 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

15 Our next speaker is Virginia Dotson,  
16 representing self from Vernon in Apache County.

17 VIRGINIA DOTSON: My name is Virginia  
18 Dotson, D-o-t-s-o-n, from Apache County, town of  
19 Vernon.

20 First, I would like to thank the  
21 Commission. You conscientiously listen to all  
22 speakers. I know you are trying to carry out a very  
23 difficult balancing act.

24 As to the congressional districts draft  
25 map, there is some good features in what you have

1 drawn.

2           The White Mountains and Flagstaff are  
3 together in District 1. We share some common  
4 interests and concerns relating to natural  
5 resources, forest restoration, economic issues, and  
6 transportation needs that are important to Northern  
7 Arizona, and it's much preferable to have -- to be  
8 with Flagstaff. And you go over and snatch a piece  
9 of Maricopa County just to make up the population  
10 counts.

11           It's also good on the congressional  
12 districts to have Navajo and Apache Counties kept  
13 together and kept whole.

14           Statewide, I would like to see a larger  
15 number of competitive districts. When one party  
16 completely dominates a district, the voters of the  
17 other party are disenfranchised because the  
18 elections are decided in the primaries.

19           As to the legislative districts, again,  
20 statewide, I urge you to make more of the districts  
21 competitive for the same reasons that I've  
22 mentioned.

23           And the competitiveness idea needs to  
24 take actual voting patterns into consideration.

25           Thank you.

1 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

2 Our next speaker is David Berry,  
3 representing self from Apache County.

4 DAVID BERRY: David Berry, D-a-v-i-d,  
5 B-e-r-r-y.

6 Well, I couldn't possibly do that and  
7 echo the last three speakers, but I'll add my two  
8 cents for competitiveness.

9 I think it's absolutely essential that we  
10 have the most competitive districts that we can, and  
11 I'm confident that you all have moved in that  
12 direction.

13 But it I think disenfranchising is about  
14 the worst thing that could happen, and you've heard  
15 that word quite a bit here. That's probably my main  
16 fear.

17 We have a great Arizona voter  
18 registration. We have one-third GOP, one-third  
19 Independent, and one-third Democrats in this state  
20 and yet we find that we sent to Washington six  
21 Republican reps, House of Representatives and only  
22 two Democrats. And they might have changed since  
23 we've added one, but both Senators are also  
24 Republicans.

25 So I'm sure you can agree that something

1 is wrong with this picture. And I think that  
2 something is probably going to be repaired somewhat  
3 by what you are doing here.

4 And I hope you'll keep on in that  
5 direction for more fairness, for competitiveness,  
6 and more equity.

7 Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

9 Our next speaker is Rick Fernau, Mayor  
10 for the city of Show Low.

11 RICK FERNAU: Thank you.

12 Rick Fernau, mayor of Show Low. That's  
13 F, as in Frank, e-r-n-a-u.

14 And I do want to thank you all for the  
15 job you are doing. I don't feel you're corrupt.

16 And I also -- I'm sure you didn't, you  
17 didn't ask -- necessarily ask for these positions.  
18 You did not pick the membership of this committee.

19 However, when we look for  
20 representations, especially in the rural areas three  
21 from Pima and two from the state of Maricopa, it's  
22 kind of hard to feel that, you know, rural is going  
23 to get a fair shake.

24 I'm here to talk about Legislative  
25 District 5, and I basically just want to ditto the

1 comments made by Mayor Hatch of Taylor. I think he  
2 did a good job. Also Navajo County Supervisor,  
3 David Tenney. I think he hit the mark. And then  
4 also Mayor Rich Crockett of Pinetop-Lakeside.

5 We do share a lot of common interests. I  
6 think it's very unreasonable -- it's not practical  
7 to be thinking of splitting up Navajo County into  
8 three pieces.

9 The north/south option I also agree with  
10 and also I have a letter that we sent to the  
11 Commission dated July 27th asking to keep  
12 Legislative District 5 as close as possible to its  
13 existing boundary.

14 And then also the city council also  
15 passed a resolution, 16, August 2011, stating  
16 basically the same, and I'll give those to you just  
17 in case you weren't in receipt of it.

18 And I prefer -- and this is just my  
19 preference, option 1 version 8a, which was  
20 apparently a draft which you came up with on  
21 October 3rd for Legislative District 5.

22 So I'll give those three copies to you.

23 And once again, thank you for what you  
24 are doing. I know it is difficult, but I do feel  
25 that there should have been some representation from

1 rural on the committee. At least one.

2 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

3 Our next speaker is Holly Hanson,  
4 representing self, from Pinetop-Lakeside.

5 HOLLY HANSON: Holly Hanson, H-o-l-l-y,  
6 H-a-n-s-o-n.

7 I want to thank the Commission for your  
8 hours and hours of work, and especially the  
9 chairwoman, who I think has taken a lot of attacks  
10 when she's only trying to do her best, as I'm sure  
11 all of the commissioners are.

12 Although both maps which have been  
13 presented are an improvement over previous maps, I'm  
14 in favor of even a larger number of competitive  
15 districts in both the congressional districts and  
16 the legislative districts.

17 When a district is noncompetitive and is  
18 considered a Republican or Democratic district, as  
19 many as two-thirds of the people in that district  
20 are essentially disenfranchised. You've heard that  
21 word before.

22 They have no -- the people in that  
23 district then have no compelling reason to vote or  
24 keep informed on the candidates and the issues.  
25 This does not make for a strong democracy.

1           When competitiveness is being  
2 established, I urge the Commission to look at voter  
3 behavior, not just voter registration.

4           In past elections, when I have been  
5 canvassing -- I have visited many people who were  
6 registered as Democrats, yet when I spoke to them  
7 about candidates, many of them said "I couldn't vote  
8 for a Democrat" or I couldn't vote for blank, giving  
9 the name of the Democratic candidate.

10           This was always based on a single issue,  
11 not the entire array of issues.

12           So these peoples' voter registration  
13 information did not give the whole story.

14           In the legislative district, I am in  
15 favor of Flagstaff being included with the White  
16 Mountain area.

17           The White Mountains share a community of  
18 interest with Flagstaff in the -- particularly in  
19 natural resources. When I look at the fire season,  
20 infrastructure, tourism, and the Northern Arizona  
21 Council of Governments.

22           Thank you very much.

23           CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

24           Our next speaker is Barbara Smith,  
25 representing self from Pinetop.

1           BARBARA SMITH: I'm Barbara Smith, and  
2 I'll bet you don't need me to spell the last name.

3           I'm speaking on behalf of  
4 competitiveness.

5           I know that you are trying to make it as  
6 competitive as possible, and I appreciate what  
7 you've done, but I think that since -- at the moment  
8 it looks like in the congressional districts, there  
9 are only three that are actually competitive. There  
10 really should be four so that it is a little more  
11 evenly competitive.

12           And when you look at the legislative  
13 districts, it looks like the legislative districts  
14 only have one that is really competitive.

15           That isn't quite the way democracy is  
16 supposed to work. It does disenfranchise people.  
17 It gives people who are Independent less voice.  
18 Gives people who are Republicans or Democrats less  
19 voice.

20           If the Commission has decided that it is  
21 a noncompetitive district, one way or the other,  
22 then it seems that you have made the decision  
23 instead of the voters.

24           And I know you're working hard not to  
25 have that happen, and I appreciate it, but I hope



1 that you would make it more competitive.

2 Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

4 Our next speaker is Chester Crandell,  
5 representing self from Navajo County.

6 CHESTER CRANDELL: Thank you.

7 My name is Chester Crandell. I live in  
8 Heber-Overgaard, Navajo County, and I appreciate the  
9 opportunity of being able to address the Commission.

10 Here, again, like others, I appreciate  
11 what you do. It's a thankless job. It's a hard  
12 job. It's one that you're danged if you do and  
13 danged if you don't. You still -- you're caught in  
14 the middle.

15 I want to bring attention to the fact as  
16 we went through the beginning of the presentation  
17 here, there was a list of six things that the  
18 Commission had to look at in order to set the new  
19 boundaries in the way they need to be. And one of  
20 those was competitiveness.

21 But if you look at the bottom, the last  
22 one on there, F, on there, competitiveness should be  
23 used only when it did not deter or affect the other  
24 five that were there.

25 And I think throughout this whole

1 process, either through the media or through  
2 peoples' comments, that competitiveness has become the  
3 big issue. And that we tried to -- through  
4 redistricting, we tried to even out everything  
5 that's there.

6           And I'm not sure that that's true. And I  
7 don't think anyone has taken a look at how many  
8 Democrats or how many Republicans have voted for  
9 those who are in office today.

10           I would hope that whether you're a  
11 Democrat or whether you're an Independent or whether  
12 you're a Republican, you vote for people who are  
13 going to represent you the best in where you're at.

14           I think we're going to find it very  
15 difficult in using that one last bullet down there  
16 of competitiveness to be able to meet the needs of  
17 some of the perceived needs that we see that we  
18 don't have enough Democrats representing people in  
19 the state of Arizona. I'm not sure that that can be  
20 legislated and we can draw boundaries to be able to  
21 do that.

22           The other thing is that in my view, the  
23 most important thing that we need and we need to  
24 look at are communities of interest because those  
25 are the things that are going to keep people

1 together. Those are the things that are going to  
2 keep this state moving. Those are the things that  
3 are going to be able to help us to rebound  
4 economically because we can work together, we know  
5 how each of us feel, how each of us think.

6 And so if you're going to pick one thing  
7 that would determine where district boundaries  
8 should be, whether it be legislative or whether it  
9 be congressional, it should be aligning those people  
10 who have common interests and common goals to get  
11 where they want to go.

12 Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

14 Our next speaker is Sheryl Eaton,  
15 representing self from Lakeside.

16 SHERYL EATON: I'm Sheryl Eaton,  
17 S-h-e-r-y-l, E-a-t-o-n, from outside of Lakeside and  
18 the county.

19 And I do like the makeup of this  
20 Commission because it is not based on an already  
21 gerrymandered legislature making up boundaries, and  
22 I really appreciate it and I am grateful for you.

23 I am still emphasizing competitiveness.  
24 I think if in this state there's a third and a third  
25 and a third, approximately of Republicans,

1 Democrats, and Independents, then the districts  
2 should reflect that, as best as possible and as --  
3 from what I've heard of the congressional ones that  
4 are proposed, it's like four to two  
5 Republican/Democrat and then three competitive. I  
6 would like to see at least three, three, three, or  
7 as Barbara Smith suggested, two, two, four.

8 I'm not overly up on the legislative  
9 maps, but I do think that we have interests with  
10 Flagstaff. I can't really tell from these maps -- I  
11 can't see where Pinetop-Lakeside is exactly, but I  
12 do think that our area has interests with Flagstaff  
13 and other parts of Coconino County. So District 6  
14 looks okay to me.

15 And I just really -- since I came to  
16 Arizona in 1975, I've often felt sort of the  
17 state-level disenfranchised. You know, I vote and I  
18 knew all the time, well, my guy -- my woman isn't  
19 going to win. So I favor competition.

20 Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

22 Our next speaker is Bobbi Peterson,  
23 president White Mountain Conservatives from Pinetop.

24 ROBERT PETERSON: It's Roberta, I go by  
25 Bobbi, B-o-b-b-i, P-e-t-e-r-s-o-n.

1           It's so interesting -- I'm sitting there  
2 and all the Democrats behind me have talked about  
3 competitiveness, and I have to address that, as  
4 Mr. Crandell did.

5           I think if the message gets out, and I  
6 think it does in Arizona, I think the voters are  
7 voting for the message that resonates with them.

8           And I'm sorry if your message is not  
9 resonating with most of the voters, but you cannot  
10 gerrymander this state in order to -- in order to  
11 make your message come out better than it is.

12           Concerning the congressional draft, it's  
13 way too big. I can't believe nobody has said that  
14 so far.

15           Congressional District 1, as we've had  
16 it, is way too big and now you've increased it and  
17 it goes all the way from Utah to Mexico and then  
18 almost all the way to the western border of our  
19 state.

20           This would be a disaster because our  
21 congressperson now cannot seem to get to his  
22 constituents like we would have him do.

23           He's been criticized for not visiting --  
24 well, how do you visit a district that size?

25           And it was pointed out this morning in

1 Eagar that the staff and so forth for such a huge  
2 district and the cost of it legislatively and  
3 congressionally is the same as you've got a very  
4 small geographic district in Maricopa. It just  
5 doesn't make sense to have such a huge district.

6 And we have no commonality with  
7 Flagstaff. I lived in Flagstaff for 19 years and  
8 then moved to Pinetop 6 years ago and have been here  
9 6 years. And there are so many differences.

10 No, I don't think we should be in the  
11 same -- with Flagstaff at all.

12 And I do think that the idea of making  
13 Arizona a blue state by gerrymandering is what's --  
14 what we're seeing right now, the effort to do that.

15 And the idea that no one on this  
16 Commission is rural is important.

17 And it is important to reveal the reasons  
18 for combining the Native Americans.

19 At lunch today I spoke with a good Apache  
20 friend who told me she doesn't understand why we're  
21 trying to play the race card and pit the Native  
22 Americans against the whites, but that's the way it  
23 seemed to her and that's the way it seems to me.

24 Also, you may not be aware, but  
25 Pinetop-Lakeside, Wagon Wheel, Show Low, they run

1 into each other. It's not like you can separate  
2 them easily. You don't know when you're in Lakeside  
3 going from Pinetop, you don't know when you're in  
4 Show Low. These have a common interest and they  
5 should have.

6           Concerning the legislative district map,  
7 I don't think Apache County has anything of common  
8 interests with Mohave County on the other side of  
9 the state. I think this is a disaster, this  
10 District 7. It's way too big.

11           And the comments have been made about the  
12 common interests are the most important  
13 consideration.

14           The White Mountains have so much common  
15 interests in Southern Apache and in Southern Navajo,  
16 we need to really back what these mayors have said  
17 and so forth.

18           So I urge you to not worry about the  
19 competitiveness because it's -- whatever is the best  
20 message or the people will prevail.

21           And I am sorry if I'm in the majority or  
22 I'm in the minority or whatever, we just have to  
23 work to get the message out and then back what the  
24 citizens say.

25           CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Our next speaker is

1 Dixie Dana, representing self from Snowflake.

2 DIXIE DANA: My name is Dixie Dana. I'm  
3 from Snowflake, Navajo, Arizona.

4 And I didn't know when I signed the  
5 yellow paper that I would be up here in front of  
6 everybody. I should have signed the blue one, but  
7 as long as I'm here, I've heard everybody talking  
8 against the new proposal. I haven't heard one  
9 person agree with it.

10 And also I heard about Google, Internet,  
11 and all of this kind of media. Why was not the  
12 local newspapers advertised about these meetings  
13 like the Silver Creek, the Independent?

14 And I agree with most everything that's  
15 been said today.

16 Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

18 Our next speaker is Harvey Akeson,  
19 representing self from Pima.

20 HARVEY AKESON: Harvey Akeson,  
21 A-k-e-s-o-n.

22 And, yeah, I live in Pima County.  
23 Registered to vote there, but I have a second home  
24 up here in Apache County.

25 Madame Chairman and members of the



1 Commission, I want to thank you for your work. I  
2 know it's not easy, that problems come up, but I  
3 want to talk about just one thing, the congressional  
4 maps.

5 On the congressional maps, if you do  
6 decide to change some of them, picture not who is in  
7 congress now, but who would be representing the  
8 congressional district.

9 Is that person going to seek a position  
10 on the Interior Affairs Committee, the Military  
11 Committee, or what committee is the common interests  
12 of that district?

13 Are we going to put the Yuma military  
14 into Tucson Dairs-Monthan military and Fort  
15 Huachuca? Are we going to have Bureau of Land  
16 Management areas together as areas of common  
17 interests?

18 The congressional district should  
19 represent somewhat what the congressional district  
20 will seek out in congress so that the common  
21 interest is the thing that are in the district.

22 And I hope you look at that, and I thank  
23 you for all of your hard work.

24 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

25 Our next speaker is Lynne Breyer,

1 representing self from Navajo.

2           LYNNE BREYER: My name is Lynne Breyer,  
3 L-y-n-n-e, B-r-e-y-e-r.

4           I hate to read this, but it's so long and  
5 I'm afraid I'll get rang, but I'm going to read it  
6 any way.

7           First I would like to thank you, sir, for  
8 the beginning presentation where you showed the  
9 language of Prop 106 because I personally feel that  
10 has been totally ignored. So I'm glad to see that  
11 that was up there and perhaps some of the people in  
12 this room will take note of that.

13           I want to speak on several issues.

14           First, I want to speak on geographic  
15 compactness.

16           I want to tell that you District 1 is  
17 shaped like a backwards C, not compact. So -- and  
18 at this time I think because it allows more  
19 Democrats to be packed into this district.

20           I spent my time between -- I split my  
21 time between Scottsdale and Pinetop. So I have an  
22 interest in District 1 as well as where I live in  
23 Scottsdale.

24           And District 1 is gerrymandered all over  
25 the place. There is no possible way that one

1 representative can properly represent District 1 as  
2 it's now drawn, with urban areas that have  
3 completely different needs and interests and with --  
4 than rural areas.

5 So how can one representative, number  
6 one, get around to this entire district?

7 And number two, how can they represent  
8 people who have such different interests?

9 They can't do it. So you have  
10 essentially given District 1 an opportunity to have  
11 no representation for at least half or more of the  
12 people. I don't think that's what Prop 106 was  
13 designed to do.

14 It was passed in 2000 by people with a  
15 spirit of optimism that this process was going to be  
16 improved over time. And, in fact, this is the worst  
17 I can remember in the 28 years I've lived here.

18 So I hope this is not the final map  
19 because it doesn't work.

20 District 2 divides Cochise County and  
21 bumps along the southern border where a majority of  
22 Democrats are registered. There's no reason to  
23 divide Cochise County. It's a small county. It has  
24 a common interest with Santa Cruz County and it  
25 should not be put into -- any part of that should

1 not be put into District 1 and it should have its  
2 own district.

3           District 3 rambles east and west and  
4 north and south and all over the place and picks up  
5 part of Maricopa County. That's not compact. Come  
6 on, guys.

7           District 9 snakes all the way from Tempe  
8 all the way up to North Phoenix. I understand that  
9 that was done to make sure that -- it was a gift to  
10 Mr. Schapira, who I believe appointed you,  
11 Ms. McNulty, and I don't think that that is  
12 appropriate.

13           District 4 includes the river areas and  
14 the northwest corner of the state and then it goes  
15 down south. Well, that's great, that works, except  
16 that then it shoots across the state and picks up,  
17 for Pete's sake, Fountain Hills. Fountain Hills and  
18 San Tan Valley do not belong with the north quarter  
19 of the state. It just doesn't happen. That's not  
20 compact.

21           So I don't see very many districts that  
22 meet the criteria for compactness.

23           D, communities of interest. It's the  
24 same story. You failed in Flagstaff. Flagstaff has  
25 nothing in common with the rural communities in

1 District 1. We've already covered that. I think  
2 you should know that. I think you knew that when  
3 you were drawing the maps.

4 Most of this district will not be  
5 represented either. Flagstaff is not going to get  
6 representation if the rural areas do.

7 So that -- and the people in Flagstaff  
8 don't -- they don't want to be in a rural area.  
9 They don't have anything in common then there. They  
10 just don't want it. And you guys need to listen to  
11 somebody other than the mayor of Flagstaff because  
12 people count.

13 All right. I'm going to observe that  
14 buzzer but I'm going to go ahead and say this at the  
15 end.

16 Paragraph 15 of the Prop 106 says: Party  
17 registration and voting history data shall be  
18 excluded from the initial phase of the mapping  
19 process but may be used to test maps for compliance  
20 with the above goals. That's A through F. All of  
21 those goals.

22 And incumbents -- the residence of  
23 incumbents and candidates shall not be identified or  
24 considered.

25 But that was ignored as well.

1           And I just want to say one other thing.

2           If this map stands, I cannot imagine that  
3 the people of Arizona are going to sit tight and let  
4 this happen to all of us who vote.

5           Democrats represent 30 percent of the  
6 registrations, Republicans represent 36 percent of  
7 the registrations, and the balance is Independents  
8 and P and Ds.

9           So the fact that you have not been  
10 competitive with CD 1, which was competitive and now  
11 is not. We'll never get another competitive race  
12 going in Congressional District 1. Maybe not in  
13 some of the other districts either.

14           So I would appreciate it if you guys  
15 would go back and look at what you have done here  
16 and think about the people, the people of Arizona  
17 who vote. That's what you should be interested in.

18           Thank you.

19           CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

20           Our next speaker is Richard Breyer,  
21 representing self from Navajo.

22           RICHARD BREYER: My name is Richard  
23 Breyer. Last name is B-r-e-y-e-r.

24           I would like to address what the  
25 Commission has done in three different areas.

1           One, competitiveness -- excuse me,  
2 compact and -- compact and contiguous, community of  
3 interest, and also the independent nature --  
4 supposedly independent nature of the committee.

5           First of all, Commissioner McNulty, as my  
6 wife already alluded to, was appointed by District  
7 9, Senator Schapira and has drawn the map to his  
8 benefit.

9           Secondly, Gold Canyon, Apache Junction,  
10 Florence, San Tan Valley share with Yuma and  
11 Colorado City. Not what I would consider compact  
12 and contiguous.

13           Large areas of Mesa on the map are  
14 zig-zagged through Tempe and east -- North Phoenix,  
15 Maricopa, Eloy, Casa Grande and then put in with the  
16 Four Corners. Flagstaff district goes all the way  
17 to the Mexican border.

18           I don't think Salvador Dali could have  
19 put together a more bizarre configuration of  
20 districts. I'm surprised we haven't put in parts of  
21 San Francisco in this.

22           In my opinion, the Commission is an alter  
23 ego of the Democratic party. And I believe,  
24 Ms. Mathis, if she considers herself to be an  
25 Independent, then would say also Barney Frank and

1 Chuck Schwimmer could fall into that category also.

2 Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

4 Our next speaker is Ann Yarmal,  
5 representing self from Show Low.

6 ANN YARMAL: Ann Yarmal, Y-a-r-m-a-l.

7 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Can you speak into  
8 the mic?

9 ANN YARMAL: In today's Arizona Republic,  
10 it was noted that in a recent Gallup Poll, Arizona  
11 was listed as the most evenly split state in the  
12 nation in terms of partisan loyalties.

13 I wish to support efforts to establish  
14 the legislative districts that truly reflect equal  
15 partisan representation.

16 Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

18 Our next speaker is Eli Blake,  
19 representing self from Navajo.

20 ELI BLAKE: E-l-i, B-l-a-k-e.

21 This morning I went to my first ever  
22 meeting of this group in Eagar and I decided to come  
23 back.

24 I had a little bit of an insight, but  
25 just to show how this works, I actually think



1 there's a gentleman over here who had a much better  
2 idea in terms of both the concern I raised in the  
3 I-40 communities and being able to include Winslow  
4 and possibly also Pinetop-Lakeside, which is not to  
5 split up Gila County so many ways.

6           Why does District 6 need to have a  
7 thumbprint in Gila County?

8           That's the main thing I wanted to say.

9           The other thing I wanted to address was  
10 competitiveness.

11           State Representative Crandell suggested  
12 when he spoke that the idea of competitiveness being  
13 listed number six on the list meant it should be  
14 deemphasized.

15           When you make a shopping list, you have  
16 to put something first and you have to put something  
17 last.

18           I think the first two on the list are  
19 federally mandated. I don't know of any place where  
20 it says that the others need to be put in any  
21 particular order or not. Just when you make a list,  
22 it has to be in some order in particular.

23           The last thing I would like to mention,  
24 and I really do want to emphasize this.

25           I've heard a lot of comments that I don't

1 really feel are very polite. And when I first moved  
2 into Navajo County, into Joseph City quite a few  
3 years ago, it had just rained five inches very  
4 recently. A lot of people were flooded out of their  
5 homes.

6 Nobody knew us and a whole lot of people  
7 showed up to help us move in. That's the kind of  
8 people we have in Navajo County. And we've heard a  
9 lot of accusatory and angry remarks and very rude  
10 remarks. And I don't want the commissioners to feel  
11 that that's the kind of people we have, because we  
12 don't. We have some wonderful people here.

13 Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

15 Our next speaker is Dara Vanesian --  
16 sorry if I mispronouncing -- representing  
17 Pinetop-Lakeside -- oh, from the town council.

18 DARA VANESIAN: Representing myself, but  
19 yes.

20 And it's D-a-r-a, Vanesian,  
21 V-a-n-e-s-i-a-n.

22 Ladies and gentlemen, my name is Dara  
23 Vanesian, and I am a Pinetop-Lakeside town council  
24 member.

25 As you drove through this beautiful

1 venue, you probably came through Show Low to get  
2 here. You had to notice these communities are  
3 contiguous. And despite their football rivalry,  
4 they have one community of interest.

5           The White Mountain Apache,  
6 Pinetop-Lakeside, Round Valley, Heber-Overgaard,  
7 Snowflake, Taylor, and Show Low are inextricably  
8 tied together in the tourism industry. Their  
9 economies are dependent upon one another.

10           The Apache resort we're in today is a  
11 member of the Pinetop-Lakeside Marketing  
12 Organization. The chambers of commerce of these  
13 towns cooperate on only a single paired gift  
14 certificate program.

15           Those communities plus Holbrook, Winslow,  
16 St. Johns have formed REAL Arizona to develop  
17 job-based -- develop base jobs anywhere among them.

18           Yet the legislative map currently in  
19 place has separated Pinetop-Lakeside and Show Low  
20 into different districts.

21           Show Low's new district formed suddenly  
22 over the weekend of October 1st, is almost exactly  
23 the same salamander shape as the 1812 Massachusetts'  
24 district that inspired the name gerrymandering.

25           Clearly it was drawn upon only to create

1 certain voting preferences, which we believe are  
2 unfair to this area and designated to give certain  
3 political parties and other groups a competitive  
4 advantage.

5           Former U.S. Attorney Dennis Burke wrote  
6 in the Arizona Republic this summer that when he  
7 drafted the initiative that created your Commission,  
8 competitive districts were the last thing on his  
9 behind.

10           He said that after complying with one  
11 man, one vote and the Department of Justice  
12 requirements regarding minorities, communities of  
13 interest should rank first among districting  
14 concerns.

15           In the eastern state -- east part of the  
16 state have a rural community of interest and have  
17 been perfectly happy with the representation in the  
18 house and the senate.

19           We have districts that needed minimal  
20 tinkering to get the required population for new  
21 districts, and yet suddenly we are being carved up  
22 into four new districts.

23           I urge you to consider our community of  
24 interest and rethink this legislative map.

25           Thank you for your time and

1 consideration.

2 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

3 Our next speaker is Judy Gurley  
4 representing self from Apache.

5 JUDY GURLEY: Judy, J-u-d-y, Gurley,  
6 G-u-r-l-e-y.

7 And I want to thank you for the  
8 opportunity to speak today.

9 I feel like this may be the last time my  
10 voice will be heard.

11 We see in this map that I have before me  
12 is -- goes into effect, I will have a minority  
13 voice.

14 I think that you people that are sitting  
15 there are patriots and you care about this country.  
16 You care. The decisions has been for the people who  
17 live here. Otherwise, you wouldn't be sitting  
18 there. Am I right?

19 I'm sixty -- I'll be 66 years old this  
20 coming month and I can stand here before you and  
21 tell you I have never missed an election. I have  
22 always voted. And even when the East Coast was  
23 telling us who won, I still voted for my candidate.

24 This is America. Every single individual  
25 in this country counts. Everybody gets one vote and

1 those votes should be equal.

2 Now, if I sound a little upset, it's  
3 because the largest district in the state on this  
4 map is District 7, and I'm in District 7. And the  
5 highest population, 273,582 Hispanics are voters --  
6 registered voters in this district with 130,155  
7 whites. I'm part of that rural voice that this map  
8 ignores.

9 I would not even have known about this  
10 meeting today except that I was at a neighborhood  
11 function yesterday and I learned about it. And I  
12 cannot express to you the hopelessness that people  
13 feel.

14 I do want to thank you for all of your  
15 work. I know you can't make everyone happy, but I  
16 remember something being said about as the districts  
17 are being drawn up -- am I correct, that they were  
18 drawn up so that minorities would have a voice? Do  
19 I remember saying that -- or hearing that?

20 So I ask you to reconsider and I also  
21 would like to say that I agree with most everything  
22 that has been said by our mayors, by our community.  
23 I feel like I'm a citizen of the White Mountains. I  
24 shop in Show Low, Pinetop-Lakeside, Springerville.

25 I've got friends everywhere, and I have

1 concerns about all of them, not just the ones who  
2 are neighbors out there in rural Apache County.  
3 There's a lot of really good people up here who  
4 care, and I would like to see everybody's vote  
5 count.

6 I'll still vote, but if it doesn't count  
7 for anything, it's not going to be on me.

8 Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

10 Our next speaker is Jill Skaufel,  
11 representing self from Apache.

12 JILL SKAUFEL: That's Jill, J-i-l-l,  
13 Skaufel, S-k-a-u-f, as in Frank, e-l.

14 I am from the Concho of Apache County. I  
15 want to go on the record that I agree wholeheartedly  
16 with Mayor Hatch, Chairman Tenney, Terry Hill,  
17 Chester Crandell, Bobbi Peterson, and Lynne Breyer.

18 Please do not separate the towns of St.  
19 Johns, Concho, Vernon, and Eagar from the Show Low,  
20 Taylor, Snowflake towns with whom we share community  
21 interests.

22 I'm in agreement with the north/south  
23 option, and I want to ask the question how a  
24 candidate is going to run a campaign in Legislative  
25 District 7? It's huge.

1           The last time I looked in the dictionary,  
2 I believe the word "compact" meant small.

3           Thank you.

4           CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

5           And this is my last request to speak  
6 form, just so everyone knows. So if I missed anyone  
7 or if you would like to fill out a request to speak  
8 form, please do so.

9           The next speaker is Lowry Flake,  
10 representing self from Snowflake.

11           Is it Lowry?

12           LOWRY FLAKE: Correct. Lowry, L-o-w-r-y,  
13 no e, Flake.

14           Madame Chairman and members of the  
15 Commission, I appreciate very much the opportunity  
16 to participate in this important process, and I  
17 support what has been said by Chairman Tenney and  
18 Mayor Hatch. It's good to see that at least two of  
19 my students have turned out so well.

20           I am deeply offended by the idea of  
21 hyphenated Americans.

22           I don't know who did it. I don't know  
23 why they did it, but I am deeply offended.

24           I am an American. I was born an  
25 American. I plan, partisanship notwithstanding, to



1 die an American.

2 My great-grandfather came to this country  
3 in 1878. The last I checked, that was long before  
4 Arizona was a state.

5 We are involved in a very important  
6 process. As a fourth-generation American, I support  
7 the work ethic and personal compassion and charity  
8 over the cradle-to-death welfare state.

9 I support thrift and self-control over  
10 debt.

11 I support honesty, integrity, and  
12 personal honor over greed, corruption, and political  
13 advantage.

14 I support stewardship and the wise use of  
15 our God-given natural resources over the religion of  
16 radical environmentalism.

17 I support the traditional timeline and  
18 Judeo-Christian values over humanism and relativism.

19 I support life over the culture of death.

20 Again, I am an American. I strongly  
21 support communities of interest as a means of  
22 strengthening the traditional family, preserving our  
23 inalienable rights under the rule of law and  
24 ensuring that every life in our state and nation has  
25 the opportunity to be lived under the United States

1 Constitution.

2 Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: I received one more  
4 request to speak form.

5 Naomi White, from Navajo Nation Human  
6 Rights Commission.

7 NAOMI WHITE: Good afternoon, Madame  
8 Chair and commissioners.

9 Thank you for listening to the Navajo  
10 Nation Human Rights Commission and also thank you to  
11 the communities of Pinetop-Lakeside for having us  
12 here as well as Show Low and the surrounding  
13 communities.

14 I would just like to speak to a few  
15 points.

16 Everybody spoke about federal  
17 requirements of equal population and also the Voting  
18 Rights Act.

19 And as you know, that's something that  
20 the Navajo Nation Human Right Commission strongly  
21 advocates compliance with, especially in regard to  
22 the Native American voting-age population, we would  
23 still like it to remain at least at 62 percent  
24 within the legislative district and also at  
25 20.5 percent within the congressional district.

1           And however the maps are drawn to  
2 accommodate the population, that's primarily what  
3 your job is. And we thank you and support you and  
4 the difficulty of your job.

5           Also I would like to speak to the  
6 requirement of compactness.

7           Most people don't know that compactness  
8 does not mean in terms of geography, that the  
9 districts must be compact. It actually means in  
10 terms of population, that the districts have to  
11 remain equal. So I would just like to clarify that  
12 point.

13           Also, the Navajo Nation Human Rights  
14 Commission and the Navajo Nation agrees that  
15 communities of interest are a primary concern among  
16 the voters and also their primary interests among  
17 our commission as well.

18           We've heard several people speak about  
19 rural communities. And as you know, you visited  
20 Window Rock yesterday and that is one of our largest  
21 cities within the Navajo Nation. And if we want to  
22 talk about ruralness, then we invite you to come out  
23 to the very rural parts of the Navajo Nation where  
24 there is one house per five square miles and people  
25 reside in places that don't have electricity or

1 running water or paved roads and there's multiple  
2 livestock about.

3 And those infrastructure interests are  
4 presumably a lot alike in what others are calling  
5 rural communities.

6 We also have natural resource concerns.  
7 We also have infrastructure concerns, concerns with  
8 water. And how we address those is -- we would not  
9 like to take an adversarial position, but within the  
10 same district, we're faced -- and we're faced with  
11 the possibility and the likelihood of having to  
12 address those issues to one representative.

13 And with that, we would all, I'm sure,  
14 like a representative that's fair and balanced as  
15 the competing interest that one another has in  
16 regard to geographical areas, and that just remains  
17 to be seen.

18 However, we would just like to request  
19 that this Commission continue to adhere to the  
20 federal requirements as well as the state  
21 requirements with regard to Voting Rights Act, the  
22 U.S. Constitution and also the Arizona Constitution.

23 Thank you very much.

24 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

25 Well, I think that concludes public

1 comment, unless there's anybody else who would like  
2 to address the Commission.

3 Okay. Seeing -- hearing none, I will ask  
4 my fellow commissioners if they would like to say  
5 anything.

6 I'll ask my fellow commissioners if they  
7 would like to say anything. I think I gave Vice  
8 Chair Freeman the floor first this morning in Eagar,  
9 so I'll switch out to Commissioner McNulty.

10 COMMISSIONER MCNULTY: Thank you.

11 Thank you all for coming this afternoon  
12 and spending a Saturday with us.

13 This is a very complicated and difficult  
14 but important process. We have a number of criteria  
15 that we need to satisfy.

16 And as folks have said, some of them are  
17 in conflict with one another. A good example of  
18 that, I think, is the effort that we're engaged in  
19 to really focus on creating rural districts but at  
20 the same time because of the way ruralness is, that  
21 involves creating districts that cover a large area  
22 territory.

23 So on the one hand, unless we tie the  
24 rural district into the urban area, the rural  
25 districts are going to be fairly large. And I think

1 that's a balance that we're trying to achieve. So  
2 we appreciate your comments about that.

3 And we hope you continue to follow the  
4 process and give us your input.

5 Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

7 Vice Chair Freeman.

8 VICE CHAIR FREEMAN: Thanks everyone for  
9 coming out today and speaking with us. This is a  
10 special part of the state for me.

11 I was born and raised in Phoenix. I  
12 drove up this morning to Eagar for our hearing  
13 earlier today. It's one of the most beautiful  
14 drives in the state.

15 I saw a large herd of antelope north of  
16 260. And why is it -- I asked myself, why is it I  
17 always see the wildlife when I'm lacking a hunting  
18 tag. I come up here a lot to hunt.

19 After our hearing this morning, I drove  
20 up on US60 towards Show Low on the Verde McNary  
21 Road, down through the forest just to experience the  
22 forest a little bit.

23 It's a part of the state I really like.  
24 I spent a lot of time in.

25 I've been coming up to this part of the

1 state since the late '60s when I was a small boy and  
2 my folks had a place up here.

3 And, yes, I remember when Pinetop was  
4 Pinetop and Lakeside was Lakeside and Show Low was  
5 Show Low. Now they all run together.

6 I remember when if you were stuck in the  
7 snow on a dirt road, and a lot of them were dirt  
8 roads, you were stuck in the snow.

9 I say that not to pretend that I know  
10 your communities like you do. I could never hope to  
11 do that, but what I want you to know is a lot of  
12 what was said does resonate with me because of the  
13 long time I have spent up here.

14 And I do hope that -- the Commission has  
15 put out two draft maps and the commissioners have  
16 all said one way or the other that these are drafts  
17 that are being put out so the public has something  
18 to comment on.

19 And after this comment period, the  
20 Commission is going to go back to work and I really  
21 hope the Commission focuses in on the communities of  
22 interest because there are some aspects of where the  
23 lines have been drawn up here that we've heard some  
24 comments about it, that perhaps need to be looked at  
25 to see if adjustments are appropriate and to look at

1 how the counties are treated up here in Eastern  
2 Arizona.

3           And I do hope all of the commissioners do  
4 that, take all of the public comments into  
5 consideration and all of the public comment and  
6 apply the constitutional criteria and we'll get some  
7 fair maps that we can go to a vote on as our final  
8 maps for the next ten years.

9           Thank you again for coming today.

10           CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

11           And I also thank all of you for  
12 participating in the process. The only way that we  
13 can make these maps better is by hearing from the  
14 public throughout the state, and you're part and  
15 parcel of that. And we really appreciate it and we  
16 appreciate your input in the first round of  
17 hearings, too. We had great deal turnout then.

18           I also see some faces in the crowd from  
19 Eagar group this morning. Thank you all for making  
20 the trek and following us to this afternoon meeting.

21           And we're going to have another meeting  
22 on Monday, for anybody who would like to go to that.  
23 We've got Tuba City at 9 a.m., Mountain Standard  
24 Time in the morning, and then in the evening we'll  
25 be in the Prescott Valley Public Library.



1           So you're welcome to join us. And if you  
2 don't want to drive that far, you can always follow  
3 us on the Internet.

4           You should be able to -- not always does  
5 it work, but we try to stream every meeting that we  
6 can over the Internet so that people can watch the  
7 process from home.

8           We don't always have the capability and  
9 bandwidth to be able to do that, but we strive for  
10 that. So hopefully it will work on Monday from Tuba  
11 City and then Prescott.

12           So with that, there's only one thing left  
13 on the agenda and that's adjournment.

14           So at 4:52 p.m., I declare this hearing  
15 adjourned.

16           Thank you.

17           (The meeting adjourned at 4:52 p.m.)  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

I, MICHELLE D. ELAM, Certified Reporter  
No. 50637 for the State of Arizona, do hereby  
certify that the foregoing 81 printed pages  
constitute a full, true, and accurate transcript of  
the proceedings had in the foregoing matter, all  
done to the best of my skill and ability.

WITNESS my hand this 27th day of October,  
2011.

---

MICHELLE D. ELAM  
Certified Reporter  
Certificate No. 50637